

2008 HPC meetings

January 14	minutes
January 28	minutes more information
February 11	minutes
February 14	meeting notice
March 17	minutes
April 14	minutes
May 19	minutes
June 16	minutes
July 14	minutes
August 11	minutes
September 15 Joint meeting with CPC	minutes Goll Mansion COA City Attorney opinion
September 29	minutes
October 13	minutes
November 10	minutes
December 15	minutes



**MINUTES AS CORRECTED
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, January 14, 2008, 3:00 PM
City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-A**

**Tim Stemper, Chair
Pat Balon, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown**

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Tim Stemper called the meeting to order at 3:07 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Tim Stemper

Commissioners Absent: None

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES

A. Approval of the November 12, 2007 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes (there was a lack of quorum for approval in December)

Sandra McSweeney made a correction to page 3 (paragraph 10) and deleted her name as seconding the motion made by Ald. Bauman. There was a brief discussion over the format for the motion on page 5 (last paragraph) but the commissioners decided to leave it as is.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the Minutes of the November 12, 2007 meeting as corrected. The motion carried

B. Approval of the December 10, 2007 Historic Preservation Commission minutes

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the December 10, 2007 minutes. The motion carried with Pat Balon abstaining since she had not attended the meeting.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

Tim Stemper asked commission members if they would agree to move up agenda item 6C since the owners for Agenda item 6A were not present. The commissioners agreed.

6C. Demolition of the former U.S. Coast Guard Station, 1600 N. Lincoln Memorial Drive. Applicant: Milwaukee County Dept. of Public Works. PTS#48113

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the current state of the Coast Guard Station. The request for demolition appeared to meet criterion H-6 of the ordinance and criterion J-4 of the preservation guidelines that would allow demolition because it was not economically feasible to repair the building.

Milwaukee County representatives Kevin Haley (landscape architect) and Julie Bastin (engineering and architecture) were recognized.

In response to questions from Matt Jarosz and Pat Balon, Kevin Haley indicated that it will cost \$80,000 to demolish the Coast Guard Station and regrade the site. The rebuilding of the sea wall would be an additional amount. The bridge would be removed and rebuilt and the abutments would look like the sea wall east of the Calatrava.

There followed discussion about the open-air pavilion to be built on the site, its exact location, and if historic designation review extended to that building, and where would parking go.

In answer to questions by Matt Jarosz, Kevin Haley stated that no one got back to the County with a proposal to fund the restoration/reuse of the building. Staff Carlen Hatala indicated that as part of mitigation for the demolition, the State Historic Preservation Office could require that an exhibit on the Coast Guard Station be prepared in addition to documenting the building.

The chair recognized persons wanting to speak on the matter.

Bill Kolberg stated that he writes for the East Side News (and he distributed copies) and has lived in Milwaukee for most of 54 years and mostly on the East Side. He questioned why the Coast Guard Station needed to come down and gave a blessing to the commissioners.

Pat Balon suggested that any motion to allow demolition should be conditioned on the County preparing a permanent exhibit commemorating the Coast Guard Station. Staff Paul Jakubovich suggested that some of the timbers viewed in the building could be salvaged and used in the pavilion or exhibit. Matt Jarosz indicated that salvaging the materials had to be specified in the RFP for the demolition or else contractors would not take the time to salvage items.

Ald. Bauman stated that he thought the case was made for demolition but was not sure a pavilion would do justice to the site. He wanted to see something that would capture some of the style of the Coast Guard Station and was concerned that something low cost and generic would be built. He indicated that requesting to see plans of the pavilion first before allowing demolition would be the only leverage available to ensure a good design.

Parks Director Sue Black was recognized. She expressed concern that a delay by the commission would impact the timetable the County had established. She indicated that the new pavilion was budgeted for \$310,000 and that the design would depend on their fundraising efforts that would augment the budget. They wanted construction done in July. She stated that it was a courtesy to come before the commission and that the County would look into jurisdiction and the County could possibly just move ahead on their own with the demolition. No demolition would begin before February 25th.

County Supervisor Broderick was recognized. He indicated that no one would know what materials could be salvaged until the demolition is underway. He stated that he lost the battle to save the building but wanted to see it commemorated and that the County Parks should treat this with sensitivity.

Ald. Bauman was skeptical that a low-cost bidder would do salvaging and would not be a Pieter Godfrey [noted historic salvage contractor in Milwaukee].

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to hold the item over for one cycle until the Historic Preservation Commission could see the plan for the pavilion that would be built on the site. The motion carried unanimously.

Parks Director Sue Black questioned the motion and indicated that she would have to go back to the full County Board over the delay. Staff Carlen Hatala suggested that the HPC could hold a special meeting to expedite the process if the plans for the pavilion were submitted before the next HPC meeting. The commissioners were all in agreement. In response to a question by Ms. Black, the

commissioners told her that she could go ahead with advertising bids for the demolition. Pat Balon added that the RFP should require salvaging materials.

6A. New 3-car frame garage at 2036 N. 2nd Street (Brewers Hill Historic District) Applicant: Benjamin and Maureen Lawrenz. PTS#48185

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project. The design is part of the Preservation Portfolio.

Ald. Bauman said the project would be expensive and asked if the owners were agreeable to doing the large garage. Staff Paul Jakubovich responded that they were.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to approve the project. The motion carried unanimously.

6B. Exterior rehab of 928 E. Brady Street (Brady Street Historic District) Applicant: Elan Peltz and Wired Ventures LLC. PTS# 46202

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project.

Commissioners were in agreement that the renovations were appropriate.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the project. The motion carried.

6D. Certified Local Government Review of the National Register nomination for the Florida and Third Industrial Historic District. (Carried over from December meeting)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave an overview of the significance of the district.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to support the National Register nomination for this district. The motion carried.

6E. Certified Local Government Review of the National Register nomination for the Saint James Court Apartments, 831 W. Wisconsin Ave. (Carried over from December meeting)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave an overview of the significance of this building.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to support the National Register nomination for this building. The motion carried.

6F. Preliminary review of new hotel/condo at 2567 N. Downer Avenue. Architect will present designs, but the commission will not take final action. (Downer Avenue Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich showed images of the Chancery Building on Downer Avenue.

Architect Scott Kindness was recognized. He indicated that Joel Lee was working on the hotel project and that they have been meeting with a lot of people on this matter. This was the first public viewing of their proposal. Their intent was to submit final drawings for the February HPC meeting.

What began as one building that combined condos and hotel has evolved into two buildings. An 11-story condo building was now to be built on Stowell Avenue, developed by New Land Enterprises. The hotel would be built on top of the Chancery Building and was being developed by Joel Lee. Mr. Kindness showed profiles through the streets.

He then outlined the condo project, which included five, three story townhomes along the Stowell Avenue frontage. A tower would rise from behind the townhomes. Medical Building parking, concierge hotel parking, and pedestrian access was on Webster. Commissioners critiqued certain elements of the design of the condo, particularly the balconies, separation of public and private space and landscaping. City Attorney Greg Hagopian reminded the commission that they had jurisdiction only over what fell within the Downer Avenue historic district boundaries. The commissioners replied that they were aware of that and Mr. Kindness said the comments were helpful. Ann Pieper Eisenbrown said she appreciated being able to see the condo proposal even though the HPC has no jurisdiction over its design. A question came up about the tax keys and whether or not the condo and the hotel projects were part of the same tax key. Any additional property added to a tax key in a historic district became part of that district and subject to HPC review. Mr. Hagopian indicated that he believed the two projects were on separate tax keys and that there was separate ownership for each.

Scott Kindness next summarized the hotel development. The proposed hotel is to be built on top of the current Chancery Building and rises to 7 stories. It is set back eight to nine feet from the front façade. The first story will be restored according to plans that were found but there will be some changes to accommodate the hotel. The entrance is positioned where Einstein Bagels was located and the lobby will be located in the space the Chancery occupied. Twelve-foot wide balconies will extend out five feet from the building over the sidewalk at the south end and create a focal point. The balconies would extend out from the second through the seventh floors. A conference center will be on the second floor. There are structural challenges building on top on the existing building so that is why most of the Chancery Building will be removed. Room sizes are dictated by the needs of the hotel. Mr. Kindness said that UWM and Columbia-St. Mary's are excited about having conference rooms here.

There was much discussion about the balconies. Ald. Bauman likened them to diving boards extending from the building. In response to a question from Matt Jarosz, Scott Kindness indicated that the balconies extended from private rooms not common areas. Ald. Bauman suggested running balconies across the front of the building instead of just along the south end as had been done on hotels, like the Republican House, in the past. Sandra McSweeney suggested turning the balconies 45 degrees and extending over the Downer Garage Building to the south instead of the front sidewalk.

Matt Jarosz thought the facade strange and confusing with the contemporary building rising out of the historic building. He thought that we should respect the 1938 building. There are problems with the balconies in the Third Ward and the proposal here. There appears to be plenty of rooftop access for looking out so he questioned the need for balconies.

Pat Balon mentioned that the materials were a deviation from what is in the historic district and Tim Stemper asked whether the designer looked at the guidelines for the district. Scott Kindness replied that he had looked at the guidelines but couldn't meet them all. He did not think the proposal deviated that much from what was acceptable.

Vanessa Koster, Assistant Planning Director, was recognized. She indicated that the General Planned Development allowed an 11-story structure on Downer. She told the commission that they could review massing and materials but not height.

Staff Paul Jakubovich reviewed the concept of additions to historic buildings and used the Matthew Keenan House as an example. An addition there was built well to the rear and was not visible from the façade. With this hotel proposal, there is little left of the historic façade. This is not good preservation practise. Mr. Jakubovich added that perhaps an all-new building should be built on the site.

Scott Kindness showed a rendering of what an all-new building could look like if the Chancery Building were demolished. Commissioners thought that a three-story base with floors 4 through 7 set back slightly created a boring streetscape since it followed the height of the Downer Garage Building too closely. They liked the variety in height that now exists on the street. Ann Pieper Eisenbrown said she appreciated the proposal but it made the street look too matching. Commissioners Ann

Pieper Eisenbrown, Tim Stemper and Ald. Bauman preferred keeping the 2-story Chancery façade. Matt Jarosz wanted to see some more options for an all-new building before he could make a recommendation whether or not to keep the Chancery Building.

In summary the commissioners wanted to see the balconies redesigned and repositioned so that they did not appear as diving boards extending out over the sidewalk. Perhaps the balconies could be eliminated in favor of rooftop access. Commissioners were in consensus that a canopied entry with support columns was ok. It would serve much like the Downer Theater marquee. They wanted to see some options for a new replacement building in order to determine whether or not to approve building atop the existing Chancery Building or to approve an all-new building for the site.

Pam Frautschi was recognized. She stated that the Chancery Building was not beautiful and maybe an all-new building would be better.

Bob Greenstreet was recognized. He asked what direction the commission wanted Scott Kindness to follow. Ald. Bauman wanted the Chancery saved. Pat Balon said it was contingent on what was found underneath the remodeling of the first floor, how much was worth saving. Sandra McSweeney preferred an all-new building. Matt Jarosz said he wanted to see options for saving the building as well as options for an all-new building. Ann Pieper Eisenbrown said the matter was worthy of more discussion.

Ald. D'Amato was recognized. He suggested that the applicants file two COA applications, one would ask for demolition. One can always be put aside depending on what the commissioners decided.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Election of Vice-Chair for 2008

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion for Pat Balon to move into the position of chair for 2008. The motion carried unanimously.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion that Matt Jarosz serve as vice-chair for 2008. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Cream of the Cream City Awards will be presented on May 29, 2008 along with the Mayor's Urban Design Awards. Please submit candidates for review by a subcommittee of the HPC. Deadline for submission is March 31, 2008.

Pat Balon and Sandra McSweeney volunteered to serve as the subcommittee to go over the nominations and present the finalists to the board.

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, February 12, 2008 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street

9. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 5:26 P.M.

**MINUTES SPECIAL MEETING OF THE HISTORIC
PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

Monday, January 28, 2008

3 pm

City Hall, Room 301-A

Pat Balon, Chair

Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair

Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,

Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Tim Stemper



LIVING WITH HISTORY

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:06 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney (via telephone), Tim Stemper

Commissioners Excused: Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Martha Brown, Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Assistant City Attorney Gregg Hagopian, Bob Greenstreet

2. REVIEW OF LEGAL ACTION regarding property at 2574-90 N. Downer Avenue

Assistant City Attorney Gregg Hagopian gave an overview of the lawsuit filed by Thea Kovac, Donna Neal and Dawn McCarthy against the city (2007-CV-01455), and responded to questions from commissioners. The lawsuit questions the procedures used to approve construction of a building at 2574-90 N. Downer Ave. Although the suit sought an injunction to stop construction of the building, the judge has not granted this injunction.

This special HPC meeting has been called as a result of the lawsuit, and a special meeting of the Zoning, Neighborhoods and Development Committee of the Common Council will be held February 14, 2008.

At the 2/11/08 HPC meeting, Assistant City Attorney Melanie Swank will review the open meetings laws with HPC.

Assistant City Attorney Hagopian reviewed the HPC ordinance and advised the commissioners that they were not empowered to entertain any new plans for the site, other than those submitted by the developer. The commission's role is to review the items relevant to the application for the COA that was issued June 29, 2008.

3. REVIEW OF HPC SUBCOMMITTEE FINDINGS regarding property at 2574-90 N. Downer Ave.

DCD Deputy Commissioner Martha Brown summarized the actions of the HPC subcommittee with respect to issues that had been delegated to the subcommittee at the HPC meeting of May 14, 2007. These issues included cladding materials (request samples), storefront glazing, signage, snow removal system, east elevation details, preserving a tree on the site, and the popcorn wagon.

