

MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Tuesday, January 17, 2006/3:00 PM City Hall/200 East Wells Street/Room #301-B

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Sandy Ackerman called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm.

Commissioners present: Sandy Ackerman, Patricia Balon, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown,

Sandra McSweeney and Tim Stemper

Commissioners absent: Ald. Robert Bauman

Staff present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Michelle Carr, and Eva Hofman

Staff absent: Martha Brown

2. MINUTES

Pat Balon moved and Tim Stemper seconded a motion to accept the minutes from the December 12, 2005 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting. The motion carried. Ann Pieper Eisenbrown abstained from voting since she was not present at the December meeting.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

None

5. New Business

A. Storefront changes at 2625 N Downer Ave. (Downer Avenue Historic District)

Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report. A new business, Original Pancake House, is going into the former Coffee Trader Building, a contemporary structure built in the 1970s. The applicant, Brett Grasse, was questioned about the proposed brise soleil and whether or not it should be constructed of ipe wood or have a more edgy contemporary look by adding more steel to the design. The applicant indicated that the materials had already been purchased and that he thought the wood worked better with the exposed truss work on the building. Commissioners were concerned over the lack of scale drawings and whether or not the brise soleil would overwhelm the historic character of the adjacent buildings and whether the brise soleil would weigh down the building since it is only one story high.

The Motion: Pat Balon moved to have the applicant work with staff and provide complete drawings and material specifications and more specific details on the signage. Sandra McSweeney made a friendly amendment that there be section drawings showing how the brise soleil cantilevers over the street. She also requested that the commissioners be e-mailed or faxed copies of the amended designs. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion as amended. The motion carried unanimously.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Election of vice-chair for 2006

Matt Jarosz requested a list of former chairs before voting on officers.

HPC Minutes January 17, 2006 Page 2

The Motion: Matt Jarosz proposed to postpone the election of chair and vice chair until the February 13, 2006 meeting. Seconded by Sandra McSweeney. The motion carried unanimously.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Staff Certificates of Appropriateness (see Addendum to the Agenda)
- B. Commissioners who attended the Cream of the Cream City Awards on January 5, 2006 thought that the ceremony went well, there was good public attendance, and that the Cream of the Cream City awards should be teamed up with the Mayor's Urban Design Awards next year. Carlen Hatala reported that 2006 was the 25th anniversary of the Historic Preservation Commission and asked commissioners to form a subcommittee to work on one or more special events commemorating the HPC's accomplishments. Pat Balon said the HPC needed to show the true importance of preservation to the city. Pat Balon and Sandy Ackerman volunteered to work on events.
- C. Sandra McSweeney suggested that the HPC reconsider what kinds of design are allowed for infill buildings in historic districts. She advocated for contemporary design and Tim Stemper agreed, adding that he did not like bad copies or replicas of historic designs. Paul Jakubovich indicated that good design from any era is valuable but that not all new design is well done and that it was difficult to get good contemporary design. Carlen Hatala added that contemporary use of traditional proportioning and construction methods would look fresh today and be a better fit than contemporary design that does not respect the scale of adjacent historic buildings.

8. ADJOURNMENT

The Motion: Pat Balon moved to adjourn the meeting at 4:00 P.M. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, February 13, 2006/3:00 PM City Hall/200 East Wells Street/Room #301-B

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Sandy Ackerman called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm.

Commissioners present: Sandy Ackerman, Patricia Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz,

Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, and Tim Stemper

Commissioners absent: Sandra McSweeney

Staff present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Michelle Carr, and Erin Lanham

Staff absent: Martha Brown and Eva Hofman

2. MINUTES

Ald. Robert Bauman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to accept the minutes from the January 17, 2006 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for the disposition of the terra cotta ornamentation on City Hall.

Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report. Gary Kulwicki, DPW Facilities Manager, presented a powerpoint report in which he outlined the specific terra cotta ornament that was scheduled to be salvaged from City Hall. DPW was approached by the contractor, J.P. Cullen, with an offer to credit the city back \$250,000 if they do not have to carefully salvage one complete clock gable. The \$250,000 could go toward replacing other elements on City Hall like the finials or cresting since those items were not in the budget.

Larry Rocole from J.P. Cullen was recognized. He stated that J.P. Cullen was proposing the \$250,000 credit in response from a meeting with the Mayor during which the mayor asked for ways to save money on the City Hall project. DPW determined the amount of the credit based on the per unit replication costs.

The credit would come from not salvaging the clock gable as specified in the contract. The contract specifies that one complete clock gable be saved, in order to make replicas, with the pieces being returned to the city. This would require careful removal of the individual pieces. The final disposition of the pieces could be an installation somewhere in the city or possible sale to a collector. This has not yet been determined. The contractor's offer would result in less careful removal and handling of the gable elements. Mr. Rocole indicated that fragmented gable pieces could still be used by the terra cotta manufacturer in making replica pieces since they would be combined with photographs and measurements.

Ald. Bauman asked a number of questions about the contract, why modifications were being proposed at this stage of the work, and what purpose was being served by reopening the contract now.

HPC Minutes February 13, 2006 Page 2

THE MOTION: Ald. Baumann made a motion that J.P. Cullen sticks to the contract as written and agreed to by the Common Council.

Further discussion followed. Matt Jarosz asked if the request for the \$250,000 credit affected other items that were to be salvaged like the lions' heads. Mr. Kulwicki indicated that other decorative elements would be salvaged as indicated in the contract. Ald. Bauman asked if the \$250,000 credit would be enough to cover the expenses of adding the cresting and finials to the building. Mr. Kulwicki said that DPW did not know the answer to that yet. Pat Balon asked if there would be delays in the schedule should the HPC deny their request for a credit. Mr. Rocole said the crew would be on schedule either way. Gary Kulwicki indicated that there were a number of steps in the terra cotta replication process, including a mock up, that required approval of the city at each stage. This would ensure a good match whether or not the clock gable pieces were salvaged carefully or in broken pieces.

Tim Stemper commented that maybe the credit would save the city some money.

Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that carefully salvaged pieces from the clock gable were good insurance that the replicated pieces would be the best possible match to the originals.

Salvage contractor Pieter Godfrey was recognized. He made a public offer to store the salvaged terra cotta, at no expense or liability to the city, because City Hall is such an important building to Milwaukee. He is not seeking to make any money from his proposal. Mr. Godfrey also commented on the value of architectural salvage and matching up such items with the right clients if the intent is to sell the items.

Preservationist and businessman Doug Quigley was recognized. He reported that he had already purchased some of the terra cotta balusters that had been removed from city hall. They were being sold by the contractor. He urged the commission to deny the request for the credit and wanted the terra cotta removed carefully. He showed the commissioners an image of the front of the Chicago Stock Exchange that had been salvaged and reinstalled and added that the original torch from the Statue of Liberty was placed in a park after a replica had been fabricated for the sculpture. He suggested that the Milwaukee city hall clock tower gable could be reassembled at the Milwaukee Art Museum or another location.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman repeated his motion to deny the contractor's request to credit the city \$250,000 and instead have the contractor stick to the original contract and not deviate from it. Patricia Balon seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Gary Kulwicki asked the Commission if there would be a subcommittee to assist with the selection of the brick color for City Hall. By consensus, the commissioners decided that Matt Jarosz and staff Paul Jakubovich would form the subcommittee.

5. New Business

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for glass block windows already installed at 3238 N. Sherman Boulevard (Sherman Boulevard Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the applicant's request to be allowed to keep the glass block basement windows that were installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff recommended replacing the windows that were visible along the public right of way and using plantings to mask the remainder. Alderman Baumann stated that there should be a strict following of the guidelines. Pat Balon added that allowing these windows would send a message that the preservation guidelines do not have to be followed.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved that all of the glass block basement windows be removed and replaced. Pat Balon seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

HPC Minutes February 13, 2006 Page 3

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an existing garage and the construction of a new garage at 2903 W. McKinley Boulevard (Cold Spring Park Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the applicant's request to remove the current garage and build a more architecturally compatible garage that was somewhat smaller in size.

Matt Jarosz and Tim Stemper commented that the garage gable match that of the house instead of the jerkin head gable shown in the Preservation Portfolio design. The applicant was agreeable to the suggestion. Matt Jarosz also suggested that the shingle courses match those on the house.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved to approve the request to demolish the old garage and build a new one according to the design submitted and the recommendations made. Timothy Stemper seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Election of Chair and Vice Chair for 2006 and Re-Appointment of Matt Jarosz to the Historic Third Ward Architecture Review Board.