The following motions were made:

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the cladding materials.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the street level glazing.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to table the signage.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the snow removal system.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the east elevation

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to preserve the tree

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion for the preservation of the popcorn wagon

Project architect Scott Kindness was recognized and presented samples of materials requested by the sub-committee. Kindness presented a sample of the pre-cast panel with a green stain applied directly to the finished panels. Per the sub-committee meetings, the panels were to have an integral color. Kindness indicated that the color was part of a stain system and the color would not be painted on. Matt Jarosz indicated that the sub-committee had requested color samples prior to approvals.

Kindness presented a sample of the metal grille that is used on the exterior of the parking structure. The grilles meet code; they are 2 ½ feet wide, top railing height 42". These materials had been presented to planning staff in October 2007, but this was the first time they had been presented to the HPC.

Kindness reported that snow removal for the parking structure will be accomplished through the use of snow removal gates. The snow will be pushed through the gates to a truck below.

In response to an invitation for public testimony, the following individuals presented comments:

Pamela Frautschi, Dawn McCarthy, Joe Cincotta, Dawn McCarthy , Donna Neal, Gail Fitch, Paul Demcak, Peter Kovac, Bob Greenstreet, Pam Doris. Written materials were presented by Paul Demcak, Tom Burke, and Pam Frautschi. The Commission also received a letter from Royce Yeater of the National Trust for Historic Preservation.

Following public testimony and commission discussion, the motions were modified as follows and votes were taken:

THE MOTION: Ald Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to confirm that the tree had been preserved. Tim Stemper abstained from the vote. Sandra McSweeney was opposed. Matt Jarosz, Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Bauman were in favor. The motion carried.

Discussion: The COA indicated that efforts were made to save the tree by redesigning the façade. If the tree does not survive a replacement is required. Commissioner McSweeney suggested that if a replacement tree is required, its diameter should be larger than 8".

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the material on the east elevation. The motion carried with Sandra McSweeney opposed.

Discussion: Commissioner Jarosz stated that, based on the information provided by City Planner Bob Greenstreet, the neighbor to the east, Elaine Miller, had been consulted and approved the design.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to table action on signage because a separate COA will be issued. The motion carried unanimously.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the redesigned storefronts. The motion carried unanimously.

Discussion: Kindness reported that the storefront will have clear glass with granite bulkheads and the glazing pattern has been changed to reflect the recommendation of the HPC subcommittee.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to confirm that the snow removal chute issue is resolved since the drawings indicate the building will not have an exterior snow removal chute. (Instead, gates will be opened to discharge accumulated snow.) The motion carried with Sandra McSweeney in opposition.

Discussion: Kindness reported that snow will be pushed through snow removal gates to a truck below. The gate is west of the tree over the green space and next to the bank's drive through, with room for a truck to pull in to receive the snow.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney made a motion to postpone the approval of materials until the commissioners could view them on site. There was no second to the motion. The motion failed.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the exterior cladding materials as presented by architect Scott Kindness. The motion carried with Sandra McSweeney in opposition.

4. OTHER BUSINESS

Commissioner McSweeney offered the following motion:

THE MOTION:

Whereas, typically HPC independently acts using HPC staff and, when appropriate, with sub-committee members appointed by HPC;

Whereas, if decisions are not consistent with the requests of the petitioners, the HPC decision not to approve may be appealed to the Common Council by the petitioner;

Whereas, DCD staff has called all HPC sub-committee meetings with reference to 2574-90 N. Downer, and have established the date, time, place, agenda, and whom to invite to such meeting, and also prepared the minutes of each meeting;

Whereas DCD has called this special meeting of 1/28/08 and set the agenda;

Therefore, it is hereby resolved that the HPC sub-committee state its position that, since all meetings and actions taken have been governed by DCD staff, HPC has no responsibility with respect to the decisions being questioned in the lawsuit involving 2574-90 N. Downer.

The motion failed for lack of a second.

5. Adjournment

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 5:25 P.M.

Minutes prepared by Martha Brown, Staff

**MEETING OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MINUTES AS AMENDED**

Monday, February 11, 2008

3 pm

City Hall, Room 301-A



LIVING WITH HISTORY

**Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Tim Stemper**

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:03 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Tim Stemper, Ann Pieper-Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Martha Brown, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES

Commissioner Ackerman moved approval of the minutes of the January 14, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission meeting. Commissioner Balon noted that the minutes should indicate that Commissioner Pieper-Eisenbrown was present at the meeting. With that correction, the minutes were adopted.

Commissioner McSweeney moved to hold adoption of the minutes of the January 28, 2008 Special Meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission and Commissioner Ackerman seconded the motion. Commissioners Ackerman, Stemper, Jarosz, McSweeney and Balon voted in favor of the motion. Commissioner Bauman opposed. Commissioner Pieper-Eisenbrown abstained. The motion passed.

Commissioner Bauman moved that the Commission require a verbatim transcript of its meetings. The motion failed for lack of a second.

Several Commissioners asked that a copy of the memorandum of understanding between the State of Wisconsin and the City of Milwaukee regarding the City's status as a Certified Local Government be shared with the Commission. Ms. Brown indicated the memorandum would be shared at the next HPC meeting.

3. OLD BUSINESS

- A. Certificate of appropriateness to demolish the former U.S. Coast Guard Station, 1600 N. Lincoln Memorial Drive (Applicant: Milwaukee County Dept. of Public Works, PTS #48113)

Paul Jakubovich presented a staff report that recommended approval of the certificate of appropriateness for demolition under criteria h-6 (economic infeasibility of preservation or re-use). Kevin Haley, representing Milwaukee County Parks, addressed the Commission.

Commissioner Stemper moved to approve the certificate of appropriateness for demolition under criteria h-6, with the understanding that the pedestrian bridge will continue to be a locally-designated historic structure. Commissioner Ackerman seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

4. NEW BUSINESS

- A. Request for conceptual approval to construct two new houses on vacant land between 114 and 134 E. Vine St., now part of the property addressed at 1821 N. Palmer St. in the Brewers Hill Historic District (Applicant: Avenue Design Group, PTS #48544)

Paul Jakubovich presented a staff report that recommended conceptual approval. Steve Bialk, the developer, addressed the Commission. Commissioner McSweeney suggested that, as designs are developed, they reflect an offset in the wall of the garage.

Commissioner Bauman moved to approve, in concept, the construction of the two houses, with the understanding that final drawings and details will be submitted to the Commission for review and approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to construction. Commissioner Ackerman seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- B. Request for a certificate of appropriateness to construct a rooftop addition and alter windows and doors at 1023 N. Old World Third Street in the North Third Street Historic District (Applicant: Korey Bannerman, Bootleggers of Milwaukee, and Engberg Anderson, PTS #46584)

Paul Jakubovich presented a staff report that recommended approval of the rooftop addition, sited 32 feet from the front façade of the building. Chad Omon of Engberg Anderson addressed the Commission.

Commissioner Bauman moved to hold approval of the project and that the project be referred to staff to work with the architect on strategies to minimize the visibility of the railing from the public way, with the understanding that the project will be brought back to the Commission for review and approval prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction. Commissioner Jarosz seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- C. Request for a certificate of appropriateness to demolish six buildings in block four of the former Pabst Brewery Complex within the Pabst Brewery Historic District to make way for a new parking garage: Building 1, Tank Storage Building, constructed 1933, 902 W. Juneau Ave.; Building 2, Stock House constructed 1870-75 and 1926, 908 W. Juneau Ave.; Building 4, Stock House, constructed 1900, 1217 N. 9th St.; Building 5, Grain Processing House, constructed 1948, 920 W. Juneau Ave.; Building 6, Fermenting House, constructed 1948, 926 W. Juneau Ave., and Building 8, Barrel Storage House, circa 1890, 1233 N. 9th St. (Applicant: Brewery Project LLC, PTS #48648)

Paul Jakubovich presented a staff report that recommended approval of a certificate of appropriateness for demolition under criteria h-6 (economic infeasibility of preservation or re-use). Mike Mervis, representing Brewery Project LLC, addressed the Commission.

Commissioner Bauman moved approval of a certificate of appropriateness to demolish buildings 1, 2, 4, 5, 6 and 8 under criteria h-6, with the understanding that the developer is required to receive a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to constructing a parking structure or any other structure on the cleared land. Commissioner McSweeney seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

- D. Request for a certificate of appropriateness to demolish 2567 N. Downer Avenue and construct new seven-story hotel at the site within the Downer Avenue Historic District (Applicant: Workshop Architects, PTS #48647)

Paul Jakubovich presented a staff report that recommended approval of a certificate of appropriateness for demolition under criteria h-6 (economic infeasibility of preservation or re-use) and approval of a certificate of appropriateness for new construction. The staff report recommended several conditions with respect to materials and the design of a balcony proposed for the new building.

The following individuals addressed the Commission: Scott Kindness, Workshop Architects, representing the developer; Pamela Dorris; Dawn McCarthy; Peter Kovac; Pamela Frautschi; Paul Demcak. Written statements were presented by Ms. Frautschi and Thea Kovac. Mr. Kovac asked that several photographs and a photocopy of a newspaper article be made part of the record.

Commissioner Bauman moved approval of a certificate of appropriateness to demolish the building under criteria h-6. Commissioner McSweeney seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Bauman moved approval of a certificate of appropriateness to construct the proposed hotel in accordance with the following conditions:

With respect to conditions #1 and #2 in the staff report, staff member Paul Jakubovich will approve material samples, with no further approval required by the Commission.

With respect to condition #3 of the staff report, staff is directed to work with the architect to suggest design strategies to minimize the visual impact of the balcony, with the understanding that the construction of the balcony will require approval of a separate certificate of appropriateness by the Commission.

Commissioner Jarosz seconded.

Commissioners Jarosz, Bauman, Ackerman, Balon and Stemper voted in favor of the motion. Commissioners McSweeney and Pieper-Eisenbrown opposed. The motion passed.

4. OTHER BUSINESS

Commissioner McSweeney asked for information with respect to the exterior design of the transformer room for the new construction at 2574-90 N. Downer Ave. Ms. Brown indicated that this information will be presented to the Commissioners at their next meeting.

5. ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Jarosz moved that the meeting be adjourned. Commissioner Pieper-Eisenbrown seconded. The motion carried unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Martha Brown, Staff



LIVING WITH HISTORY

MEETING NOTICE

**Special Meeting
City of Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission
Thursday, February 14, 2008 1:30 pm
City Hall – 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-B**

No business will be conducted by the Historic Preservation Commission at this meeting. The meeting is publicly noticed in the event that a quorum of the Historic Preservation Commission attends a meeting of the Zoning Neighborhoods and Development Committee of the Common Council scheduled for the same date, time and location.

PLEASE NOTE: If you have difficulty with the English language, you may bring an interpreter with you, at your own expense, so that you can answer questions and participate in the hearing. Upon reasonable notice, efforts will be made to accommodate the needs of disabled individuals through sign language interpreters or other auxiliary aids. For additional information or to request this service, contact the Historic Preservation Office at 286-5712 or 286-5722. The building at 200 E. Wells Street is wheelchair accessible. Persons engaged in lobbying as defined in s. 305-43-4 of the Milwaukee Code of Ordinances are required to register with the City Clerk's Office License Division. More information is available at www.milwaukee.gov/lobby, or by calling 414-286-2238.

PARKING: Reduced parking rates are available at the Milwaukee Center self-parking structure. Entrances are located on N. Water Street or E. Kilbourn Avenue. Tickets may be validated at the City Hall information desk.

LOCATION OF MEETING & BUILDING HOURS: This meeting will be held in room 301-B of City Hall, 200 East Wells Street. City Hall is open until meetings for the day are concluded.

TELEPHONE: (414) 286-5810



Living with History

MINUTES Approved
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, March 17, 2008, 3:00 PM
City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-A

Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1.ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:05 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners Absent: None

Staff Present: Martha Brown, Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster

Chair Pat Balon read into the record a letter from commissioner Tim Stemper, stating his resignation from the Historic Preservation Commission effective the end of the last commission meeting on February 11, 2008.

2.MINUTES

A. Approval of the February 11, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes

Sandra McSweeney made a correction to the minutes, page 1, 2nd paragraph, that she made the motion to hold the adoption of the January 28th minutes and that Sandy Ackerman seconded the motion. There was brief discussion as to whether or not the chair votes on items and whether or not the chair's name be listed in the vote tally. It was determined that it was appropriate for the chair to vote and be listed.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes as amended. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Discussion/Approval of the January 28, 2008 Special Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes

Martha Brown handed out minutes for the special meeting of January 28, 2008 that reflected changes requested by Sandra McSweeney.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to hold over approval of the January 28th minutes until the April HPC meeting in order to give commissioners time to read the minutes as revised. The motion carried unanimously.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. New roof top addition and window and door changes at 1023 N. Old World 3rd Street (North Third Street Historic District) Applicant: Korey Bannerman (Bootleggers of Milwaukee) and Engberg Anderson. PTS#46584

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project and pointed out the how the changes requested by the HPC at the February meeting had been implemented. Revisions included moving the hand/guard rail back further from the parapet, installing planters with evergreen vegetation around the rooftop addition to screen the railings and rooftop addition, and the use of glass overhead doors in the four openings of the addition. Bryan Randall, from Friebert Finnerty and St. John, and Paul Fatica, from Engberg Anderson Architects, were present to answer questions. Commissioners were satisfied that the changes would screen the rooftop addition and railings from view from the street and adjacent residential units.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the project as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Pocket Park (Pabst Brewery Historic District) Applicant: Brewery Project LLC PTS#49249

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project, which will be located on vacant land between Buildings 10 and 20 in the Pabst Brewery Complex. Elements of the park include a grassy knoll, a cage-like gabion ice wall and scrim wall of metal mesh at McKinley Avenue. The landscape walls will screen a 79-car parking lot. Mike Mervis and architect Kevin Manz were present from the Zilber group to answer questions.

In response to a question by chair Pat Balon, Mr. Mervis indicated that a bronze statue of Mr. and Mrs. Zilber had been presented to Joe Zilber at his 90th birthday. It is executed by the Coverilla Studios (SP?) who designed the bust of Ben Marcus at the PAC, sculpture at Soldier's Field and a sculpture of Martin Luther King for Atlanta. The Zilber sculpture will be placed in the sunken garden portion of the project.

In response to a question by Sandra McSweeney, Kevin Manz said that there should be enough sun to allow for plants to grow on the walls. There will be changes with the seasons. Plantings of Euonymous will survive.

In response to questions by Matt Jarosz, Kevin Manz indicated that parking will be accessed from McKinley Avenue, the parking lot will be asphalt paved, with storm water basins located in the park. The owners' association, not the city, will maintain the park, the bio swales, and handle snow removal.

There was a brief discussion about the lighting. Mike Mervis indicated that the less expensive more energy efficient yellow lighting would be installed now instead of the whiter metal halides but that different bulbs could be installed later as technology improves.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the project as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Lion Bridge restoration in Lake Park (North Point North Historic District) Applicant: Milwaukee County PTS#41398

THE MOTION: matt Jarosz moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to hold this item over at the request of the owner. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Rear addition at 234 E. Vine Street (Brewers Hill Historic District Applicant: Christopher Mann PTS#47549

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the proposal for a rear addition to what had originally been a Miller Brewery corner tavern. The addition would replace a wood structure, now dilapidated, with a structure built of reclaimed Cream City brick. Staff recommended conceptual approval and that the windows be double hung rather than casements. Architect Chris Mann was present to answer questions.

Mr. Mann indicated he would contact the Brewer's Hill residents for feedback on the project.

Matt Jarosz emphasized that the arches be designed to closely approximate those on the original portion of the building and that they be trimmed out appropriately.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to give conceptual approval to the proposal. Sandra McSweeney made a friendly amendment that after working with staff, the complete plans/drawings be brought back to the commission for review and approval. The motion carried unanimously.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. The February 11, 2008 minutes indicated that Martha Brown would discuss the transformer room doors/area for the Downer Avenue Parking Ramp. Martha indicated that Vanessa Koster would speak on the matter. Since the item had not been noticed on the agenda, it was decided to hold over any discussion until the April meeting.

B. The matter of snow removal gates on the Downer Avenue Parking Ramp was brought up as a result of a letter/communication, from a resident in the neighborhood, directed to the HPC Downer Parking Ramp subcommittee. Ald. Bauman indicated the matter needed to go as a complaint to the Department of Neighborhood Service and that the HPC had no further authority on the matter.

C. Recap of submissions for the Cream of the Cream City Awards. The awards will be presented on May 29, 2008. Staff Carlen Hatala urged commission members to nominate projects by the March 31st deadline. Pat Balon and Sandra McSweeney will review the submissions and prepare the final list for voting at the next meeting.

D. Martha Brown handed out copies of the page from the Certified Local Government handbook that discussed minutes. She indicated that a discussion of minutes could be put on the next agenda if the commissioners wanted. Martha Brown added that there would be a briefing by one of the assistant city attorneys on open records matters at the next HPC meeting and that questions about subcommittees could be addressed then.

9. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 4:01 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES AS AMENDED
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, April 14, 2008, 3:00 PM NOTE CHANGE OF LOCATION
809 Building 809 N. Broadway FIRST FLOOR BOARD ROOM

Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:10 PM.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster

Others Present: Gregg Hagopian, Melanie Swank

2. MINUTES

Discussion/Approval of the January 28, 2008 minutes of the Special Meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the Special Meeting of January 28, 2008. The motion carried.

Sandra McSweeney requested that the matter of changeable paint color vs. permanent color be added to the May HPC agenda for discussion on policy.

A. Approval of the March 17, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the minutes of March 17, 2008. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of 2841 W. Richardson Place. (Concordia Historic District)

Staff Carlen Hatala presented a brief history of the property. Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the past HPC action on this matter. The request for demolition was held for six months, or until May. The Department of Neighborhood Services had requested that there be a resolution regarding violations by May 1, 2008.

Ald. Bauman stated that the Concordia neighborhood was opposed to the demolition. The demolition would not expand Neighborhood House's programming, would only add an asphalt parking lot, and that there was no parking problem to address.

Matt Jarosz asked if there had been any progress toward moving the building. Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that a mover had gone to inspect the building and determined it could be moved. Utility wires would have to be dropped and the cost would come to about \$30,000.

The new executive director of Neighborhood House, Mr. Richard Cox was recognized. He said he would allow the commission to vote and would proceed from there.

Mr. Mark Schmidt from Neighborhood House was recognized. He said he went along with Mr. Cox.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to deny the request to demolish the building. The motion carried.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Restoration of 2714 W. Burnham St. (Frank Lloyd Wright System Built Houses Historic District) PTS#28654

Denise Hice, president of Frank Lloyd Wright Wisconsin, was recognized. She summarized the efforts of the organization and how the restoration of 2714 W. Burnham will fit into the programming and future plans of the organization. The organization received a \$150,000 grant from the Save America's Treasures program and has raised \$400,000 toward the restoration so far. Two other houses in the district, also owned by the organization, will have their exteriors restored.

Mike Lilek, board member of Frank Lloyd Wright Wisconsin, was recognized. He summarized the actions taken as background to this project and stated that the group was ready to advertise for bids. The National Park Service and the State Historic Preservation Office had already given their approval to the proposed restoration.

Staff Paul Jakubovich showed images of the building and details of the original fabric that will be restored. Commissioners were in agreement that the proposed restoration approach was appropriate.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the restoration. The motion carried.

B. Demolition of garage at 930 N. 34th St. (Concordia Historic District) Applicant: Arne and Marie Vedum PTS#49643

Staff Paul Jakubovich reviewed the applicant's proposal to demolish the current non-historic garage. The owner is currently working with staff on the design of the new 4-car garage that will take its place.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the demolition based on h-2 and d-6 of the ordinance and preservation guidelines. The motion carried.

C. Restoration of Lion Bridge in Lake Park (North Point North Historic District) Applicant: Milwaukee County PTS #41398

Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the proposal to restore the Lion Bridge. The bridge was narrowed in the 1960s to convert it from vehicular to pedestrian only traffic and will maintain that width in the restoration. Some limestone blocks will have to be replicated due to severe deterioration. New landscaping will be done from the top of the hill to about 40 feet down the slope.

Kevin Haley from the Milwaukee County Parks was recognized. He stated that the County was working with the consulting firm of Mead and Hunt and the State Historic Preservation Office. Fundraising will have to be done to replace the bollards, as the County was not successful in getting a coastal management grant for the project. They are ready to start work this summer.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the restoration as outlined in the staff report. The motion carried.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Briefing on open meetings law by Assistant City Attorney Melanie Swank

Assistant City Attorney Melanie was recognized. She referred to the handouts provided for the HPC commissioners. She recommended consulting the State Department of Justice website for information about open meetings requirements. Ms. Swank recommended consulting with her on any gray areas related to Open Meetings requirements. She then followed an outline she provided to the commissioners and went over what constitutes a governmental body, what triggers the Open Meetings law, what constitutes a walking quorum and so on. Some of her recommendations included:

- ❖ She cautioned against discussing any commission business (in person or by e-mail) away from the public meetings if the numbers of commissioners present constitutes a quorum.
- ❖ A statement such as "Do not respond to this message or forward" should be included in any e-mail communication to the commissioners so that it is not forwarded. There are ways to set up messages so that they cannot be forwarded or responded to.
- ❖ Conference calls can be used to conduct business except when there is evidence presented or formal testimony taken. The person must then be visibly present.
- ❖ If a quorum of HPC members attends the meeting of another governmental body, the HPC members should notify DCD and then a public notice will be prepared. It will state that the commissioners are in attendance for informational purposes and will not take any formal action. The same is true if a quorum of commissioners, or a sub-committee, would attend a preservation conference, for example.
- ❖ The law allows public comment only when public comment is anticipated. The law allows the public to attend but not to participate unless specifically allowed to speak. Permission to speak can be put on the agenda. The HPC would control the extent of the comments and set time limits.
- ❖ There are 13 exemptions to the Open Meetings requirement that permit, but do not require, a governmental body to convene in closed session. Some of these include promotions, demotions, disciplinary action, and seeking of legal advice. The Milwaukee Corporate Counsel enforces the Open Meetings law. If there are violations Counsel can request training or can void decisions.

Ms. Swank had the following answers in response to questions by the HPC:

1. Cream of the Cream City Awards--A quorum of the commission may attend the annual Cream of the Cream City awards program. The invitation to the event does not constitute formal notice. Ms. Swank recommended calling her about the matter.
2. Site Visits—There is no Open Meetings violation if only a few commissioners show up. If it is known that a quorum will show up, prepare a notice. Avoid a walking quorum situation.
3. Sub committee to work on Cream of the Cream City Awards—If the chair appoints 2 or 3 members to work as a subcommittee then any of their meetings need to be noticed. If members "volunteer" to work on the awards, consult with Ms. Swank on details.
4. Subcommittees are empowered to review details of a project. Their meetings need to be noticed.
5. When there is a quorum for a training session, for example, today's briefing, that meeting needs to be noticed. If a member pays to attend a conference or convention there is no notice. If a quorum attends a paid conference then a notice is required with an explanation that no decisions are being made on behalf of the HPV.

6. Tape recording subcommittee meetings creates a record that is subject to Open Records law and records retention schedules. Tape-recording the subcommittee meetings is not required by law.

In answer to additional questions by the commissioners, Ms. Swank stated that members should be cautious about e-mails and avoid the walking quorum and that if the commission wants to allow public comment that needs to be specifically stated on the agenda.

[Ald. Bauman left the meeting]

B. Vote on the nominees for the Cream of the Cream City Awards

Pat Balon and Sandra McSweeney briefed commissioners on the nominees. The commissioners were then handed ballots and voted. Mayor Barrett will announce the winners.

C. Update on Transformer Room on Belleview elevation of new parking garage at 2574 N. Downer Ave. (Downer Avenue Historic District)

In response to a request from commissioners, Assistant Planning Director Vanessa Koster briefed the commission about the transformer room entrance on the Belleview Avenue side of the parking ramp. The solid doors will be surrounded by concrete masonry units and painted to match. There will be no design changes made to this area.

D. Update on status of 1851 N. 2nd Street (Brewer's Hill Historic District).

Paul Jakubovich stated that he had not issued a COA for mothballing this building. He introduced Rebecca Rabatin from the Department of Neighborhood Services to explain its status. Ms. Rabatin said that there is a federal fraud investigation pending on this property. DNS will authorize that the electricity be turned back on and that the code corrections can be done later.

8. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandy Ackerman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 5 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, May 19, 2008, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:10 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Sandra McSweeney

Commissioners Excused: Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

Approval of the April 14, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes.

Sandra McSweeney and Ald. Bauman made a correction to the minutes, page 2, the motion for item 6B, to show that Ald. Bauman made the motion and Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to approve the April 14, 2008 minutes as corrected. The motion carried.

Sandra McSweeney requested that the discussion about paint color be placed on the June agenda since it had not been placed on the May agenda. Assistant Planning Director Vanessa Koster indicated that there will be a formal staff report on the matter.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for rear addition at 234 E. Vine St. (Brewers Hill Historic District) PTS# 47549 Applicants: Christopher Mann and Robert Crawford

Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the design changes made since the March commission meeting. The rear addition will have an entrance on the north elevation; there are now double hung windows; the double leaf doors on the north elevation are operable; the double leaf doors on the east elevation are fixed. The drawings show a box eave, but staff feels that a plate eave would be more appropriate.

Architect Chris Mann was recognized. He was receptive to the soffit detail advocated by staff.

In answer to questions by the commissioners about materials and the castle-esque treatment of the entrance, Mr. Mann stated that he had wanted a architectural feature at the garden entrance to equal that at the front of the building, the building will have recycled cream brick, the three-season room will be used for dining, and that he met with the Brewers Hill economic committee and they endorsed the plan.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the design of the addition. The motion carried with Sandra McSweeney opposed.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for conservatory addition to garage at 2691 N. Lake Drive St. (North Point North Historic District) PTS# 44683 Applicants: Debra Kern, owner; Peter Kudlata, contractor

Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the project, which consists of a greenhouse addition to the existing garage. With the trees at the front of the property and the privacy fence at the rear of the property along Park Place, the garage is barely visible from the public right of way.

There was a brief discussion about the scale of the drawings vs. the actual height of the greenhouse, the existing windows and the service door. Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that the manufacturer, Amdega Co. would not provide measured drawings at this point in the project. There was a brief discussion about the front fence, installed by a previous owner without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to give conceptual approval to the greenhouse addition with working drawings to come back to the HPC for final approval. The motion carried.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness to change electronic bill board from 30 second message change time to 8 second message change time on Building #16. (Grain Silos, Pabst Brewery Historic District) PTS# 38585 Applicant: Towne Realty

Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that the COA issued to approve the sign required the applicant to apply for a new COA if the billboard ordinance changed and allowed messages to change at more frequent intervals.