THE MOTION: Patricia Balon nominated Timothy Stemper for vice-chair. Matt Jarosz seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz nominated the current vice-chair, Ald. Robert Bauman, for Chair, 2006. Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded the motion.

Donna Schlieman requested to address the commission before the vote.

She mentioned that on some commissions it is considered a conflict of interest for the elected official to serve as chair, since he/she might vote on behalf of his/her constituent at the expense of the mission of the commission. After some discussion as to whether the procedures and by-laws prohibit this, it was determined that the chair only votes as a tiebreaker, so there would be less chance of conflict of interest. The motion to vote in Ald. Bauman as chair carried unanimously.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved to re-appoint Matt Jarosz to the Historic Third Ward Architecture Review Board. Pat Balon seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Staff Certificates of Appropriateness (see Addendum to the Agenda)
- B. Staff Carlen Hatala reviewed upcoming conferences and handed out flyers. She announced that the James S. Brown Double House would be heard before the Zoning, Neighborhoods and Development Committee on February 22, 2006. There is no opposition from the owner.
- C. The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is <u>Monday</u>, <u>April 13</u>, <u>2006</u> at <u>3:00 PM</u>, <u>Room 301-A of City Hall</u>, <u>200 E. Wells Street</u>.

8. ADJOURNMENT

The Motion: Timothy Stemper moved to adjourn the meeting at 4:30 P.M. Patricia Balon seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, March 13, 2006/3:00 PM City Hall/200 East Wells Street/Room #301-B

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Robert Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:05 pm.

Commissioners present: Sandy Ackerman, Patricia Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, and Tim Stemper

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Erin Lanham

Staff absent: Martha Brown, Michelle Carr, Eva Hofman

2. MINUTES

Pat Balon moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to accept the minutes from the February 13, 2006 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

None

5. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Public Hearing on a nomination to locally designate the Kilbourn Avenue Bascule Bridge, Kilbourn Avenue over the Milwaukee River.

Staff Carlen Hatala presented slides and a staff report recommending designation and then swore in persons who were interested in testifying. Pat Balon moved and Matt Jarosz seconded the motion to open the public hearing.

Mike Bartels, chair of BID 15, had questions about whether or not this designation would impact the riverwalk or the operation of the Kilbourn Avenue Bridge. He was advised that there would be no change in the use of the bridge and that the riverwalk had its own guidelines to follow.

There being no further testimony, Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The commissioners concurred that the bridge met the criteria in the staff report.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved that the Historic Preservation Commission recommend that the Kilbourn Avenue Bridge be locally designated in fulfillment of criteria e-5, e-6 and e-9 of the Historic Preservation ordinance. Tim Stemper seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

6. NEW BUSINESS

HPC Minutes March 13, 2006 Page 2

A. Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate the lighthouse keeper's cottage and install a new drive and parking at 2650 N. Wahl Avenue (North Point North Historic District)

Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report that recommended approval of rehabilitation of the lighthouse keeper's cottage but recommended that the landscape plan be referred to staff for final design since the proposed 6-car parking lot was not acceptable. Mr. Jakubovich also indicated that a staff approval had already been issued for the restoration of the lighthouse itself.

Copies of e-mails were distributed to the commission members from residents who live across from the park. These communications expressed concern over the size of the proposed parking lot and wide driveway. Chairman Bauman read into the record that there were 9 e-mail letters in opposition to size of the parking lot (in the commissioners packets) and that 4 more e-mail responses in opposition were distributed at the meeting. A letter of support for the project from Ald. D'Amato was read into the record. There were also copies of text written by John Scripp and presented by Milwaukee County that supported the project.

Commissioners' discussion centered on the appropriateness of the proposed parking lot. In response to their questions, Mr. Jakubovich clarified that code does not require a six-space parking lot. A smaller lot can be built. A discussion followed about the material for the driveway and parking lot and what form of permeable surface would be appropriate and how it would be maintained.

Chairman Baumann then recognized the individuals who had signed in to speak. Two individuals spoke against the parking lot. Charlie Kamps advocated for a smaller parking lot. Donna Schlieman was opposed to the driveway and lot and cautioned against the slippery slope toward privatization of the park.

A number of persons spoke in favor of the parking lot. John Scripp, president of the North Point Lighthouse Friends, spoke in favor of the restoration of the site, summarized the efforts of the friends group and some of the proposed activities for the keeper's quarters. He had no objections to a permeable surface for the lot and driveway but thought the 6-car parking lot as proposed was needed for staff and handicap parking. He stated that this area was not a streetscape so the commissioners had no authority to review the number of spaces in the parking lot. Marcia Coles, president of Lake Park Friends, supported the parking lot since there already was a driveway and cars parking near the keeper's quarters. By moving the lot to the north side of the building it would be closer to the handicapped entrance and less visible to the neighbors. Her husband is in a wheel chair and she expressed concern about having the wheelchair get stuck in grasscrete pavers. Joe Wilson testified that Lake Park needs to be accessible to all people not just the neighborhood and that the lot near the Lake Park Bistro was too far away to park in cold weather. John Bach stated that the driveway and lot had been there since at least 1970 and that they would be less obvious to the neighbors if improved. He emphasized that the drive and lot were necessary for the success of the adaptive use of the lighthouse keeper's cottage. Cindy Rewolinski, executive director of North Point Lighthouse Friends, urged the commissioners to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the renovation of the keeper's house and work out the parking lot and drive later. She stated that she was glad she did not live in the neighborhood because of all the conflict over this issue. Charles Engberg testified that if the drive and parking were put in as proposed, they would be the best in the park since the other parking areas and paths were in rough shape. He stated the parking lot should be placed where it won't show. He advocated for compacted gravel or other surface but indicated that grasscrete did not work well in his experience. Marguerite Harvey stated that Olmsted would not have objected to the parking lot as proposed.

Kevin Healy, Milwaukee County Parks Department, indicated that the lighthouse property had been Federal land and that Olmsted designed around it and that there had been a driveway into the site from the beginning. He emphasized that the County wants the project integrated into the park so it would be appropriate to keep widths and materials consistent with the rest in the park. He did not want to see trucks get stuck on the driveway. He thought a 6-car lot was reasonable. Julie Bastin, Milwaukee County Parks Department, answered questions about the proposed lot. She indicated that it could not be more than 700 feet away from the building and that they arrived at 6 spaces based on

HPC Minutes March 13, 2006 Page 3

an equation for the square footage of the building and the addition of one handicap space. In response to a question from Tim Stemper, Ms. Bastin indicated that the fire department did not require a hard surface for fire response.

Between the testimonies of the above individuals, commissioners questioned the use of blacktop for the driveway and lot, whether or not the driveway should be narrower, and how to preserve more trees since the proposed lot would require the removal of a number of trees. The commissioners agreed that they had no purview over the use of the keeper's quarters and the traffic generated by buses, tour groups and any wedding receptions that might take place at site. They did acknowledge that many of the immediate neighbors had objections to the traffic and disturbances that could arise because of the frequent use of the site.

Randy Bryant spoke in favor of the renovation of the keeper's quarters but indicated that it was untrue that the site always had a driveway and lot. Photographs show that cars began parking close to the keeper's quarters around 1951. Mr. Bryant said that lots always had a way of increasing in size and that there was adequate nearby parking at the Lake Park Bistro. He advised the commissioners to consider whether or not a 6-car lot was appropriate for the historic area.

<u>Bob Teske</u>, director of the Milwaukee County Historical Society, stated that the Society had just approved landmark status for the lighthouse and keeper's quarters. He had no comment on the lot.

Joanne Barndt was in favor of the proposal but chose not to speak.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper made a motion to approve the renovations of the keeper's house but have the landscaping come back with revisions. There was no second to the motion.

Matt Jarosz said there were no detail drawings submitted showing windows, roofing, the glazing in of the porch and so on. He wanted to see details before approving a Certificate of Appropriateness. The commission always needs detail drawings before an approval. Mr. Jakubovich indicated that staff could work this out with the project architect and the state preservation staff who were also reviewing the project. Ms. Hatala suggested a subcommittee from the commission who would work with staff. Commissioners were in agreement that they wanted detail drawings to come back to the full commission for review.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved that the item be tabled. Sandy Ackerman seconded the motion. The motion carried.