Dan McCarthy from the Zilber Group/Brewery Project LLC was recognized. Ald. Bauman stated that the ordinance now allowed the messages to change every 8 seconds.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to allow the electronic message board to change at 8-second intervals. The motion carried.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness for new parking garage at the southeast corner of block 4 of the Pabst Brewery complex (Pabst Brewery Historic District) PTS#50667 Applicant: Towne Realty

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the proposed ramp. The design of the building has had input from HPC and DCD staff and now has a vertical emphasis, with a height approximating that of the tank storage buildings currently being demolished. Paul asked commissioners to refer to the new packets just delivered. The brick of the main portion of the building, along Juneau Avenue, will be dark not the yellow brick as shown in the early packet. A small park will occupy the site west of the proposed ramp where tank storage buildings are being demolished.

Project architect Kevin Mantz was recognized. He stated that the pocket park will occupy the site of Buildings 5 and 6 and that it will serve as a "tree nursery" for the rest of the complex until the site could be redeveloped. In answer to questions by commissioners Mr. Mantz indicated that the new ramp would recreate the canyon effect at 9th Street and Juneau Avenue with its vertical emphasis, that design elements were taken from the buildings being demolished and that ultimately, the complex will be comprised of 40% to 50% new buildings.

The commissioners had questions about rooftop parking, lighting and snow chutes as well as the solid walls. Mr. Mantz indicated that there would be rooftop parking, with a 42-inch parapet wall, that 15-foot tall lights are typical but that they are looking at fixtures and have not made decisions yet. They are looking into LED and maybe metal fluorescent lights but not sodium vapor for now although that cannot be ruled out. The snow chute will be 6-feet wide and 4-feet deep and is positioned against the

elevator shaft so it will be somewhat screened from view. Sandra McSweeney suggested redesigning it or placing a trellis on it. There will be a landing so that a truck can back up to the chute. Some snow may be stored on the roof, taking up one or two stalls. Mr. Mantz indicated that the solid walls meet code for cross ventilation.

Commissioners were in consensus that the industrial look of the design, the dark brick with lighter brick sections, and the verticality were appropriate for the industrial complex.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the design with the lighting and any changes to the snow chute to come back to the HPC for approval. The motion carried.

D. Certificate of Appropriateness for front yard wall and fence at 2217 E. Kenilworth Place (North Point South Historic District) PTS# 50177 Applicant: Mark & Grace Thomsen, owners, Jen/Chris Company LLC, contractor

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project and summarized that the front yard wall, fence and patio were not appropriate for the site on this block given the small size of the front yard and required setbacks. There is only 4 feet between the porch and the pier of the proposed wall.

Neither the owners nor the contractor were present.

Commissioners did not think a front yard patio with furniture, umbrellas, and hardscaping was appropriate for this site and was out of scale for this block.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to deny the request for a certificate of appropriateness based on the guidelines for the North Point South Historic District as cited in the staff report.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Pat Balon encouraged commissioners to attend The Cream of the Cream City Awards on May 29, 2008 at the UWM School of Architecture and Urban Planning. Reception begins at 4:30 PM, Awards Presentation to start at 5:15 P.M.

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, June 16, 2008 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street

8. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion carried. The meeting adjourned at 4:30 P.M.



Living with History

**MINUTES
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, June 16, 2008, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall**

**Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown**

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:08 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners Excused: Sandra McSweeney

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

Approval of the May 19, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to approve the May 19, 2008 minutes. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for garage addition/expansion at 2857 N. Lake Drive (North Lake Drive Historic District) PTS# 51347 Applicants: Paul Giesen

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave a summary of the proposal. The existing rear garage is too small to accommodate the vehicles for the two condo units that now occupy the house. The proposal is to extend the garage so that cars can be parked tandem, match the pent roof over the garage doors, install overhead garage doors, match the brick, and have a 42 inch tall parapet wall that will enclose the rooftop deck. Brick samples and the final design of the parapet wall (solid vs. lattice-like) will be reviewed with staff.

Project architect Paul Giesen was recognized. In answer to questions by commissioners Mr. Giesen indicated that: 1) he will be consulting with Paul on the design of the garage doors 2) the material on the rooftop deck will be determined later as it will be a future project 3) sections of fence will be removed to extend the driveway and the driveway will match what is there now. They will be preserving as much of the current landscaping as possible.

Commissioners agreed that the project met design guidelines.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved to approve the garage extension with the garage doors, parapet wall, and brick and mortar samples to be reviewed and approved by staff. The project does not have to come back to the HPC unless unusual circumstances come up. Sandy Ackerman seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously..

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for new storefront and general restoration of 1105-1107 N. Old World Third Street. (Old World Third Street Historic District) PTS# 50322 Applicant: Rick Barrett and Rinka/Chung

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project. The small commercial building dates to c. 1872. The upper level has remained intact and new, segmentally arched wood windows will be installed. The lower level storefront has undergone significant alterations. Portions of the non-contributing storefront were removed, with HPC staff

approval, to determine what remained of the original front. There is evidence of a cap or capital atop the brick piers at either end of the storefront. The proposal also includes renovations to the rear façade since it will now serve as another entrance into the building. Most of the mechanicals will be placed on the roof.

Project architect Matt Rinka was recognized. In answer to a question from one of the commissioners, Mr. Rinka indicated that his client was not interested in the potential tax credits available for this project. Staff Paul Jakubovich answered other questions: no historic photos of the building had been found to date, the storefront wood will be left natural (unpainted), the chopped off detail will be looked at for replication, the owner will be getting a city façade grant on this project.

Commissioners agreed that the project met design guidelines.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the renovations with staff to review the brick cleaning, the capital detail and the band over the butt joint in the storefront glass. The motion carried unanimously.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Chair's recap of the 2007 Cream of the Cream City Awards

Pat Balon reported that the awards ceremony was well attended and that cream bricks have been handed out since the first program in 1993. At that time the inscription was made directly into the brick. Today there is a brass plate attached. The program has evolved from juice and treats after the May HPC meeting to the larger ceremony at UWM that joined the Cream of the Cream City Awards with the Mayor's Urban Design Awards. Ms. Balon asked commissioners to give some thought to next year's event, whether the two programs remain together or separate. Assistant Planning Director Vanessa Koster indicated that the money for the awards comes out of the advance planning budget and that the budget will be tight next year. UWM now pays for the food and appetizers at the combined awards. Matt Jarosz suggested that since the HPC gives out fewer awards, why not flip the order of the event so that HPC goes first. Being at the end is anti-climatic.

B. Staff report relating to guidelines that provide for color jurisdiction for existing structures and new construction within local historic districts and sites.

This item was held over so that Commissioner McSweeney could be present for the discussion.

C. Appeal of HPC decision to deny demolition of 2841 W. Richardson Place

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that Neighborhood House has filed an appeal and that the matter will go before the Zoning Neighborhoods and Development Committee on June 24th.

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Wisconsin Historical Society is sponsoring the 2008 Local History and Historic Preservation Conference on September 26-27, 2008 in Madison at the Radisson Hotel. There will be sessions specifically designed for members of Historic Preservation Commissions. Some scholarships are available (registration and lodging) for those working for or serving a Certified Local Government, which includes members of the Historic Preservation Commission. If you are interested please notify Carlen Hatala before July 18th.

Commissioner Matt Jarosz asked questions about tax credit approval for the windows at the Gorman project in the Pabst Complex as well as a project next to the Harley Hotel (Iron Horse). Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that the window replacements on the Gorman project have been approved and qualify for tax credits. Paul did not have information about the project adjacent to the Iron Horse except to say that there is a new National Register district in that area.

ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Matt Jarosz moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 3:50 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, July 14, 2008, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:07 PM.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Sandra McSweeney, Matt Jarosz

Commissioners Excused: Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Martha Brown, Gregg Hagopian

2. MINUTES

Approval of the June 16, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the June 16, 2008 minutes. The motion carried with Sandra McSweeney abstaining as she had been absent that meeting.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

Public Hearing on the petition for Interim Historic Designation on 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard.

Staff Carlen Hatala explained that the former Interim Designation had expired in June 2007 and permanent designation had not been voted on by the HPC. The ownership had changed since that time and the neighborhood wanted to proceed with designation so the entire block face of six bungalows had historic designation. The two houses appear to meet criteria e-5 and e-8 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

Staff Carlen Hatala swore in those wishing to speak.

Ald. Nik Kovac, 3rd Aldermanic District, was recognized. He expressed support for the designation and stated that the Milwaukee Jewish Federation (former owner) had found another site for the new Hillel Center.

Karen Sturm supported the designation but did not wish to speak.

Joan Van Norman supported the designation but did not wish to speak.

Patrick Diener supported the designation but did not wish to speak.

Jayne Pelton, 3054 N. Oakland Avenue, supported the designation and read the letter of support from the Murray Hill Neighborhood Association. Pat Balon had a copy of the letter entered into the record.

Bill Dreyer, the new owner of 2005 E. Kenwood Boulevard, said he had no problems with the designation and had been consulting staff about upcoming repairs to the house. He saw no reason not to be designated.

No one spoke in opposition to the designation.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried unanimously.

Commissioners were in agreement about the buildings meeting criteria e-5 and e-8.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to give interim designation to 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard based on criteria e-5 and e-8 of the ordinance. The motion carried unanimously.

5. OLD BUSINESS

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for new 2-car detached garage at 2655 N. Lake Drive (North Point North Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project. The new carriage barn-style garage will have a conservatory that will be visible from the street.

Erin Lanham, consultant on the project, was recognized. She stated that there would be wood windows and maybe metal overhead garage doors.

Commissioners thought the project appropriate for the historic district. In response to questions about details and whether the new structure will be painted to match the house, staff Paul Jakubovich said some of the details are still being worked out and that the building will probably be stained rather than painted.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the certificate of appropriateness with sample materials to be approved by staff. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for new 2-car detached garage at 2219 N. Lake Drive (North Point South Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project. The owner wants to replace the current one car garage with a two car garage. The back of the garage is up against a fence and there will be 16 inch to 17 inch of overhang including the gutters.

Contractor Don Gavic was recognized. He indicated that J.D. Griffiths will construct the shell of the building and that he will build the details. He stated he wanted to use cement fiberboard instead of cedar shingles because the building is already costing \$8,000 to \$10,000 more because of the historic district and that cedar shingles would add \$6,000 more.

Commissioners and staff discussed cement fiberboard, the fact that it is used in gable ends and on buildings in interior of blocks where it is not highly visible and asked how visible the material would be at this location. Staff indicated that the contractor's figures on cedar did not seem accurate and offered to provide a list of suppliers. Mr. Gavic will check with the owners.

Pat Balon asked the contractor to provide the site plan and material samples to staff.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve demolition of the existing one-car garage based on criterion b-6 in the North Point North Historic District Preservation Guidelines. The motion carried unanimously.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the new garage per the drawings as submitted with the details and site plan to be worked out with staff. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovation and penthouse, Building #14 in the Pabst Complex. 1037 W. McKinley Avenue (Pabst Brewery Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project. The 1894 building had been extensively remodeled in 1946 with many of the ornamental features removed. The brick will be cleaned. The replacement windows as submitted in the packet are not appropriate. Wood windows are preferred. Wood windows were being installed in Charlie Trainer's project on the adjacent building and there should be consistency. There is an existing 1940s penthouse on the roof and the owner wants to enlarge it. There will also be a roll-up door on the penthouse. The National Park Service is reviewing the project for tax credits and the HPC can have input into that review by making recommendations.

Matt Jarosz indicated that the penthouse was very visible from a distance. It should have a consistent architectural treatment. Right now the penthouse looks half old and half new. If Cream City brick is used, there should be piers. If the material is not brick, then it should be designed as a curtain wall. Right now the design appears as storefront windows on the rooftop.

Pat Balon emphasized that wood windows were important for the uniformity of the renovations in the complex.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to table the item until the August meeting. The applicant is to bring back a revised submission with replacement windows that are acceptable in profile and depth, and with a design for the penthouse that either features an extension of the cream brick enclosure or a design that has a different veneer and long wide windows instead of the hybrid presented today. The motion carried unanimously.

D. Certificate of appropriateness for new 3-car detached garage at 930 N. 34th St. (Concordia Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project. The HPC had already approved demolition of the old garage at a prior meeting. The owner combined two lots and is building the new structure to the north of the house. The new garage will have the appearance of a carriage barn.

Erin Lanham, consultant, was recognized. She indicated that the owner will be storing vintage cars in the building and that it will have a car lift on the interior.

Matt Jarosz questioned the siting of the building and that the turning radius might be too tight. There followed a brief discussion about where to pile the snow, if there will be room to maneuver and how far the building was from the lot line.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness per recommendations in the staff report. The motion carried unanimously.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Staff report relating to guidelines that provide for color jurisdiction for existing structures and new construction within local historic districts and sites.

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the HPC has had a long history (since it was established) reviewing materials like masonry and mortar in which the color is a permanent feature of the material. In contrast, the HPC does not review paint color on surfaces like wood, which will change over time. Staff thought the guidelines address these matters.

Deputy Commissioner Martha Brown reported that the HPC's review of recent new construction is what led to the discussion of what jurisdiction the HPC has over color. The wording in the guidelines, "consistent with the colors in the district", is vague. If the HPC wants authority to review color, the guidelines need to be amended to allow that or the definition of "consistent" needs to be clarified. The HPC has no authority to dictate a color to an applicant the way the guidelines are currently written.

Commissioners thought that the guidelines were explicit enough. In matters of permanent materials, like brick, material samples have been reviewed for years and that included color. There has not been any problem until recently. On the Downer Avenue project the color was to be integral in the concrete but that was changed to a painted on finish. Matt Jarosz stated that the commission has not dictated color. When presented with a proposal, if the color was inappropriate, the commission pointed that out and asked the applicant to consider other options. The commission has not told the applicant to specifically choose a particular color. On the Downer project, the commissioners were shown samples and asked what they preferred. They did not select the color choices. The HPC likes to allow creativity. The guidelines are a framework; no specific heights, colors, etc. are called out.

Martha Brown agreed that currently, the HPC has the authority to review a proposal and point out inappropriate aspects.

Staff Carlen Hatala suggested that perhaps the guidelines could more specifically call out the characteristics of a district in terms of size, type of masonry or material, general overall color palette, and so on. That would back up the reference to "consistent with the colors in the district."

There was no formal vote but the commissioners felt the current guidelines were sufficient and they were following the guidelines.

Since the discussion was about guidelines, Sandra McSweeney asked whether or not the phrase "visible from the public right of way" could be stricken from the guidelines since the neighbors get to see and have to live with the other portions of the building unlike passers-by. Work done to the back should be as nice as work done to the front of a building. Owners should consider their neighbors.

City Attorney Greg Hagopian stated that the commission has to consider the right of the individual property owner as well as the neighbors.

Martha Brown indicated that removal of the phrase "visible from the public right of way" from the guidelines would have to go to the Common Council.

There was no formal vote taken on commissioner McSweeney's suggestion.

B. City new home catalogue. Briefing on the city's new catalogue of home designs.

Martha Brown passed around a copy of the new home catalogue prepared by the city. It will assist the buyers of vacant lots to choose a design that will fit their neighborhood. Two designs from the Preservation Portfolio are included in the catalogue.

C. There was a brief discussion about the staff certificate issued for 2604 N. Lake Drive. Paul Jakubovich indicated that the COA was for repair work. He explained that the owners have re-designed their addition so that it did not need to go to the Board of Zoning Appeals. Staff was waiting for the drawings.

D. Carlen Hatala reminded commissioners of the state historic preservation conference in Madison in September.

9. ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, August 11, 2008 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street

ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 5:01 PM.



Living with History

MINUTES APPROVED AS AMENDED
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, August 11, 2008, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:07 P.M.
Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown
Commissioners Excused: Matt Jarosz
Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster, Martha Brown

2. MINUTES

Approval of the July 14, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the July 14, 2008 meeting. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for two new houses and two rear coach houses between 114 and 134 E. Vine Street, now part of property addressed at 1823 N. Palmer St. (Brewers Hill Historic District) PTS#48544.

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the applicant wanted the item held as the submission packet was not complete for review.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to table the item in response to the owner's request. The motion carried.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovation and rooftop addition, Building #14 in the Pabst Complex (Pabst Brewery Historic District) PTS#51960.

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the owner is working to select appropriate windows and is modifying the rooftop addition and wanted the item held over until next month.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to table the item until the September meeting. The motion carried.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness for lighting fixtures and poles in the new parking structure in Block 4 of the Pabst Brewery Historic District PTS#50667

Staff Paul Jakubovich reviewed the lighting plan for the new parking ramp to be built in the Pabst Complex. The light poles will be located at the center of the roof to minimize light spillover and the poles will be 20 feet tall. Spillover will not impact the apartment residents who will be living in the adjacent Building No.9. The metal halide fixtures are high intensity and give off a clean white light, which is good for pedestrians and colors.

Ald. Bauman asked for a more understandable explanation than what was in the packets. Architect for the project, Kevin Mantz, passed out some new illustrations showing how the lighting will be handled on the different levels.

Ald. Bauman asked why the lighting was placed on poles rather than along the perimeter. Kevin Mantz indicated that it would be more expensive and less efficient to add 30 to 40 perimeter fixtures rather than 14 poles. He assured the commissioners that there would be a glow but not harsh lighting from the rooftop level.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the lighting plan as submitted. The motion carried with Sandra McSweeney voting in opposition. She wanted her objection on the record: she advocated soft lighting and she did not think pole lighting was appropriate for any building.

D. Change paving materials in pocket park pedestrian way approved in previous COA. (Pabst Brewery Historic District) PTS#49249

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the Commission had reviewed the pocket park at its March meeting. Pavers salvaged from the brewery complex were to be installed along the alleys or pedestrian walkways that extended from 10th to 11th Streets. The applicant has since determined that the installation of pavers exceeded their budget. The proposed substitute would consist of concrete with an exposed aggregate surface.

Ald. Bauman wanted to see samples of where this material has been installed before he could endorse it.

Pat Balon asked Kevin Mantz where pavers would be retained in the complex. Mr. Mantz indicated that pavers would be used for parts of the street in front of buildings No. 20 and 21 and as accents. He said Mr. Zilber had put in \$200,000 to cover cost overruns and that pavers at the pocket park would add \$60,000 to the cost. The pavers now belong to the city and would have to be purchased. Each of the two sections would cost \$15,000 to purchase.

Sandra McSweeney had seen this material used elsewhere but added that it could be ok but had to be finished off and maybe bordered with the salvaged pavers. Mr. Mantz replied there would be no borders and the aggregate and the color of the aggregate had not been chosen yet. He added that this type of material would be better for the plows in the winter.

Pat Balon informed the commissioners that she had been part of a field trip to Wilmette, Illinois, and that community found pavers to be more cost effective in the long run. Ann Pieper asked whether or not the applicant could simulate the look of brick pavers in the concrete. She also wanted to see a sample of the material.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to table the item and have the applicant identify a location at which the commissioners could view the aggregate concrete. The motion carried.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of existing 2-car detached garage and construction of new 2-car, detached frame garage to take its place at 2667 N. Summit Avenue (North Point North Historic District) PTS#52794

Staff Paul Jakubovich showed images of the Colonial Revival style house and the existing garage that sits at the southwest corner of the lot. The new garage would be wood sided and have doors that look like carriage doors or barn doors. They might be of steel.

The commissioners thought the proposed garage needed some change but otherwise met the design guidelines.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to approve the design of the new garage with the request to enhance the door area so that the design would not look so top heavy and the optional request for the owner to add a window to the blank left wall of the garage if the owner chooses. The motion carried.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the demolition of the existing garage under criterion D-2 of the North Point North Historic District guidelines, since it did not possess architectural significance, and D-6 because a new and more compatible garage will be built on the site. The motion carried.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for new storefront at 1230 E. Brady Street. (Brady Street Historic District) PTS#52419

Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project. There will not be a complete removal and rebuilding of the inappropriate 1980s storefront due to budget concerns. However, more window openings will be added, awnings will be installed and the remaining light brick will be painted to match the rest of the building.

Commissioners did not feel that the proposal matched up to the other renovations on Brady Street and suggested that the owner apply for a façade grant. At the very least there needs to be detail added to the entrances to define them.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to hold the item over until the design was improved with the suggestions made by the commissioners to define the entries. The motion carried.

8. OTHER BUSINESS

Informational presentation on the restoration of the Goll House, 1550 N Prospect Avenue, and construction of a new 27-story condominium tower behind it. (Note: the Historic Preservation Commission will not take any action on this item at this meeting)

Chair Pat Balon introduced this item by saying that this was an information presentation only and that there would be no public comment taken at this time. The public is free to submit comments in writing to DCD to the attention of Pat Balon. There will be future meetings at which the public may speak. One letter was received about this matter and Pat Balon had it entered into the record. She indicated that there had not yet been an application submitted for a COA for this proposal. Pat Balon asked Paul to give a brief background.

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the Goll house had received local historic designation in 2002 and that it was part of a National Register historic district. The house was designed by Ferry & Clas and took as its source 17th century Elizabethan/Jacobean architecture. The house has remained essentially intact but for the removal of the bargeboards.

Architect Scott Kindness was recognized. He indicated that Russell Zimmermann was also present to speak about the restoration of the mansion.

Mr. Kindness shows images of Prospect Avenue and emphasized that the mansion will be restored, not demolished or relocated. Mr. Kindness reported that it is a stretch to say the new proposed 27-story tower meets the Goll House guidelines in regards to scale, but he thinks other guidelines have been met with regards to the restoration of the mansion. He reported that he has been meeting with various groups for guidance: the National Trust for Historic Preservation, Jim Sewell at the State Historic Preservation office, the Milwaukee Preservation Alliance, Randy Bryant, DCD staff [note: not Historic Preservation staff], and Jim Shields, who once sat on the HPC.

Among his points:

- ❖ The Goll House will keep its identity from the street.
- ❖ The new tower is pushed back so that the mansion has presence to the street.
- ❖ The new tower is tall and narrow
- ❖ The connector will be delicate and will not be visible from the street
- ❖ The lower 5 levels are parking. A “drawer” like element is extended forward from this plinth and is given an architectural treatment to tie it in with the mansion and serve like a coach house.
- ❖ There will be two units per floor.
- ❖ The east retaining wall is 40-foot to 50-foot away from the bike path. It continues along the bluff and is deteriorated in parts.
- ❖ There will be a fitness center with windows overlooking the lake/bike path. They are proposing a veranda and lighting and want this to be an animated façade.

Mr. Russell Zimmermann was recognized. He reported that he had included the Goll House in his book Magnificent Milwaukee. If he had to design a tower on this site and preserve the mansion, this is the way he would have chosen. He referenced the Villard Mansions in New York City as an example where a mansion was connected to a high rise. The Villard Mansions now serve as the lobby for the development and also provide meeting rooms.

Among Mr. Zimmermann's points:

- ❖ There will be suites for guests in the Goll House.

- ❖ The ballroom can be used for entertaining as a special privilege of condo ownership.
- ❖ The house has not experienced many injustices over time but has been sandblasted which roughened up the brick
- ❖ A judicious pruning of the tree out front, or its removal, would reveal the house to foot and vehicular traffic.
- ❖ The porch is in good condition. The stone can be reset. The foundation is solid. It is recommended that the bushes be removed.
- ❖ The east (rear or lake) elevation will experience some changes. The narrow window on the left will be relocated to the “drawer” or parking plinth. The hood and entrance will be moved over to the left and provide access for the connector to the tower.
- ❖ The south side had a large open terrace from maps. To symbolically show where the terrace had been, the wall will be opened up and a balustrade will be built replicating the front porch.
- ❖ The south side bargeboards were removed. Some of it has been salvaged. Some was cut up into many small sections. In answer to a question when the bargeboard was removed, staff Carlen Hatala replied that it occurred in 2002 right before the hearing for historic designation.
- ❖ A leader head from the north side will be relocated to the southwest corner of the house.
- ❖ Interior work will consist of removing partition walls, stripping the limed finish applied to the woodwork in the 1950s, removing the upstairs firewall, removing the acoustical tile from the ballroom ceiling.

In answer to a question about the timetable for the restoration vs. the new construction, Mr. Kindness replied that there is no detailed schedule yet. A lot would depend on the pre-sales. There will be 35 units at most. The project could start in late spring 2009 and take 21 to 24 months. The new owners will want access to the Goll House when they move in.

In answer to a question about how Mr. Kindness felt the proposal met with the preservation guidelines he responded that the goal was to preserve the mansion. They were looking at tax credits for the exterior and interior work. A quick read of the proposed tower shows that they are not companions.

Martha Brown added that there are three parts to the submission: 1) the construction of the 27-story tower. She stated that it is hard to imagine that in scale with the 3-story house if you look just at the house and not the block. 2) There is the restoration of the mansion. 3) There is the connector between the two buildings. She suggested two ways that the commission could review the proposal. One way would be to be to consider the restoration and connector as appropriate with the tower and its scale as not meeting guidelines. The commission would then not suggest any design changes to the tower. The second way the commission could review the proposal would be to see it as a trade-off with the new construction making possible the restoration of the historic house.

Staff Paul Jakubovich said looking at the proposal as three parts was a good way to look at it. The urban environment [of New York City and the Villard Houses] was not, however, a good analogy to this particular project.

Pat Balon asked if Mr. Kindness would be submitting a COA application in time for the September 15th HPC meeting. He replied yes.

Pat Balon stated that a special meeting of the HPC had been discussed so that the HPC could review the project before the City Plan Commission would review it. She stated this would be the proper manner of scheduling. It poses a problem to have both meetings scheduled the same day. The HPC, however, could not schedule a special meeting until the COA application came in.

There was a discussion about the deadline for a special meeting and Paul Jakubovich said a submission a week in advance would be good. The HPC would need a couple days to review the submission packet before the special meeting.

Ald. Bauman suggested a joint meeting of the City Plan Commission and the HPC so that there wouldn't have to be repeats and that it was all done at the same time.

Paul Jakubovich said we have not done that before. Martha Brown said that the commissions have different issues but it could work and now was the time to try. Ann Pieper Eisenbrown had no comment. Pat said the matter had to go before HPC first.

Sandra McSweeney had questions about the number of stories and the lot line setbacks but Pat Balon said this was a premature discussion.

In answer to Sandra McSweeney's question about why a zoning change was needed and did it meet zoning now, Vanessa Koster answered that it had to do with setbacks from the rear and sides, and that a wedding cake appearance would result under current zoning.

Staff Carlen Hatala asked how far away from the Goll House would the new tower be constructed. Mr. Kindness answered 8 feet. Carlen Hatala replied that as a frame of reference, the Ward Yard building on Humboldt is 12 feet away from the new condo building behind it.

Martha Brown asked whether or not there was a model of the proposal. Mr. Kindness said no.