Project architect Scott Smith asked whether or not the commission's vote constituted conditional approval. He was advised there was no conditional approval. Mr. Jakubovich advised Mr. Scott to complete the drawings and submit them for the next meeting. Mr. Jakubovich indicated that staff worked collaboratively with the state preservation staff so the project will be moved along.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Certified Local Government Review of the National Register Nomination for Milwaukee Hospital, 2200 W. Kilbourn Avenue.

Staff Carlen Hatala presented a brief report in support of the National Register nomination.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved to recommend the National Register nomination. Matt Jarosz seconded the motion. The motion carried

B. Certified Local Government Review of the State Register Nomination for the Northwestern Branch, National Home for Disabled Volunteer Soldiers Historic District (VA Grounds) at 5000 W. National Avenue. HPC Minutes March 13, 2006 Page 4

Staff Carlen Hatala presented a brief report in support of the State Register Nomination.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz and Pat Balon seconded a motion to recommend the Sate Register Nomination. The motion carried.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Staff Certificates of Appropriateness (see Addendum to the Agenda)
- B. The next meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, April 10, 2006 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.

8. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Baumann called for adjournment at 5:07 P.M.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, April 10, 2006/3:00 PM City Hall/200 East Wells Street/Room #301-B

1. ROLL CALL

Vice Chair Timothy Stemper called the meeting to order.

Commissioners present: Sandy Ackerman, Patricia Balon, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, and Tim Stemper

Commissioners absent: Ald. Robert Bauman

Staff present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Michelle Carr

Staff absent: Martha Brown, Vanessa Koster, Eva Hofman, Erin Lanham

2. MINUTES

(Notes do not reflect who made the motion to approve the March 13, 2006 Minutes)

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

The Historic Preservation Commissioners agreed to alter the order of the agenda and hold the public hearing on the Hrobsky/Berg Building as the first order of business.

4. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Public hearing on the nomination to locally designate the Hrobsky/Berg Building at 2722-2724 N. Martin Luther King, Jr. Drive.

Michelle Carr swore in those persons who would be testifying on the building.

Staff Carlen Hatala presented the staff report that recommended designation.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

Owner Tatia Jackson was recognized. She had nominated the building and stated that the building was under renovation today, making it a catalyst for other revitalization in the area. It is as important today as it was historically.

THE MOTION: There being no further testimony, Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded the motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

After a brief discussion about the type of brick on the building (probably St. Louis pressed brick), and the use of a façade grant for the restoration of the storefront, the commissioners were in consensus on the building's eligibility.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved that the commission recommend designation based on criteria e-5 and e-9 of the ordinance. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion. The motion carried.

5. OLD BUSINESS

HPC Minutes April 10, 2006 Page 2

A. Revisions to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for stair tower alterations at St. Mary's Hospital at 2320 N. Lake Drive (St. Mary's Hospital Historic Building)

Staff Paul Jakubovich reviewed the earlier submittal of the project back in October 2005 and summarized the current proposal. Randy Bryant was recognized as a representative of the Water Tower Landmark Trust. He said the current submission was a good one and just what the neighborhood had requested.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the current proposal. The motion carried.

B. Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate the lighthouse keeper's cottage and install a new drive and parking at 2650 N. Wahl Avenue (North Point North Historic District)

Paul Jakubovich reviewed the proposal and the changes the commission had requested at the last meeting. He indicated that the c. 1900 postcard view was being used as the model for the rehabilitation of the keeper's house. The front porch of the keeper's house would be glazed in. The connector between the keeper's house and the lighthouse would be recreated. The different styles of windows on the keeper's house were the result of the state preservation staff's decision to clearly delineate between what had been original sash and what windows were later additions to the building. A hood would be built over the handicap access entry. A final review by the state historic preservation office was pending. The site plan had been modified since last month's meeting as well. There was now a 15-foot gap between the house and patio as required by the state. The parking lot would still accommodate six cars but was now smaller in size and L-shaped in plan. The 9-foot to 10-foot cinder path would remain the same in width. Some trees would be removed. A pervious pavement would be used. Mr. Jakubovich referred the commissioners to their packets in which was enclosed the list of concerns from area residents.

Tim Stemper read into the record that there were sixteen letters of opposition to the project and three letters of support. Mr. Stemper recognized persons who had signed in to speak.

David O'Brien, 3354 N. Shepard Avenue, indicated he was on the board of the North Point Lighthouse Friends, a trustee of the Water Tower Landmark Trust, and on the board of Lake Park Friends. He urged the commission to approve the project.

John Scripp, 2822 E. Newport Avenue, said he would give his time to speak to Julie Bastin and Kevin Haley of the County.

Kevin Haley, Milwaukee County landscape architect, summarized the process by which the County obtained ownership of the property from the Federal government. The property will be leased to the North Point Lighthouse Friends who will be responsible for the day-to-day costs of operating the keeper's house and lighthouse. The County will take care of the grounds and plow snow, etc. The driveway width will be reduced and will be surfaced with a pervious product that could support the load of fire trucks. A pervious paving material would also be used for the parking lot.

Julie Bastin, Milwaukee County project architect, indicated that she had worked with staff on the keeper's house overhangs and that other details would get resolved once the aluminum siding was removed. Ms. Bastin had a window sample (Colby and Colby) to show the commissioners. She indicated that true divided light windows would be costly and asked the commission to approve applied muntins. Ms. Bastin talked about the landscape features and indicated that fire lanes need to be accessible to the fire trucks so the plan shows a widening of the driveway as it approaches the keeper's house. She added that 340 feet were removed from the proposed parking lot and they are making attempts to discourage skateboarders from using the paths by the keeper's house. The County is trying to address neighborhood concerns by tucking the parking lot to the side instead of the front and adding landscaping for screening as well as preventing people from parking over the lot onto the grass.

HPC Minutes April 10, 2006 Page 3

Marcia Coles, 2929 E. Hartford Avenue, supported the use of pervious material for the lot, driveway and paths.

Barbara Elsner, 2420 N. Terrace Avenue, was opposed to the 6-car parking lot. The size of the proposed lot is based on a formula used by Milwaukee County. She advocated that the commission defer making a decision until it has been established that the keeper's house can be successfully operated.

Ald. D'Amato supported the project including the parking lot. He said there are disagreements about the use of the keeper's house but that all agree the building must be preserved. He added that parking in a park is a permitted use and that if the commission were to deny the proposed lot, people could park tomorrow on the existing lot. The Alderman added that he thought the proposed lot did a good job of respecting the park and that the County staff would control who parks there.

John Bach, 3028 N. Hackett, spoke in favor of the parking lot and said that people are now using the area as a dog run. Commissioner McSweeney clarified that the use by people with dogs has only happened since the Federal government vacated the area.

Kathleen Brumder, 2419 N. Wahl Avenue, stated that she is a member of Lake Park Friends. She expressed concerns over trash removal (there were problems with Bartolotta's restaurant) and the possibility that people will pull there cars onto parkland and park sideways, if the designated parking lot were full.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to vote separately on the rehabilitation of the keeper's house and the landscaping/parking lot. The motion carried.

The commissioners then discussed the keeper's house. The commissioners had numerous questions for Julie Bastin and Kevin Haley regarding the glazing in of the front porch, how many vent stacks would pierce the roof, what the doors would look like, and using true divided light windows.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the renovations to the keeper's house that include the construction of the connector, the use of true divided light windows, and the glazing in of the east porch with modifications to be worked out with staff and reviewed by Matt Jarosz. The motion carried.

The commission turned its attention to the landscape features and there was discussion about the size of the parking lot, what had been there historically, what type of plant material would work best as a screen, whether a bermed perimeter would keep people from parking off the lot, the need for a 20-foot wide fire lane, reducing the driveway width from 20 feet to 10 feet, what type of pervious paving material would work best, how many trees would be cut down for the parking lot and garbage removal.

Randy Bryant was recognized. He stated that the neighbors were glad that a pervious paving material was being used instead of asphalt, that they wanted a soil stabilizer to be used and they would like to see something that closely resembled the current cinders. Neighbors were not thrilled about a 6-car parking lot so it will be important to have proper screening so that it is not visible from Wahl Avenue.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the landscape plans with the materials suggested by the commission, with the ideas suggested by the commission and that there be screening of the parking lot to be reviewed later. The motion carried. There was one dissenting vote. Sandra McSweeney was opposed to the 6-car lot.

There being no further business or announcements, Pat Balon moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried. The meeting was adjourned at 5:09 PM.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, May 15, 2006, 3:00 PM

City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-A

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Robert Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:03 PM.