Ald. Bauman asked how Mr. Zimmermann got involved in the project as some were saying he was being duped. Mr. Zimmermann said he was contacted by Scott Kindness. He has not been duped. They have been discussing what to do, how to do it right. He is being paid for his time. This is not pro-bono. In answer to Pat Balon's question as to whether he has been contracted to do the restoration or is just advisory, Mr. Zimmermann said he is advising, not under contract and that has not been discussed. Scott Kindness added that the project has not been approved yet.

There was discussion about setbacks along Prospect Avenue, sightlines and the bike path. Ald. Bauman stated that the owner has the right to build to the limits of his property.

Pat Balon asked Scott Kindness when he would be willing to meet with Paul Jakubovich and get his submission in. Paul Jakubovich added that the submission must be in 11 days before the September 15th meeting. Carlen Hatala added that if there were to be a special meeting, before September 15th, the submission would need to be in earlier.
HPC Meeting

Pat Balon asked Martha Brown if the CPC meeting could be moved to October. Martha asked what was the concern about the HPC hearing the proposal after the CPC. Carlen Hatala stated that the HPC has expressed concerns that meeting after the CPC would box them in like Downer Avenue. Martha Brown replied that zoning allows a big building on that site, even with the Goll House on the property.

Ald. Bauman again urged a joint meeting of the CPC and the HPC.

Paul Jakubovich stated that he needs drawings for the restoration as part of the submission and that he was not comfortable meeting without proper time to study the submission. Maybe holding the meetings together could work.

Ald. Bauman again urged a joint meeting.

Carlen Hatala suggested a special meeting be held for the Goll house proposal because there was too much other business that needed to be scheduled on September 15th.

Martha Brown stated that September 15th would be the special meeting and that HPC would have to hold the regular meeting at another time.

Paul Jakubovich said that the CPC would have to have only the Goll House on the agenda and that he would need the drawings and specifications at least a couple of weeks in advance.

Sandra McSweeney said a joint meeting would be ok.

There was no formal motion on the matter of the joint meeting. Pat Balon asked DCD to handle the matter of scheduling a joint meeting.

In a change of topic, Sandy Ackerman asked if reflective glass was being used on City Hall since she remembered that reflective glass was not allowed. Paul Jakubovich replied that he thought there was to be a coating but that he would check into it.

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 5:20 P.M.
--



Department of City Development

City Plan Commission
Historic Preservation Commission
Neighborhood Improvement
Development Corporation
Redevelopment Authority

Rocky Marcoux
Commissioner

Martha L. Brown
Deputy Commissioner

**Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) and City Plan Commission (CPC)
Joint Meeting
Monday, September 15, 2008
Regular Meetings
1:30 PM
Milwaukee City Hall
200 E Wells Street, Room 301-B
Minutes**

The meeting was called to order by City Plan Commission chair, Patricia Najera, at 1:36 P.M.

1. Roll Call of CPC and Roll Call of HPC

Roll Call
Monday, September 15, 2008

Historic Preservation Commission:

Name	Attendance
Patricia Balon, Chair	present
Matthew Jarosz, Vice Chair	present
Sandra Ackerman	present
Ald. Robert Bauman	present
Ann Pieper-Eisenbrown	present
Sandra McSweeney	present

City Plan Commission:

Name	Attendance
Patricia Najera, Chair	present
Michal Dawson, Vice Chair	present
Whitney Gould	present
Larri Sue Jacquert	present
J. Allen Stokes	present; left before vote
Stephanie Bloomingdale	did not attend meeting
Gaurie Rodman	did not attend meeting

2. FOR CPC and HPC: Consideration of proposal regarding redevelopment of property at 1550 N. Prospect Ave.

Project presentation by New Land Enterprises' (owner's) representatives (architect Scott Kindness and H. Russell Zimmermann) and presentation of DCD staff report (DCD joint report to CPC and HPC) by Vanessa Koster and Martha Brown.

3. Public Hearing for CPC and DPD zoning.

File No. 080543. Ordinance relating to the change in zoning from Multi-Family Residential (RM7) to Detailed Planned Development (DPD) on land located at 1550 North Prospect Avenue, in the 4th Aldermanic District. This ordinance will allow for the construction of 35 condominium units in a 26-story structure. The zoning change is requested by New Land Enterprises.

There were eleven persons opposed to the project who wished to speak. There were twenty-one persons who registered their opposition to the proposal but who did not wish to speak. There were three persons who supported the project and who wished to speak. There were two persons who registered their support of the project but who did not wish to speak. There were eight persons who wanted to register their attendance and showed neither opposition nor support for the project. One person indicated he was neutral and wanted to speak.

4. Public comment for HPC regarding Certificate of Appropriateness.

Public comment was taken regarding New Land Enterprises' request for a certificate of appropriateness for exterior renovation and alterations at 1550 N. Prospect Ave. (Goll Mansion historic structure)

5. Discussion and Action by HPC regarding Certificate of Appropriateness.

THE MOTION: Ann Piper Eisenbrown moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions on which the building permits and occupancy permit will be based:

- 1) Tuckpointing must be limited to areas that actually need work. New mortar must match the original in terms of color, texture, hardness, joint width and joint finish. A sample tuckpoint panel must be reviewed and approved by HPC staff before the work begins.
- 2) The front porch must be rebuilt exactly to the original design and dimensions.
- 3) Provide shop drawings to HPC staff for leaded glass transom storm windows proposed for front elevation and new wood railings/balustrade proposed for south porch.
- 4) COA is issued with the understanding that construction and restoration work on the Goll House will be completed in accordance with the terms of the Memorandum of Agreement dated July 16, 2008, and signed by the developer and various representatives of the preservation community.

The motion carried with one commissioner, Sandra McSweeney, in opposition. She wanted her objections on the record:

- a) The new development connected to the Goll House did not meet the preservation guidelines
- b) The new development had a negative impact on the Goll House
- c) The connector was 6' from the east wall of the Goll House

- d) Windows at the rear of the mansion would be without daylight because of the proximity (6' away) of the high rise
- e) The parking structure is higher than the ridge line of the Goll House
- f) The parking structure is 6 stories high with solid wall surfaces on 4 sides
- g) Vegetation can not be a consideration of the design or façade of the garage
- h) A/C units are on the front face of the building and are visible from the street and the neighboring building

Earlier in the meeting, there had been some legal questions as to whether or not the Historic Preservation Commission had authority to review changes/new construction for the entire Goll House property or whether it was confined to changes to just the historic house.

Following the vote, each commissioner affirmed verbally that he/she had cast his/her vote assuming that the Commission was exercising the broader standard of review suggested by the National Trust for Historic Preservation and the applicant's legal counsel.

6. Discussion and Action by CPC regarding DPD Zoning

Staff Recommendation: Approve
By Commr: Gould

Motion to: Approve conditionally*
Second by: Dawson

*1. One, that the architects work with the Planning Department staff in tweaking the design of the garage to make it better integrated into the tower itself.

2. And the second condition would be, just to emphasize something that some of the Preservation commissioners were concerned about, that any changes in the design that affect the Goll Mansion should go back to the Preservation Commission.

7.THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the HPC meeting. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 5:42 P.M.

The meeting minutes were prepared jointly by Lynn Schiller who staffs the City Plan Commission and Carlen Hatala who staffs the Historic Preservation Commission.

Effective July 1, 2005, persons engaged in lobbying, as defined in Section 305-43-4, Milwaukee Code of Ordinances, are required to register with the City Clerk's Office License Division. More information is available at www.milwaukee.gov/lobby or by calling 414-286-2238. Upon reasonable notice, efforts will be made to accommodate the needs of disabled individuals through sign language interpreters or other auxiliary aids. **To request this service only**, contact Administration, 809 North Broadway, Milwaukee, WI 53202, 286-5939.



Living with History

MINUTES DRAFT
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
SPECIAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, September 29 2008, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:07 P.M.
Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney
Commissioners Excused: Ann Pieper Eisenbrown
Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

A. Approval of the August 11, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes.

Sandra McSweeney asked that the sentence "Sandra McSweeney said no." on page 7 paragraph 5 be deleted.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the August 11, 2008 meeting minutes as corrected. The motion carried.

B. Approval of the September 15, 2008 Joint City Plan Commission and Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes (already posted on the City Plan Commission website)

Sandra McSweeney asked who had prepared the joint meeting minutes and was informed that the City Plan Commission staff prepared them. Since there were additional questions and suggestions for changes to make the minutes more understandable, it was decided to postpone the approval of the minutes.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to postpone the approval of the September 15, 2008 joint meeting minutes. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Public Hearing on the Permanent Historic Designation of the Louis Auer & Son Houses at 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard.

Staff Carlen Hatala reviewed the nomination and which criteria appeared to apply to the nomination. Since the commissioners were familiar with the nomination, they dispensed with a slide presentation.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried unanimously.

There was no one present to speak at the hearing. The commissioners were satisfied that the nomination met two of the criteria of the ordinance.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried unanimously.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to recommend permanent historic designation based on criteria e-5 and 3-8 of the ordinance. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Public Hearing on the Interim Historic Designation Application of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave an overview of the building's history and significance. There was no staff recommendation but she pointed out that the two criteria that appeared most applicable were criteria e-3, identification with Dr. Nicholas Senn, internationally renowned surgeon who pioneered abdominal surgery and

e-9, the building is a visual landmark. Commissioners were urged to discuss the importance of the building within the parameters of the importance of Dr. Senn to Milwaukee and the degree to which the building is a familiar visual feature given its alterations.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried unanimously.

Staff Carlen Hatala swore in those wishing to testify.

The chair recognized those in favor of the interim designation.

David Somerscales, 2815 N. Humboldt Avenue, submitted the petition for interim designation. After summarizing his education and his experience living in other places, he indicated he was concerned over the loss of Milwaukee's historic buildings. Dr. Senn, with his credentials, could have practiced anywhere like Chicago or London, but chose to work out of Milwaukee. Since Milwaukee is currently looking for ways to promote itself to the world, why not emphasize its medical history. He stated that there needed to be a balance between progress and preserving our past. The proposed new tower could be anywhere; it should not be built at the expense of history. Mr. Somerscales also stated that he nominated the property out of personal reasons because he is in a local band and it was located in Sydney Hih in 2002. He had fond memories of the building. He urged the commission to support interim designation to recognize, honor and remember its past and not overlook its architectural history.

Ald. Bauman asked about Mr. Somerscales' occupation and whether or not he was involved in a labor dispute with Gatehouse Capitol. Mr. Somerscales responded that he was a union representative for five years, was aware of the disagreement with Gatehouse but that he was not involved in the matter.

The Chair recognized Kendall Baer, 400 N. 92nd Street. Mr. Baer was employed by the Milwaukee Journal in their advertising department. He would go out on his lunch breaks and sketch. He showed the commissioners the 1983 color image he produced of Sydney Hih showing its multi-color façade. He urged the developer incorporate the building into its development plans.

The Chair recognized Erma Johnson, 3875 N. 56th Street. She stated that she was a regular citizen of the city and that Sydney Hih was one of the buildings that drew her as a visitor to the city and still does now as a resident. She still takes visitors to the site. She went to the Mine Shaft restaurant as a teen. The building has ties to her African American heritage through the bead shop that was on the premises.

Ald. Bauman asked her occupation and whether or not she was a member of the hotel workers' union. She responded that she was a cashier supervisor in one of the hotels. She was a member of Local 122.

The Chair then recognized those in opposition to the interim designation.

The chair recognized Debby Tomczyk, a lawyer with the Reinhart Boerner Van Duren law firm that is representing Gatehouse Capitol. Developer Rob Ruvin and Adam Jelen from Gilbane Building Company were also present. Ms. Tomczyk stated they were opposed to the interim designation because the proposed hotel and condo tower required the demolition of the Sydney Hih Building. A historic designation would put the project in jeopardy. Ms. Tomczyk challenged criteria e-3 and e-9. She stated that although Dr. Senn was an incredible physician he spent only a third of his life in Milwaukee. He did not contribute to Milwaukee's development. Since there was no known architect, the Italianate Style was not well represented by this building. She felt that it was not significant that the Iron Brigade met in this building. She stated that the building had been altered over time and that Dr. Senn would not recognize the building today. It had not been eligible for National Register listing in 2000. The Park East Freeway left the building exposed. It did not have visual significance on its own.

Adam Jelen passed out interior photos of the complex and described the poor condition of the buildings, including the one in which there had been a fire. [Third building from corner—originally the Frankfurth Hardware Company Building] Ald. Bauman reminded him that the nomination was only for the corner building, the Senn Building, and not the entire complex. Mr. Jelen stated that they had examined all the buildings, found them structurally challenged and that were willing to reuse the brick in the proposed courtyard of the new development.

Rob Ruvin testified that he purchased the buildings three years ago and that they had been for sale for fifteen years. He said the Senn Building had a powerful past but was not structurally sound. His intent was to salvage portions.

Pat Balon challenged his assertion of structural issues by stating that she had heard him come before other meetings of the city and that this had never come up before.

Mr. Ruvin responded that it did not make sense to preserve a façade and there was not enough left to justify extreme measures to preserve the building.

Ms. Tomczyk stated that they were willing to put back a commemorative plaque at the site.

Sandra McSweeney asked about the developers' timeline. She wanted to know if construction would start next month or in five years. The interim designation was for 6 months. She asked whether or not there had been any pre-sales to date.

Rob Ruvin replied that they just opened a sales office at 5th Street and McKinley Avenue and were working on pre-sales.

Sandra McSweeney asked what the downside was for interim designation for them.

Ms. Tomczyk replied that Gatehouse had already spent eight million dollars on the project with the architectural drawings, fees and engineering reports. Interim designation would be an obstacle.