Commissioners present: Sandy Ackerman, Patricia Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners absent: Tim Stemper

Staff present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Erin Lanham

Staff absent: Vanessa Koster, Eva Hofman, Michelle Carr

2. MINUTES

Staff Carlen Hatala provided the Commissioners with copies of the minutes from the April 10, 2006 HPC meeting. Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes from the April 10, 2006 meeting. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

A. Change exterior cladding on new house from brick to stucco with stone trim at 3418 N. Lake Drive (North Lake Drive Estates Historic District).

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to hold this item until later in the meeting, as the owner was not yet present. The motion carried.

5. PUBLIC HEARING

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Exterior renovation of 611 W. Historic Mitchell Street (Mitchell Street Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report. It recommended that the upper windows be replaced with replicas having true divided lights, that there be double leaf doors in the six new storefronts being created, that the brick on the former theater portion of the building be removed and replaced with new brick to match, and that there be clear glass on the storefronts.

Allyson Nemec from Quorum Architects was recognized. She asked the commission to approve single leaf doors citing approval from the State Division of Historic Preservation in a tax credit application. She said there were problems with security and hinges and air infiltration from double leaf doors. She added that the owner thought that single leaf doors looked better since the storefronts were smaller. Pat Balon, Sandra McSweeney and Matt Jarosz asked questions about the merits of single leaf vs. double leaf doors. Staff Paul Jakubovich said there was a precedent set with the façade grant program to have double leaf doors in all storefront renovations.

HPC Minutes May 15, 2006 Page 2

The commissioners then discussed the brick and whether the sample shown would match the original and discussed the repair to the metal cornice and what sort of windows would be used.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness according to the staff report but with the exception to allow single leaf doors instead of double leaf doors. The motion carried.

- The Commission returned to OLD BUSINESS
 - A. Change exterior cladding on new house from brick to stucco with stone trim at 3418 N. Lake Drive (North Lake Drive Estates Historic District).

Owner Tanya Lewis was recognized. Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized why Ms. Lewis was seeking an amendment to her earlier Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff would work with the owner regarding the color, texture and finish of the stucco and there would be stone trim.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the change in material with staff and one other commissioner to make an on-site approval of a test panel before the stucco is applied to the house. The motion carried.

The commission returned to **NEW BUSINESS**

B. Demolition of 535 W. Historic Mitchell Street; renovations of neighboring buildings; construction of new surface parking lot for funeral home. (Mitchell Street Historic District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the staff report, which explained why the owner, Ald. Witkowiak, wants to demolish the building at 535 W. Mitchell Street for expanded parking. The Ald. would restore 515 W. Mitchell Street in return for the permission to demolish 535 W. Mitchell Street.

Owner Ald. Witkowiak was recognized. He indicated that a mover had been out to look over the building. Staff indicated it would be preferable to move the building rather than demolish it since it does contribute to the historic district. A site would have to be found for the building. The Alderman owns all but one or two buildings on the west side of the 500 block and has restored one of the buildings. The commission had approved his request to demolish another building on the block some months ago.

Judy Keller from the Mitchell Street Association was recognized. She said the association normally does not advocate for the demolition of any buildings on Mitchell Street but makes an exception in this case as there is no street parking in the 500 block. The Alderman's business, a funeral home, requires parking.

Sandra McSweeney asked if the Ald. has explored sharing parking lots with the nearby churches. Ald. Witkowiak indicated that is already happening.

Staff Carlen Hatala apologized for not bringing along the criteria in the ordinance that the commission is to look at when considering demolitions.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the request for demolition with the conditions stated in the staff report.

Matt Jarosz expressed concern that there were no clear, detailed drawings of the landscaping, gates and other features that would be installed after the building was removed. There were no drawings for the restoration of 515 W. Mitchell Street. He indicated that the demolition of a building in a historic district was not to be taken lightly. He stressed the need to stick to the commission's standards and make sure there was something to replace the building and that 515 W. Mitchell would be restored. Once the building at 535 W. Mitchell was down there would

HPC Minutes May 15, 2006 Page 3

be no leverage. There were vacant lots on Brady Street in the past because future building plans were not nailed down.

The commission then discussed the need for detailed drawings. Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that there would have to be plans in place before any cars could be parked on the site. Ald. Bauman added that this was a long time business on Mitchell Street and not some here today gone tomorrow restaurant so it was a worthwhile project. Matt Jarosz reiterated the need to follow the staff report.

THE VOTE: The motion carried unanimously.

C. New back yard storage shed at 2440-42 N. Lake Drive (North Point North Historic District)

Matt Jarosz left the meeting at 4:07 PM but indicated that he supported the staff report on this proposal.

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of this project. He showed the commission what the applicant had proposed and what staff has proposed for the backyard storage shed.

Ald. Baumann suggested that the applicant go to a person in Brewer's Hill who designs sheds in a variety of architectural styles to match your house. The sheds are economical, built off-site and rolled off a truck at the buyers' premises. He was unaware of the need to obtain permits for these types of structures.

Sandra McSweeney indicated she had done a site visit and indicated that the storage shed would be better located at the rear of the lot instead of behind the house. It would be less noticeable to the neighbors and give the owner a less cut up back yard. It would appear to be more of an addition to the garage instead of being right outside the neighbor's door/window. Sandra also indicated that she did not want shingles partway on the building. There should be either all shingles or all lap siding.

Pat Balon indicated that placement was the key. She did not approve of the applicant's sketch and wanted less ambiguity on the materials.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to locate the shed at the rear of the property with modifications to the design and materials to be approved by staff, with the roof pitch to match the garage, and the cladding be all one material. The motion carried.

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. The Special Meeting for Interim Nominations is scheduled for Tuesday, June 6, 2006.
- B. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday. June 19, 2006 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.

9. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandra McSweeney moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion carried and the meeting was adjourned at 4:29 PM.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING Tuesday, June 6, 2006, 3:00 PM

City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Common Council Chambers

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Robert Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:04 pm.

Commissioners present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,

Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, and Tim Stemper

Commissioners absent: Matt Jarosz

Staff present: Carlen Hatala and Paul Jakubovich

2. Minutes

None at this meeting

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

None

5. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Public Hearing on a petition for Interim Historic Designation for the Thomas Brown Puddlers' Cottages, 2638, 2642 and 2646 S. Shore Drive.

Staff Carlen Hatala presented slides and gave the staff recommendation.

Ald. Zielinski was recognized. He stated that there were development pressures in Bay View and that if they weren't careful, they would lose the special ambience of the neighborhood. He added that the Common Council implemented the interim study plan overlay last week so this interim Historic Designation petition was no longer needed.

HPC Chair, Ald. Bauman, indicated that there were residents who had come to speak. He asked for a motion to open the public hearing.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

Staff Michelle Carr swore in those who wanted to testify.

Sharon Reinelt, 2641 S. Shore Drive, was recognized. She stated she was disheartened by the new development that was crowding the neighborhood and unhappy ay how developers could not see the character of Bay View. Ald. Bauman interjected that Ald. Zielinski was working very diligently at making sure Bay View's character would be retained.

David Reinelt, 2525 S. Shore Drive, was recognized. He stated that he had grown up at 2641, across the street from the Brown Puddlers' Cottages. He said there was a danger of losing two of the cottages, since they were being sold as lots. He added that puddlers' cottages should be saved. He was afraid that a developer could come in and demolish two of the cottages and build something 40 feet tall and flat roofed and stretch it down to the lake.

Mrs. Nancy Suhm was recognized. She owns 2646 S. Shore Drive. She asked the commission not to grant interim historic status on her house because the exterior and interior had been altered too much and

HPC Special Meeting June 6, 2006 Page 2

there was not much historic fabric left. She indicated that they had no intention of moving and that their children wanted the house in the future.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

Ald. Bauman asked for a motion to nominate the buildings. No one on the commission made a motion. Ald. Bauman stated that the nomination failed due to lack of a motion. Tim Stemper added that there was the protection of the Interim Study Plan Overlay now in effect. Ald. Bauman added that the Interim Overlay was a better way to deal with the threat of inappropriate development and that the cottages had not met the criteria in the Historic Preservation ordinance.

Ald. Bauman left the meeting and vice chair Tim Stemper took over the meeting.

B Public Hearing on a petition for Interim Historic Designation for the Wentworth Avenue/Superior Street Historic District: 2546 through 2586 S. Wentworth Avenue, 1704 E. Pryor Avenue, 2557 S. Superior Street and 2577 S. Superior Street.