Sandra McSweeney asked when would construction begin if sales went well. Would it be five years?

Rob Ruvin replied it could be next year and the interim designation would be an obstacle.

Sandra McSweeney stated that the interim designation does not appear to be a huge obstacle.

Ald. Bauman asked if there was anything in place to start demolition within thirty days and would the developer be willing to let the building stand until there were sufficient pre-sales and they were about to break ground. He said he was in support of the interim designation but would consider tabling it a cycle.

Mr. Ruvin said he would not be demolishing the building yet and was ok with tabling the matter.

Becky Rabatin from DNS spoke about violations. There were orders on the Gipfel but not Sydney Hih. Staff Carlen Hatala added that she had checked permits and violations last week and there were none.

Sandra McSweeney asked about the status of the Gipfel since it was sitting on a flatbed behind the Sydney Hih complex. It was originally to have been moved onto the site of the building furthest west but that fell through.

Rob Ruvin said he was looking at sites for the Gipfel, it would be saved, but that he could not disclose the locations.

Chair Pat Balon read into the record that Mary Beth White, 520 W. McKinley Avenue, was against the proposal but did not wish to speak. Chris Poehlman was undecided but wanted to be kept informed of future actions.

Matt Jarosz recommended tabling the designation for a cycle since there was too much going on. He stated that the commission has to look at the criteria in our ordinance and that our ordinance was different from the Federal standards [for National Register listing]. Particularly, criteria e-9 separates us from federal standards. Like it or not, everyone in the city knows Sydney Hih and the building clearly fulfills this criteria. He expressed concerns over the uncertainty of the proposed development. He reminded commissioners and the public of the Gugler Lithographic Co. Building where the Common Council overturned the interim designation. The building was demolished and the development never occurred. The site is now for sale. Had the building remained, a new owner could possibly have utilized it. He also referenced a project in the Third Ward at Menomonee and Milwaukee Streets. The owner had proposed a five or six story at the site. The financing fell through but the building is still there and is now being restored.

Ald. Bauman stated he supported tabling the item since there was no imminent threat of demolition and the commission would accept the developer's word that they would not take it down yet. He stated that he thought this was one of Milwaukee's iconic buildings of Milwaukee's counter culture, it was mostly intact and its significant architectural details were intact. He also said he felt the HPC can be abused and said the union peace agreement was being worked on so the timing of the nomination was suspect. He was surprised the building had not been designated before. He supported interim designation but tabling it was ok. He added that a \$150,000,000 project outweighs historic preservation for the Common Council and that it would take 10 votes to overturn a decision.

Matt Jarosz stated that a designation covered just the exterior and not the interior, and that a corner fabric building is important to the HPC. He stated that he was suspicious of the outside funding that went into the evaluation of the condition of the buildings. That kind of evaluation tends to be negative and give costs that are not realistic.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the public hearing until the next meeting. The motion carried unanimously. Note: Sandy Ackerman had left the meeting ill during the public hearing.

5. **OLD BUSINESS**

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for storefront changes at 1230 E. Brady St. (Brady Street Historic District) PTS#52419

Staff Carlen Hatala gave an overview of the revised design. Commissioners wanted more detail on the pilasters and doors than was shown on the submittal.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to table the item until more detail drawings were submitted. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for change of paving material for the pedestrian way in the Pabst Pocket Park (Pabst Brewery Historic District) PTS#49249

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a brief overview of the proposal to change the Pocket Park's paving material to concrete.

Dan McCarthy, Michael Mervis, and Kevin Mantz were recognized. Dan McCarthy cited budget concerns as the motivating reason behind the change in materials. He added that the pavers they originally proposed and that were approved by the HPV were not pedestrian friendly because they were uneven and posed a liability issue for those in wheel chairs, women in heels and those using canes. Pavers would be installed at key vehicular locations. A brick sidewalk would be installed at Buildings 21 and 22 to replicate a brick sidewalk located there originally. There is no evidence that pavers were found in the alleys of the complex.

Matt Jarosz and Ald. Bauman stated that the HPC had given concessions to the Pabst (silo signage) and they had demolished Building 11 so they supported pavers in the walkways here as was originally approved.

Pat Balon reminded the commissioners of the trip made to Wilmette, Illinois that demonstrated that pavers installed in the streets were less costly to maintain in the long run.

Ald. Bauman suggested a number of tradeoffs since once the walkways/alleys were paved with concrete, it would be expensive to return them to pavers later on. He urged the developers to do as much as they could to honor their historic commitment. He stated that there had been pavers in the alleys originally because there was no poured concrete then. Some of his suggestions included: 1) not develop the entire park right away so that they could afford the pavers; 2) extend the pavers on 10th Street beyond Buildings 21 and 22; 3) use pavers on just a portion of the alley/walkways bordering the park on the north and south.

After consultation about the suggestions, Michael Mervis, Dan McCarthy and Kevin Mantz said they could install pavers along the north and south borders of the pocket park as long as the city would hold the developer harmless and the city would give them the pavers. The remainder of the alley/walkways would be paved with dark charcoal colored concrete and scored for expansion.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved to approve the installation of pavers in the portions of alley/walkways that border the pocket park to the north and south. The pavers would extend west from the sidewalk that borders the park to the east and stop at the west end of the park. The remainder of the alley/walkways, to the west, would be paved with charcoal colored concrete. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness for rooftop addition, Building #14 in the Pabst Complex (Pabst Brewery Historic District) PTS#51960.

Staff Carlen Hatala presented the staff report that recommended approval of new wood windows and a new design for the rooftop addition that reflected the comments from the commissioners at a prior HPC meeting.

Jay Knetter from Zimmerman Architectural Studios was recognized. He indicated that they will use custom Marvin windows, made of wood, designed to look like double hung windows with true offsets. They would not be operable because the building renovation is a speculative project and the building will be heated and cooled mechanically. Commissioners thought the windows would be appropriate for Building # 14.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to approve wood windows with detail drawings and specifications to be approved by staff before the Certificate of Appropriateness was issued. The motion carried unanimously.

The commissioners next reviewed the new rooftop addition, designs for which were submitted at the meeting. Jay Knetter indicated that the addition was now more linear, had more glass, and was pulled back further from the parapet.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz made a motion to approve design of the rooftop addition that was submitted at the meeting, to approve wood windows in the rooftop addition, with staff to approve all final detail drawings. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Jay Knetter asked the commissioners for feedback on the design of the railing at the east entrance. He indicated that the landscape firm D.I.R.T. has designed an alternative railing that would tie into the pocket park. It was not part of the submission to the HPC. Mr. Knetter was not sure that would be appropriate for this industrial building. The railing he showed in the packet was very minimal and he wanted something better. Matt suggested that Mr. Knetter work with staff. There was also a brief discussion of the doors. They will be of wood.

Chair Pat Balon asked if anyone was present for Item 6A. Since no was present, she asked commissioners if there was any objection to considering Item 6B, Building # 15 next. There was no objection.

6B. Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovation of building #15, 1245 N. 11th St. (Pabst Brewery Historic District) PTS#38584

Jay Knetter asked for direction on Building #15. He said they would use wood windows, there would be wood garage doors that were operable (the one at Building #14 was fixed). They plan to reopen window openings that have been blocked up.

Commissioners stated that they thought the project was moving in the right direction, wood windows were acceptable, and recommended that the architect find period appropriate garage doors for the building and lighting. Mr. Knetter added that he will come back next time with detail drawings, including the south elevation where WE Energies has regulations about where wall openings can be located due to the installation of electrical equipment.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to give preliminary approval to the proposed restoration of Building #15 with final details to come back to the commission for approval. The motion carried unanimously.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of garage at 935 N. 34th St. (Concordia Historic District) PTS#53782

Staff Carlen Hatala presented the staff report. There are no drawings yet for a new replacement garage.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to hold over the item. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness for new parking lot and street wall/planting box at 922 E. Brady St. (Brady Street Historic District) PTS#53468

Staff Carlen Hatala summarized the project. The proposal is to renovate an existing lot that was used for equipment storage and convert it into a parking lot for customers for Glorioso Brothers Market. Staff recommended approval with the conditions of thin mortar joints, Bedford stone caps, wood or metal fencing along the west and north lot lines, and boxwoods for the planting area.

Jose Dominguez, representative of the owner, was present. He stated he welcomed the staff recommendations. The planter box keeps the street edge. There will be stone caps on the piers, a wood fence will be installed in place of the chain link. The gates will be manually operable but kept open during the day.

Dennis Burgener was recognized. He had questions about the project related to nighttime parking, the location of dumpsters or garbage carts, light pollution and the fence design. He preferred a building be constructed on the site but acknowledged that parking was permitted by the city.

In answer to his questions Mr. Dominguez indicated that night parking spaces would be rented to area residents, there would not be vehicle or boat or trailer storage taking place, there would be no dumpsters or garbage carts, and the lighting was low voltage, on the fence and piers with no spillage onto the adjacent properties. The wood fence design was based on Paul Jakubovich's recommendation.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the project with the recommendations of staff. Should BOZA require any changes to the project, it will come back to the HPC. The motion carried unanimously.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT

The public will be allowed to comment on any of the above-listed agenda items.

8. OTHER BUSINESS

Formation of a task force to make recommendations on the disposition of ornamental terra cotta elements salvaged from City Hall. Members of the Milwaukee Arts Board will also be involved in the task force.

[Ald. Bauman left the meeting at approximately 6 P.M. and there was no quorum to conduct further business]

Chair Pat Balon asked staff to provide the commissioners with more information about the formation of a task force and disposition of the City Hall artifacts.

9. ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Update on proposal for two new houses and two rear coach houses between 114 and 134 E. Vine Street, now part of property addressed at 1823 N. Palmer St. (Brewers Hill Historic District) PTS#48544. Plans are not yet finished.

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the project had stopped at this point so probably would not be back to the HPC soon.

B. Update and approval of minor changes to the garage portion of the tower (west elevation) on 1550 N. Prospect (Goll House Historic Building)

Vanessa Koster read the motion made by the HPC at the joint CPC/HPC meeting held on September 15, 2008. The CPC's motion had requested a change to the base of the new condo tower. She reviewed the meeting held with Whitney Gould and the changes that were recommended. The commissioners were presented images that reflected the alterations requested. There were some questions about why the Goll House development had enclosed parking and the Downer parking ramp had to be open but since there was no quorum, commissioners did not want to discuss this item further.

C. Other

Sandra McSweeney questioned the staff COA #15 2590 N. Downer Avenue signage and #21 the installation of a rear skylight at 2648 N. Summit Avenue. The signage at 2590 N. Downer Avenue was for the pedestrian and vehicular entrances to the parking ramp and was a routine staff approval since the signage was appropriate. Sandra McSweeney requested that all skylights be reviewed by the HPC in the future.

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, October 13, 2008 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street

10. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, that chair adjourned the meeting at 6:16 P.M. as there was no quorum to vote on adjournment.



Living with History

**MINUTES
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, October 13 2008, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall**

**Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown**

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:10 PM.
Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown
Commissioners Absent: Ald. Bauman (excused), Matt Jarosz
Staff Present: Martha Brown, Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES

A) Approval of the September 29, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting minutes.

Only two of the commissioners at today's meeting were present on September 29th and there was not a quorum to vote on approval.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman voted to hold over approval of the September 29, 2008 meeting minutes. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Approval of the September 15, 2008 Joint City Plan Commission and Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes (already posted on the City Plan Commission website)

Revised minutes from this meeting were handed out to the commissioners at this meeting. There was not sufficient time to see if the requested revisions were made.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to hold over approval of the September 15, 2008 meeting minutes. The motion carried unanimously.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Reconvene Public Hearing on the Interim Historic Designation Application of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih)

The owners requested that the public hearing remain adjourned. Commissioners questioned how long a public hearing for interim designation can stay adjourned. Martha Brown said that the department would look into this.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to continue the adjourned public hearing for one cycle. The motion carried unanimously.

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. Modification to previously issued COA for the Downer Parking Ramp at 2590 N. Downer Avenue. (Downer Avenue Historic District) PTS# 40911

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the applicant's request for a change in color from green to white (on the applied panels) as well as a minor modification to the storefront muntin pattern, the installation of an ATM machine and a change to the entry doors at the corner retail space.

Architect Matt Rinka was recognized. He represented the tenant, Associated Bank.

There followed a discussion about whether or not the rear or east elevation was to be included in the discussion. [The rear/east elevation was to have had the scored panels painted green. They have not been painted at all. Whether or not they would be painted white or painted at all was a question.] Matt Rinka indicated that the east elevation would have no color unless the neighbors would request it and that he was not responsible for color on

that wall. In response to a question by Pat Balon, Paul Jakubovich indicated that the neighbors who faced the rear of the building found the east elevation dark. They thought a lighter color or maybe a green screen could work although it is acknowledged that a green screen would be a maintenance issue. There was discussion about whether or not there should be paint at the chamfered edge of the elevation visible from Belleview, the portion where the drive through is located. Matt Rinka indicated that he had no authority to determine color for the drive through area.

Martha Brown suggested that the commissioners vote on the changes requested in the COA application and that staff consult with the owner about the east elevation and the drive through area on the north elevation.

Commissioners thought the requested changes to the door, the windows and the installation of the ATM machine were appropriate.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and _____ seconded a motion to approve the color and other changes according to the recommendation of staff and to check with the owner about the chamfered wall at the drive through, the east elevation and color of the awnings. The motion carried unanimously.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for the renovation of two storefronts in the Mulkern Building, 2624 and 2632 N. Downer Avenue. (Downer Avenue Historic District) PTS# 54374

Staff Paul Jakubovich reviewed the new storefront design. They will have recessed entries, wood doors, thin corners, and black granite bulkheads.