Staff Carlen Hatala presented the report and staff recommendations.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to open the public hearing.

Staff Michelle Carr swore in those who wanted to testify.

Nicole Vitrano, nominator of the district, was recognized. She stated that she had turned in the application to help protect the neighborhood. She lives next door to the lot where there is proposed development and she has concerns over the scale and type of new house that would be built. She also had concerns over parking problems and the negative impact this could have on her property values. She indicated the existing duplex next door was not being taken of. There was an explosion of development in Bay View, some was good but some compromised the integrity of the neighborhood. She added that if the commission did not find that this proposed district fit the traditional historic district criteria, maybe an interim overlay zone, like the one on S. Shore Drive, would be more appropriate.

Gretchen Wussow, Wentworth Avenue, was recognized. She indicated that this was a wonderful neighborhood but there were concerns. Some of the neighbors do not have parking on their property. The lot at 1704 E. Pryor Avenue was back on the MLS listings. The neighbors were concerned over height and density and not development, as long as it's appropriate.

Brian Reslawski was recognized. He was opposed to the nomination but did not wish to speak.

Attorney Brad Hoeschen was recognized. He represents Joseph Hoffman, the new owner of 1704 E. Pryor Avenue. He stated that the ordinance was designed to protect historic properties and there were none on this lot. He asked that this lot be removed from the proposed district. The design of the new house has been worked out with Ald. Zielinski and met the neighbors' approval. Sandra McSweeney asked about the character of the new house. Pat Balon asked if Mr. Hoeschen had the designs to show the Commission. Mr. Hoeschen did not have the drawings with him but indicated that they had met with BOZA approval and that the building permits had been issued in January 2006. Tim Stemper asked if the property was back on the market. Mr. Hoeschen stated that his client had changed his mind about living in the neighborhood and was willing to sell the land with all the permits and plans. Tim Stemper questioned whether or not they could sell the property before July 12th; the date that the construction permits would expire.

Lynn Zimmerman was recognized. She was opposed to the designation. She said the designation was more to stop development than to preserve historic Bay View. She had not been consulted before the petition was submitted. She added that if they wanted their house designated, they would apply for designation themselves. She was not opposed to any new construction and asked the petitioner to withdraw the petition.

Joseph Zimmerman was recognized. He stated that he had been a resident on Superior Street since 1970. He concurred with the staff report that concluded that the collection of buildings on Wentworth and Superior was not historic. Mr. Zimmerman did not like the epidemic of interim petitions being filed for Bay View. He had been present at the public hearing for the Beulah Brinton House last year. He listed other houses that were worthy of local historic designation in Bay View.

HPC Special Meeting June 6, 2006 Page 3

Sandra McSweeney indicated that these interim petitions were submitted when there was a threat of demolition in a neighborhood. She said this is not unusual.

Ald. Zielinski was recognized. He summarized the efforts being made to preserve the character of Bay View and how the zoning had been downsized and that an interim study plan overlay had been created for S. Shore Drive. Ald. Zielinski expressed concern over the property at 1704 E. Pryor Avenue. He stated that without interim historic designation, the plans could change without anyone's input. He stated that 90 days was time enough to set an interim study plan overlay on this area and then the historic designation would not be needed. In response to a question by Tim Stemper, Ald. Zielinski indicated that the interim overlay had a good chance of passing and that it would give the neighborhood time to work on the conservation district.

Sandra McSweeney asked if the historic designation would go away once the interim overlay were in place. Ald. Zielinski replied yes.

Attorney Brad Hoeschen was recognized again. He reiterated his request that 1704 E. Pryor be removed from the district. Tim Stemper replied that if the area became a historic district then the new construction would have to meet criteria. Ald. Zielinski indicated that it was important for this property to be included.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to close the public hearing

There was a brief discussion about the concern of the neighbors and the misunderstanding that some of the neighbors had about this proceeding.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved that interim historic designation be imposed on the Wentworth Avenue/Superior Street District on the basis of Criteria e-8 in the ordinance, because it is a distinct area worthy of keeping its architectural, historic and cultural character. The motion was seconded by Sandra McSweeney. The motion carried.

OTHER BUSINESS

Donna Schlieman distributed copies of a letter she had sent to the city regarding the process by which demolitions were reviewed by HPC staff. The commissioners indicated that it would be taken up at the next meeting.

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, June 19, 2006, at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 4:35 PM.



MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, June 19, 2006, 3:00 PM City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-A

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Robert Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:00 PM.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Tim Stemper

Commissioners Excused: Pat Balon

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Michelle Carr, Eva Hofman, Erin

Lanham

Staff Absent: Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the May 15, 2006 HPC meeting. The motion carried with Tim Stemper abstaining due to his absence from that meeting.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the June 6, 2006 Special Meeting. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

A. None

5. PUBLIC HEARING

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Mothballing permit for double house at 1016-18 N. 29th Street. Janet Schlee and Lare Schlee, owners (Concordia Historic District) PTS# 34660

Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report, which recommended approval of a mothballing certificate based on the owner's timeline for getting the rehab work done on her property. A brief discussion followed, centering whether or not the building can be occupied during the mothballing period (yes), the matter of the handicap ramp (for the owner's mother) and how large a building is it (originally built as a duplex).

HPC Minutes June 19, 2006 Page 2

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the mothballing certificate. The motion carried.

B. Demolition of garage at 2557 S. Superior Street. James Roslawski, owner. ((Wentworth Avenue/Superior Street Interim Historic District) PTS# 34672

Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report with the recommendation that the demolition be approved later after plans for the replacement house are further along in the process. He added that Ald. Zielinski concured with this recommendation. The owner, Mr. Roslawski, was recognized but he declined to comment, stating that whatever decision the HPC made was fine with him.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to table this item until a future date. The motion carried.

C. Replace existing wood art glass and divided lite windows with clad simulated divided lites at 2281-83 N. Lake Drive. James Ruff and Lowell Hall, owners. (North Point South Historic district). PTS# 32881

Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report and recommendation that replacement windows be denied. The owners, Mr. Ruff and Mr. Hall were recognized. Mr. Hall explained that they could not see restoring their windows because in his estimation they would still not be energy efficient. They wanted spring-loaded sash with double glass and a modern storm/screen combination. They wanted windows that could be cleaned from the inside and windows that would not be drafty. They would emulate the look of the existing leaded glass.

Ald. Bauman explained how he had restored his windows and put on good storm windows. Other commissioner's added comments about how they had restored windows on their own houses and what a difference a good storm window system made. Tim Stemper commented on the beauty of the windows and how the owners just can't take out windows on a historic building. Ald. Bauman commented that removal would eviscerate the preservation guidelines. Sandra McSweeney commented on how the building is visible from both Lake Drive and North Avenue. Tim Stemper recommended they have good storm windows made, by a company like Acker, and not spend money unnecessarily.

The owners responded that there was nothing beautiful about the windows and that when last painted, it cost \$15,000. Mr. Ruff added that he had been one of the original advocates of the Water Tower Landmark Trust and wouldn't do anything to hurt a building.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to deny replacement windows. The motion carried.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Discussion of the demolition of 1018 E. Knapp Street.

Ron Roberts, supervisor of the Condemnation Section of the Department of Neighborhood Services (DNS), was recognized. He explained that there was one inspector assigned to historic properties.

Ald. Bauman called a brief recess to have copies made of correspondence relating to the demolition of the above property.

When the meeting resumed, Ron Roberts then explained the procedure on volunteer demolitions, those applied for by the owners. Once an application to demolish has been filed, DNS sends notice to the Daily Reporter, to the alderman of that district, and to Historic Preservation (HP). Code does not require notice to HP but this is a system that has been worked out over the years. After a 16-day waiting period, if no application for historic designation has come in, the permit is issued to the applicant. Brian Pionke, then later, Paul Jakubovich, have come over to look at the photos of the proposed demolitions.

The application to demolish 1018 E. Knapp was made on March 31, 2006. The paper form for 1018 E. Knapp Street was held at DNS for Paul's Jakubovich's examination. Paul did look at the paperwork on May 5, 2006. However, by that time, the 16-day waiting period had already expired and the demolition permit had been issued already on April 19, 2006. The application for interim designation was made on May 1, 2006, after the demolition permit had been issued.

Carlen Hatala confirmed that Donna Schlieman had filled out the interim petition on May 1, 2006 but neither of them had been aware that a demolition permit had already been issued. Donna had filed the petition upon recommendation from Ald. D'Amato.

Commissioners then questioned the sequence of events and who was noticed. Ald. D'Amato's staff told Mr. Roberts' staff that they had received the demolition request notice timely. Mr. Roberts responded to another question and stated that there are about 300 demolitions per year, of which about 100 were voluntary (non-condemnations). This year there have been more requests for demolition due to development.

Sandy Folaron was recognized. She stated that she was appalled at the break down in communication and the HPC should work with all the necessary departments to make sure nothing like this happens again.

Donna Schlieman was recognized. She indicated that she was talking to Ald. D'Amato after a Brady Street meeting and that he had indicated 1018 E. Knapp should be saved. Donna added that she was subsequently ill and did not have a chance to file the petition for interim designation until May 1st. She suggested that the building's date should be put on the paperwork so that any building over 50 years old would raise a red flag among the DNS staff. She thanked the HPC for looking into tightening up the procedures.

Ald Bauman said that he would introduce an ordinance change to require a sign off by the HP staff and the Alderman before a demolition permit could be issued. If the sign off was missing, the permit could not be issued. He added that 1018 E. Knapp would have been a good candidate for moving to a different location. He said that he looks at all demolition requests for his district but was not sure all the aldermen looked at theirs in a timely manner.

Hpc Minutes June 19, 2006 Page 4

Ron Roberts stressed that DNS is neutral in the process, to respect the rights of the property owner. He added that there had already been an approved plan for new construction on the site of 1018 E. Knapp Street before the demolition permit had been applied for.

Sandra McSweeney added that she had been aware of the proposed construction. Having an Alderman required to sign off on the permit might be a conflict of interest.

Carlen Hatala reported that the State legislature was considering legislation that would require a public hearing for the demolition of any building 50 years old or older.

Paul Jakubovich indicated that where HP staff has received notice on a timely basis, such as a former parochial school at 2064 S. 14th Street and a former carriage/livery barn at 804 W. Greenfield, he was able to talk to the owners out of immediate demolition and consider rehabilitation or reuse for the buildings. Another condemned building in the North First Street National Register Historic District was likewise saved so the system allows for this.

Ron Roberts indicated that they had already instituted e-mail notification to both HP staff members of any application for demolition. He said he was willing to work on any improvements suggested.

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Certificates of appropriateness approved by staff (see Addendum to the Agenda)
- B. Update on Planning for 25th Anniversary of the HPC

Sandy Ackerman reported that she; Sandra McSweeney and Pat Balon had met with HP staff Carlen Hatala and Barbara Elsner to discuss programming. They discussed possible events but will wait until 2007 for an event.

C. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, July 17, 2006 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.

9. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting adjourned at 4:10 PM.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, July 17, 2006, 3:00 PM

City Hall - 200 East Wells Street. Room 301-A

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Robert Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:00 P. M.

Commissioners present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners Absent: Tim Stemper (Excused)

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES of the June 19, 2006 meeting

Sandra McSweeney wanted the sentence, page 4, and second paragraph to read: "Sandra McSweeney added that she had been aware of the proposed construction. Having an Alderman required to sign off on the permit might be a conflict of interest.

Pat Balon wanted it reflected that she was excused from the June meeting not absent.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded the motion to approve the minutes as corrected. The motion carried

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

None

5. PUBLIC HEARING

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. COA for a new front porch and miscellaneous alterations to the James S. Brown Double House at 1122-24 N. Astor Street (James S. Brown Double House Historic Building) PTS# 32014

Staff Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report and summarized the request to build a new front porch based on historic photos. The proposal also includes selected replacement of windows and adding in windows where they had been removed.

In response to a question by Ald. Bauman about materials, Mr. Jakubovich indicated that ipe wood would be suitable for the porch deck but that Eastern white pine, cedar or redwood would be appropriate for the spindles and decorative details.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the project. The motion carried.

B. COA for a new garage at 2042 N. 2nd Street (Brewers Hill Historic District) PTS# 35384

Staff Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report and summarized how the unusual shape of the lot and building codes dictated the siting and design of the garage. Steel doors would be installed and their design would resemble barn doors. There would be no windows on the north and south elevations.

In response to a question by Matt Jarosz, Mr. Jakubovich indicated that the design had been modified from what was in the commissioner's packets and that the design shown at the meeting was most current.

Matt Jarosz questioned the lack of windows in the gable ends and asked if a contractor had been selected yet. Mr. Jakubovich responded that there would be a service door and windows facing the house but that was all. He added that J.D. Griffiths might be the contractor.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the project. The motion carried.

C. COA for a new garage at 2722 W. State Street. (Concordia Historic District) PTS#

Staff Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report and summarized the project. The new garage would be almost three cars wide, have no windows at the back and sides and have boards in the gable ends with an option for shingles to be used. One large garage door would be used but it would be detailed to look like two doors.

Matt Jarosz questioned why there were no windows in the gable ends, and recommended that the garage design should pick up more details from the house.

Pat Balon indicated that the 12/10-roof pitch looked flimsy and the roof pitch should match the stature of the house. Mr. Jakubovich indicated that a steeper roof pitch would probably cost a couple of hundred dollars more.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the garage with the conditions that the roof pitch is increased to 12/12 and that the gable ends be shingled.

D. Mothballing Certificate for the Louis Bohne/Lohman Funeral Home Livery Stable at 804 W. Greenfield Ave., A. K. A. 1325 S. 8th Street (National Register listed March 17, 1988)

Staff Carlen Hatala presented slides and summarized the history of the National Register-listed property. Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that the owner, La Causa, had no use for the building and were looking at options, such as the sale of the building to a new owner. The building currently has code violations and the mothballing would be a way to stop the reinspection fees and prosecution. The owner has agreed to address the major problems but not the smaller ones and will secure the building. The owner will continue working with HPC staff.

Matt Jarosz commented that the building did not appear to be falling apart and that he would hate to see elements like the parapet removed from the building.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the mothballing certificate per the staff report. The motion carried.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. None.

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Certificates of appropriateness approved by staff (see Addendum)
- B. Michael Mervis will give a presentation on new plans for renovation of the Pabst Brewery district at the August 2006 HPC meeting. Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that the

proposal is on the web at www. pabstproject.com. The new developer plans to preserve 85% of the buildings. Johnson Controls is interested in the Bottling House. Gorman is interested in creating housing in some of the buildings at the north of the property. The silos will be retained. The 1960s buildings will be demolished, and the HPC had agreed to that in the past. No mention was made of continuing the former concept of making the complex into an entertainment venue. The new developer, Zilber, will close on the property before the next HPC meeting.

- C. Public Hearing for permanent historic designation of the Wentworth Avenue/Superior Street Historic District will be held at the August HPC meeting.
- D. National Association of Historic Preservation Commissions will hold its annual conference in Baltimore, Maryland July 27-30, 2006. Register at http://www.uga.edu/napc.
- E. Staff Carlen Hatala reported that just that morning, it had been decided to hold the Mayor's Design Awards and the HPC's Cream of the Cream City Awards in May 2007 instead of January 2007. This new schedule gives staff adequate time to prepare for both events and works into celebrating national Preservation Month.
- F. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, August 21, 2006 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.

9. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Matt Jarosz moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded and the meeting adjourned at 3:50 P.M.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, August 21, 2006, 3:00 PM City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-A

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:05 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Tim Stemper

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES of the August 21, 2006 Meeting

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the July 17, 2006 meeting. Tim Stemper abstained from the vote as he had been excused from the July meeting. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

None

5. PUBLIC HEARING

Chair Ald. Bauman indicated that the public hearing would be moved to the end of the agenda.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. COA for new 2 car garage at 132 E. Brown St. (Brewers Hill Historic District) PTS#33687

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the proposed garage. The project will include a 12/12 roof pitch, a 16-foot wide steel door made to look like two garage doors, and there would be a window and door on the street facing elevation.

In response to a question by Sandra McSweeney, Mr. Jakubovich indicated that the garage was about 2-feet to 3-feet shorter than the house but with the cupola, it would be taller than the house. Ornamental hardware would be optional but could be worked out with staff. Sandra McSweeney recommended that appropriate hardware be used.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved to approve the proposal. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion. The motion carried.

B. Mothball certificate for the Emil Ott House 2121 E. Lafayette Place (North Point South Historic District) PTS#36003

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview on why a mothballing certificate was being requested by the applicant. There are a number of maintenance issues, the most significant of which is the collapse of the carriage porch ceiling. The applicant is requesting one year to correct all violations. If they are not corrected within that time, the Department of Neighborhood Services will resume charging fines.