Architect Matt Rinka was recognized. He added that this prototype storefront will be used in future storefronts when the tenants need to remodel or when leases are up.

The commissioners thought the new storefront design was appropriate.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the storefront design. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for the relocation of the masonry gatehouse/guardhouse that once stood at the top of the reservoir at Kilbourn/Reservoir Park, 626 E. North Avenue and 701 E. Garfield (Kilbourn/Reservoir Park Historic District)

Martha Brown indicated that Water Works Superintendent Carrie Lewis has requested for this item to be held so that it could be discussed further. The commissioners were in agreement. There was no formal motion to hold over the item.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Follow up on storefront renovation at 1230 E. Brady Street, (Brady Street Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the owner has decided not to proceed with storefront renovations at this time. There will be new signage and awnings and they will be staff reviewed. The upper level metal will be painted.

B. Follow up on disposition of the salvaged terra cotta elements from City Hall.

Martha Brown reported that Ald. Murphy, chair of the Arts Board, wants to move ahead on this matter. A task force or volunteers from the Arts Board and the Historic Preservation Commission will work together on the disposition of the artifacts. Commissioner Sandra McSweeney volunteered to serve on the task force. Gary Peterson, head of the Marketing Department, will be contacting the volunteers when a meeting is scheduled.

8. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandy Ackerman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 3:55 PM.



Living with History

MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

Monday, November 10 2008, 3:00 PM

Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Pat Balon, Chair

Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair

Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,

Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:10 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Martha Brown

2. MINUTES

A. Approval of the September 15, 2008 Joint City Plan Commission and Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes (already posted on the City Plan Commission website)

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the September 15, 2008 meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Approval of the September 29, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Special Meeting Minutes.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the September 29, 2008 meeting. The motion carried with Sandy Ackerman and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown abstaining. Commissioner Ackerman had to leave the meeting during the public hearing and Commissioner Eisenbrown was absent.

C. Approval of the October 13, 2008 Historic preservation Commission Meeting Minutes.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the October 13, 2008 meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Reconvene Public Hearing on the Interim Historic Designation Application of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih)

Martha Brown indicated that the city attorney had not yet rendered an opinion as to how long the public hearing could remain adjourned. She gave the commissioners handouts that listed three options: continue the adjournment of the public hearing, complete the public hearing and vote on the interim designation, should the commission vote against designation, a member of the public could appeal after posting \$10,000 bond.

Sandra McSweeney stated it was not fair to the public or to the owner to keep scheduling the hearing each month and then hold it over. Pat Balon stated it was important to have the city attorney's opinion. Commissioners Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz and Sandy Ackerman said they had no objection to holding over the hearing. Sandra McSweeney asked that the city attorney provide an opinion within the next 30 days.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to keep the hearing adjourned for another cycle. The motion carried unanimously.

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. Certificate of appropriateness for exterior rehabilitation of Building #15 (Pabst Brewery Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich reviewed the status of the COA application. Brick cleaning and repointing had already been approved with a staff COA. Some original wood windows remain, which are being used as templates for the new replacements. Mr. Jakubovich pointed out that the southernmost bay on the first floor once had a segmental opening.

The chair recognized Jay Knetter from the Zimmerman Architectural Studios. There were some discrepancies between submitted drawings, different versions of the elevations and a photo of an extant door. After discussion, it was agreed that the new service doors would match the original existing service door. The new doors will be fixed, made of wood, and on Building 14, there would be a clerestory. The two door openings on Building 15 were of different heights and this variation will be kept. Mr. Jakubovich indicated that the wagon doors at Building 15 were probably windows originally as seen in the evidence of segmental arches. It will be appropriate, however, to keep the wagon doors.

There was a discussion about the new wood replacement windows. The drawings submitted in the COA packet showed a stepped sill. Wood windows with a single sill will be fabricated. Mr. Knetter will submit new drawings to HPC staff. In response to a question about storms and screens, Mr. Jakubovich replied that there had been some evidence of screens on Building 10 and that interior storms would be installed at that project. The intent is to have unified wood windows throughout all the buildings being restored/rehabbed. After discussion about the reinstallation of windows where they had been blocked up, it was agreed that the reopened windows would meet the height of the originals and that the belt course would be restored.

The applicant will bring back designs of the railing that will go on the east side of the building. The medallion in the stepped gable will be kept as is and not restored.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved to approve the COA with the clarification that the wagon doors replicate the original one found at the building, that the two lintels did not have to line up, that the sill of the window on the second floor be moved up in alignment with the adjacent windows and the replacement windows be of wood to match the originals. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

6. NEW BUSINESS

Staff Paul Jakubovich had to leave the room. Item 6A was held and the commissioners listened to a report from Maria Pandazzi on the status of the restoration of the American System Built House at 2714 W. Burnham Street. Ms. Pandazzi is the president of Frank Lloyd Wright Wisconsin. She urged the commissioners to visit the property to observe the work in progress. The front porch had been removed and the stucco had been removed. Re-stuccoing will have to wait until spring 2009 since the granite aggregate for the stucco was not available at the present time. Matt Jarosz indicated that the stucco seen recently on the house had been a ¾ inch cementitious finish applied over the original stucco. There had been deliberation over whether to take the finish off and restore the original stucco layer or to remove all of the stucco. It was decided to remove all of the stucco. Maria Pandazzi added that the original stucco had asbestos in it. In response to a question by Ald. Bauman, she added that the restoration is costing \$550 per square foot. [Note: accurate figures were presented after the meeting] Matt Jarosz added that this house was being restored to museum quality but that the others were not. The restoration is drawing visitors from around the world.

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum trim installed without a COA at 3123-25 N. Sherman Blvd. (North Sherman Boulevard Historic District). PTS#54791

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the soffits and trim were clad in metal and the matter was brought to the attention of staff through a neighborhood complaint. He referred the commissioners to the guidelines for the Sherman Boulevard Historic District.

Ald. Bauman asked whether the HPC has been consistent in enforcing the guidelines against aluminum trim. Mr. Jakubovich replied yes, and that in some instances there is voluntary compliance in returning the building to its original appearance. He cited an example on nearby Grant Boulevard where contractors were installing dormers without permits or a COA. After discussion with them, they are removing the dormers.

The owner of 3123-3125 N. Sherman Boulevard, Carol Rubitsky, was recognized. She stated that she owns a number of properties, including a house on Washington Boulevard. She tries to maintain all properties at the same level. She is not an absentee owner, does not flip property, and balances the needs of the property with its historic importance. She makes sure her contractors do better than a "ghetto job" on her buildings. She has owned this property since 1990. The preservation guidelines did not seem to exclude the work she did on the property. She thought that since there were no changes to the property, a COA wasn't needed. She added that the wood trim had needed work and to take it off would result in damage to the stucco and slates. She emphasized that she and her husband were fighting deterioration and blight. She said the guidelines were ambiguous.

Pat Balon said the local historic district was created after she had ownership of the property. She said she thought the Sherman Park Neighborhood Association emphasized the historic districts and the need for COAs. She said the HPC staff was a good resource for consulting when there were questions about how to do repairs.

DNS staff person Rebecca Rabatin was recognized. She had written up the orders on the building. She said she would follow up on the fence complaint brought up by Mrs. Rubitsky at this meeting.

Sandra McSweeney said it was tough for the HPC to hear her story. She added that the HPC has to be consistent with enforcing guidelines. Sherman Boulevard was high profile.

Others have asked to use aluminum trim and have been denied. It was not fair to her neighbors or the neighborhood to approve this work. She was being treated the same as everybody else.

Ald. Bauman stated that he lived in a historic district in a house older than hers and that he had to abide by the guidelines.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to deny the COA for aluminum trim. The motion carried.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Follow up on application to demolish the garage at 935 N. 34th Street. (Concordia Historic District)

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the owner has decided to repair the existing garage and not build a new one so this item will not be back to the commission.

B. Status of the National Historic Landmark nomination for the Northwestern Branch National Home for Disabled Volunteer Soldiers (now the Clement J. Zablocki Medical Center also referred to as the Soldiers Home)

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the National Historic Landmark designation was closer to being approved. Milwaukee is one of four veterans' centers that illustrate the evolution of the delivery of federal health care to veterans.

C. Staff updates on preservation projects.

In response to a question by Pat Balon, Paul Jakubovich reported that the roof at the MacLaren Mansion was still not resolved. The state hired Wiss, Janney, Elstner Associates to evaluate the roof. Their conclusion was that the slates were "bad" and did not have many years left. However, they are engineers and not experts in roofing. Mr. Jakubovich recommended that they get a slate specialist to make the evaluation.

Staff Carlen Hatala referred commissioners to staff approved COA number 6. The pocket park paving had changed again. The developer and Ald. Bauman worked out another solution other than what the HPC approved at the last meeting. The paving will be concrete with bands of granite pavers instead of all granite pavers. Ald. Bauman stated he thought this was an acceptable change.

8. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 4:26 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, December 15 2008, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Pat Balon, Chair
Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:05 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Vanessa Koster, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES

Approval of the November 10, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the November 10, 2008 meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Reconvene Public Hearing on the Interim Historic Designation Application of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih) (6th Ald. District)

The commission recognized Bruce Block from the firm of Reinhart Boerner. He indicated that the developer is moving ahead with the project and that the nominator might be withdrawing his petition for interim designation.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to keep the public hearing adjourned. The motion carried.

B. Public hearing on the historic designation of the George A. Sievers House at 3173 S. 31st Street. (8th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave an overview on the history of the property and indicated that the house appeared to meet criteria e-5 of the Historic Preservation ordinance.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

There was no one present to speak on the nomination.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to recommend historic designation based on criteria e-5. Matt Jarosz made a friendly amendment to the motion. He stated that he grew up across the street from the Sievers House at 3132 S. 31st Street. It was recognized by all as being the nicest and most unique house on the block especially designed for its lot. He wanted to add criteria e-9 to the recommendation, "Its unique location as a singular physical characteristic which represents an established and familiar feature of a neighborhood, community, or of the City of Milwaukee." The motion carried unanimously with criteria e-5 and e-9 being cited.

5. **OLD BUSINESS**

6. **NEW BUSINESS**

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement windows at 2600-2602 E. Bradford Avenue (North Point North Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the proposal. The owners want to install a vinyl bay window on each story of the front façade. The proposal changes the aesthetics of the duplex and is not a like-with-like repair.

Owner Lauren Bergin and her father Steve Bergin were recognized. They wanted to install the new bays for aesthetic reasons as well as energy efficiency. Since the duplex is not as old as some of the buildings in the historic district, they thought their building was exempt from the guidelines. There are currently aluminum gutters and storms on the building but the windows are wood.

Ald. Bauman indicated that vinyl windows would cheapen the look of the duplex and would not result in savings. He suggested the use of insulated glass.

Pat Balon added that owners should educate themselves before submitting a COA application and that staff Paul Jakubovich is a good resource to help with what is appropriate.

Matt Jarosz pointed out that a bay window would not work well on the first floor because it would be blocked by the bump out at the entrance. Getting a better view would not happen. He said staff could help and possibly save them money.

Sandra McSweeney suggested installing a new window with one large pane flanked by sidelights as an option for a new front window.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion carried unanimously.

The owner agreed to work with staff on an alternative option.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for parking lot, landscaping, and gazebo at 611 W. historic Mitchell Street (Mitchell Street Historic District) (12th Ald. District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the conversion of the building into housing was phase one of the project and that the creation of an improved parking lot was phase two. The commissioners were referred to the drawings in their packets. Many of the elements of the parking lot, such as the planting of trees, were dictated by city ordinance. Mr. Jakubovich recommended a fascia board or some trim for the gazebo.

In answer to questions by the commissioners, Mr. Jakubovich indicated that the parking lot would be for the residents of the building, the gazebo would not be visible from Mitchell Street and that there would be a wood fence.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the project with the recommendations made by staff. The motion carried unanimously.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Change in the Cream of the Cream City Awards

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the Cream of the Cream City Awards would no longer be a stand alone program of the HPC. It would become a category of the Mayor's Design Awards. Matt Jarosz suggested that the category be listed first during the program so as not to get lost in the ceremony. Vanessa Koster indicated that his suggestion would be taken into account. She added that perhaps the HPC could showcase Historic Preservation Month in another way with displays or with a joint program with the Milwaukee County Historical Society or Historic Milwaukee. Vanessa Koster indicated that the merger into the Mayor's awards would get more recognition for historic preservation. Pat Balon stated that the Cream of the Cream City Awards had been initiated by the HPC and she did not want it to get lost in the shuffle of the other awards. She asked if the commission would still be choosing the recipients and Vanessa indicated yes.

B. Reminder: Election of Vice-Chair in January

Staff Carlen Hatala reminded the commissioners to look at their list of past officers and prepare to nominate a vice chair in January.

C. Staff Updates

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that intern Brad Hibray was finishing up his last day with the Historic Preservation section and that he had been an important member of our team.

D. Appeal of HPC denial for demolition of the Wadsworth House at 2841 W. Richardson Place.

Ald. Bauman alerted the commissioners to the appeal of the HPC denial of the demolition of the Wadsworth House on Richardson Place. It was back on the ZND agenda and will be heard on January 13th. He urged commissioners to come and speak in defense of preserving the house. Its demolition for a parking lot/motor vehicle use in a historic district is problematic.

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Rededication of City Hall December 18, 2008

9.. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 4:17 P.M.