HPC Minutes August 21, 2006 Page 2

Mrs. Caroline Kondos, the owner, was recognized. In response to a question by Pat Balon, Mrs. Kondos indicated that the roof of the house was slate and the roof of the carriage porch was sheathed with rubber membrane. In response to a question by Matt Jarosz, Paul Jakubovich indicated that each item needing repair would require a separate Certificate of Appropriateness and that he would work closely with the owners to make sure conditions did not worsen.

In response to questions from Sandra McSweeney about the time frame and the urgency needed to repair the carriage porch, Mrs. Kondos indicated that the work would not be delayed but begin on October 16th, so that the roof can be stabilized and carpenters and masons could at least start before the weather gets bad. The weather would be a factor in how fast the work can be finished.

Chair Ald. Bauman asked how long the owners have lived at the property, since this kind of deterioration does not happen overnight. Mrs. Kondos said her husband has lived here 35 years and that she has lived here 31 years but that the problem only got worse the last three years.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved to approve the mothballing certificate with the condition that the deadline for the completion of the work be changed to December 31, 2006. Tim Stemper and Pat Balon seconded the motion. The motion carried.

C. COA for exterior alterations at 808 E. Brady Street (Brady Street Historic District) PTS#36540

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project, which includes a new front porch, a new door at the side elevation, new windows in the ell-wing, and a raised deck in the side yard.

Chair Ald. Bauman asked about the lack of detail drawings for the project. Paul Jakubovich responded that no Certificate of Appropriateness would be issued without the appropriate construction drawings.

The owner, Matthew Anchor, was recognized. Discussion followed about how to line up the windows on the façade so the spacing would be more consistent. Tim Stemper and Sandra McSweeney recommended having the lower level windows line up with those on the second story.

Discussion then followed on the appropriateness of having a raised deck on a 19th century house, especially one that leaves the owners visible to the traffic on Brady Street. Tim Stemper and Sandra McSweeney recommended an at-grade patio area/garden would probably save the owner money as well as look more appropriate.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney made a motion to amend the staff recommendation to include a garden instead of a deck, to approve the fence, to have steps to the new door instead of a raised deck, to install a regular door and not a sliding glass door on the side elevation, and to align the front façade windows. Tim Stemper seconded the motion. The motion carried.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to approve the project with the conditions cited above. The motion carried.

D. COA for the exterior renovation of 541 W. Historic Mitchell Street (Mitchell Street Historic District) PTS#36575

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project.

HPC Minutes August 21, 2006 Page 3

Judy Keller from the Historic Mitchell Street Association was recognized. She supported the proposed renovations.

Commissioners felt that this was a good renovation.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the project. The motion carried.

7. PUBLIC HEARING

The HPC then proceeded with the public hearing for the Permanent Historic Designation of the Wentworth Avenue/Superior Street Historic District.

Staff Carlen Hatala gave an overview of the nomination.

Ald. Tony Zielinski summarized the technical need for keeping the historic designation going until the Common Council would pass the Interim Study Overlay zoning. This type of zoning is used to place protection over an area that is in the process of doing neighborhood planning and considering a zoning change or Conservation District status. Once passed, the historic designation would not be needed and would be placed on file. The Council was expected to take up the Interim Study Zoning matter after its August recess. The neighborhood was working on guidelines for a Conservation District. The Interim Study Overlay district would be larger in boundary that the Interim Historic District.

In response to a question by Matt Jarosz, Carlen Hatala explained the boundary of the Interim Historic District and that it differed from the proposed Overlay Study Zoning boundary because there had not been the time or the neighborhood support for a larger historic boundary.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to call the public hearing to order. The motion carried.

Carlen Hatala administered the oath to those wanting to testify.

Nicole Vitrano, nominator of the Interim Historic Designation, was recognized. She supported continuing the historic status until the Interim Study Overlay Zoning went into effect. She said the zoning overlay boundaries were larger because their concerns included more that the development of the rear of 2557 S. Superior Street. She also expressed concern that the foundation was poured for a new dwelling at 1704 E. Pryor Avenue over a month ago but that all work had stopped.

Sue Miller was recognized. She indicated that she lives on Superior Street on a half lot and has concerns over developers' trying to optimize their investments by building mammoth structures not in keeping with the neighborhood. She supported continuing the historic designation.

Brad Hoeschen, attorney for owner Joseph Hoffman, was recognized. He stated that his client owns 1704 E. Pryor Avenue and that the building will be a 2-unit condo, and will mimic the historic look of the house at 1710 E. Pryor. He added that the work had stopped because the foundation needed time to cure and that the carpenters were not ready to work on this project. They are not making any modifications to the approved plans and they legally could not do so without going through the city. Mr. Hoeschen stated that his client supports the Interim Study Overlay zoning. He added that the commission was manipulating its rules and was being manipulated by the property owners. Historic designation is for truly historic properties, which these are not. By recommending permanent historic designation with the intent that it will never go through but be set aside for the Interim Study Overlay zoning, the commission is going against its own guidelines.

Chair Ald. Bauman asked Mr. Hoeschen why he cared if the commission manipulated the system. Sandra McSweeney indicated that in her estimation, the properties have historic,

HPC Minutes August 21, 2006 Page 4

architectural and cultural importance in compliance with Criteria e-8 of the ordinance. She said that buildings did not need to be Lake Drive mansions to qualify for designation.

Ald. Zielinski added that all of these properties were within the National Register Historic District so were historic. He stated that he had worked with the (prior) owner of 1704 E. Pryor to make sure the new construction was compatible with the neighborhood.

Becky Rabatin was recognized. She is a former resident of Bay View. She stated that there had been inappropriate development in Chicago in the midst of historic areas and she did not want to see that happen in Bay View.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz then moved to recommend permanent historic designation on the basis of Criteria e-8 of the ordinance. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion. The motion carried.

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Elizabeth Terry from Partners for Sacred Places will give an overview on their training program for churches on October 9, 2006. The HPC commissioners are welcome.
- B. Carlen Hatala reported that there had been inquiries from a realty firm about the redevelopment of the Harnischfeger site and the possibility of demolishing the house. They are being told that this would be not be supported by staff and that development plans should be forwarded to Ald. Bauman. Carlen Hatala reported that the future of the Coast Guard Station is again in jeopardy as the group who had planned to restore the building, HONOR, was disbanding. Milwaukee County will again have to find a new owner /tenant for the building.
- C. Update on the Pabst Brewery project. Paul Jakubovich reported that HP staff had met with representatives from the new owner and that they would be coming before the commission for approval of selected demolitions within the complex. HPC commissioners might be invited to tour one of the buildings so that they can see its condition first hand.
- D. National Trust Conference October 31-November 5, 2006 in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.
- E. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, September 18, 2006 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.

9. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting adjourned at 4:50 P.M.



MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, September 18, 2006, 3:00 PM

City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-A

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:02 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Tim Stemper

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES of the August 21, 2006 Meeting

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the August 21, 2006 meeting. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

None

5. NEW BUSINESS

A. Bridge repair and reconstruction at 101 East Kilbourn – Kilbourn Avenue Bridge Historic Structure

Paul Jakubovich gave the staff report on the various aspects of the project that include: a new deck; the restoration of the two bronze bells; removal of concrete balustrade/balusters and replacement with stone to match originals; add lighting; restore stone in various locations; building a new crash barrier to protect pedestrians.

Most of the discussion centered on the appearance of the new crash barriers since there were no details with the COA application. Craig Liberto from DPW suggested that the commissioners look at the crash barriers on the 6th Street Bridge and the McKinley Avenue/Knapp Street Bridge downtown. The crash barriers will consist of 2 horizontal rails and posts 8 feet on center. The crash barriers will be 2½ feet tall so as to be less visible. Mr. Liberto added that there would also be a 5-foot wide bike lane on the bridge, as have the other new bridges. The reconstructed State Street Bridge will have a bike lane and crash barriers as well when it is completed.

In answer to Matt Jarosz's question about lighting, Paul indicated that he had been out to the bridge once and that the goal was to wash light up all four walls of the bridge houses, and to illuminate the girders.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz moved to approve the repair and reconstruction as per the staff report but with the condition that the lighting be reviewed by staff and brought to the HPC at the discretion of staff and that the crash barrier be

HPC Minutes September 18, 2006 Page 2

redesigned to have a more historic profile instead of a tubular generic form and that these details be submitted to staff. Pat Balon seconded the motion. The motion carried.

B. Rebuild 3 storefronts at 219-25 East Wisconsin and 3 storefronts around the corner at 635 N. Broadway - East Side Commercial Historic District

Paul Jakubovich presented the staff report and indicated that section drawings and details were still needed for the submission. Carlen Hatala summarized the alterations that had occurred to the buildings over time including the construction of additional stories and the removal of upper stories.

John Klement and Mike Helminiak, representatives of the owners, were recognized. Mr. Klement indicated that they had closed on the properties in January of 2006 and had removed the exterior metal cladding to see what remained of the original facades.

Matt Jarosz indicated that the designs looked pretty good and asked the owners if they considered putting back the missing stories that had been removed.

Mr. Klement responded that they had considered this for 219-223 E. Wisconsin but that it would require the installation of an elevator and other interior modifications. It could still be a possibility, however.

In response to a question by Sandra McSweeney, Mr. Helminiak indicated that the rounded bay for 219-223 E. Wisconsin would sit on a rounded cornice that projected out from the building. Paul Jakubovich indicated that the details on this bay needed to be adjusted with the posts being wider for example.

In response to questions from Matt Jarosz and Pat Balon, Mr. Helminiak indicate that the bulkheads would be clad in granite and that the differing heights on the Wisconsin Ave. buildings would reflect their historic appearance and allow room for cornice returns.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the project per the staff report. The motion carried.

There was a brief discussion about the fire escapes that showed up in the historic views and when they became commonly used.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

A. None.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Certificates of appropriateness approved by staff (see Addendum)
- B. Reminder-Orientation for New Dollars/New Partners training by Partners for Sacred Places, October 9, 2006, 809 Building 9:30 AM and 6:30 PM.

- C. The HPC Cream of the Cream City Awards are scheduled for May 31, 2007.
- D. Matt Jarosz briefed the commissioners on the status of the City Hall restoration. He indicated that the new terra cotta had been delivered and rejected. The color was too uniform and did not capture the range that is in the historic terra cotta. He added that the building has been divided into four areas with a different color assigned to each but that the end product is too uniform. Ald. Bauman thought the color was too purple. Paul Jakubovich added that the terra cotta manufacturer working on City Hall (Gladding McBean) had had to re-do the terra cotta four times on a project on Mitchell Street before they got it right.

Matt continued that the west side tile replacement area showed poor workmanship with sloppy mortar and large mortar joints and the color was off. This would be unacceptable craftsmanship for the restoration of any building let alone City Hall. Sandra McSweeney asked why the contractor couldn't match the existing mortar joints. Matt Jarosz indicated that the problem of color and quality showed up months ago and that input from him and HP staff was rejected. There should be a way to have input on the project. The sample masonry work shown to Matt and staff had mortar joints that were way too large but the contractor replied that was how they were going to do it. Chair Ald. Bauman invited Matt Jarosz to speak at the next Public Works Committee meeting on October 4th.

- E. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, October 16, 2006 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.
- 8. ADJOURNMENT. There being no further business, Chair Ald. Bauman adjourned the meeting at 4:01 P.M.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, October 16, 2006, 3:00 PM

City Hall - 200 East Wells Street. Room 301-A

ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:05 P. M.

Commissioners Present: Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Tim Stemper

Commissioners Absent: Sandy Ackerman

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES of the September 18, 2006 Meeting

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the September 18, 2006 meeting. The motion carried.

CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

None

5. NEW BUSINESS

A. Build new 2-1/2-car garage at 3009 W McKinley Blvd. Owner-Jason Patti (Cold Spring Park Historic District). PTS#30471

Paul Jakubovich gave the staff report. The existing 1960s garage will be demolished and replaced with a carriage barn-style, 21/2 car garage. The building will have a dormer facing the house and a steel door made to look like barn doors.

Sandra McSweeney suggested that appropriate hardware be used on the door.

Matt Jarosz said the design looked fine and asked whether the owner would be taking bids on the construction. Mr. Jakubovich indicated that the owner had a contractor and would build the garage himself.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to allow demolition of the old garage and approve the plans for the new carriage barn-style garage. The motion carried.

B. Build new 2-car garage at 3304 W Kilbourn Ave. Owner-Pam Johnson (Concordia Historic District). PTS#36284

Paul Jakubovich gave the staff report. The new garage will be built by J. D. Griffiths, using some drawings supplied by staff. The garage will be accessed by a curb cut on 33rd Street since the alley has a power line obstructing access there. Staff recommended wood cladding rather than Hardi-plank since the garage is at a corner and highly visible. Staff left it up to the owner whether or not to use paver bricks or concrete for the driveway.

There was a brief discussion about paving materials and what would be cost effective.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the plans as submitted but with the condition that wood cladding be used. The motion carried.

C, Mothball Certificate at 1948-1950 North 2nd Street. Owner-Anna San Diego (Brewers Hill Historic District.) PTS#37546

Paul Jakubovich gave the staff report in which he indicated that the owner had orders for repair to

HPC Minutes October 16, 2006 Page 2

the duplex that she was unable to complete within the 30 days specified by DNS. Her work plan shows that she will be able to complete the general exterior rehab by June 1, 2007.

The owner, Anna San Diego, was recognized. She had lived in the duplex for 2 years but now lived 3 blocks away. She explained her attempts to get extensions on the work orders but had difficulties when the inspectors assigned to her case were changed.

Ron Roberts from the Department of Neighborhood Services (DNS) was recognized. He indicated that Ms. San Diego should have appealed her work orders rather than pursue mothballing with the Historic Preservation. Mothballing was intended to protect a building that was endanger of demolition but this was a matter of enforcement. He indicated that DNS would stay the enforcement in this case and have Inspector Krey work with the owner. Mr. Roberts recommended adjourning this item.

In response to a question by Pat Balon, Ms. San Diego indicated that she was working on lining up contractors and that staff was assisting in getting a roofing contractor.

In response to a question by Ald. Bauman, Mr. Roberts indicated that Ms. San Diego was not in jeopardy if the matter were adjourned with the HPC and she worked with DNS. The Alderman cautioned that he did not want to see the building messed up just to meet a timetable.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the item so that the owner could work with DNS. The motion carried.

D. Build addition to single family home at 2215 E. Woodstock Place. Owner: Charles Foote & Laurel Maney. (North Point South Historic District) PTS#37931

Paul Jakubovich gave the staff report. The owners of the 1950s duplex proposed to build a 1-story addition at the southwest corner of the house for a master bedroom. The neighbors did not object to the proposal. Staff was concerned that the brick, trim and siding match the original house. He indicated that the applicant needed to work with staff.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Tim Stemper seconded a motion to approve the addition. The motion carried.

E. Pabst Brewery Project – Demolition and abatement plan. (Pabst Brewery) PTS#7000

Paul Jakubovich gave the staff report. The proposal to demolish a number of non-contributing buildings within the historic district was similar to that submitted by the previous owner in 2005. Staff supported the requested demolitions except for building #11. The stepped gable building is a contributing building to the historic district. It is a solid brick building with load bearing walls and interior wooden beams. The roof has holes and the interior floors are unsound. Brian McCormick at the State Preservation office had not been able to review the project before today's HPC meeting. A reading from the state is necessary. The demolition of a contributing building could jeopardize tax credits on other buildings within the district.

Dan McCarthy from Brewery Project LLC was recognized. In response from questions from Ald. Bauman, Mr. McCarthy indicated that they believed Building #11 was not repairable but that they could wait until the State Preservation Office made its assessment.

In response to a question by Matt Jarosz, Paul Jakubovich indicated that Building #17 was also contributing but that it had no principal façade and was in the middle of a block.

In response to a question by Matt Jarosz, Mr. McCarthy indicated that buildings would be sold to individual developers and that the HPC could read about this at Pabstproject.com.

In response to a question by Sandra McSweeney, Mr. McCarthy indicated that the roof of Building #11 had not been maintained in years, probably going back to the ownership of Mr. Kalmonowitz maybe 20 years ago.

In response to a question by Pat Balon, Paul Jakubovich said he thought Building #11 might have been designed by Otto Strack. Carlen Hatala indicated that the National Register nomination cited Charles Hoffman as the designer per the permit records. [NOTE: Hoffman designed a number of the buildings with crenellated parapets in the district, including the Bottling House in 1889]

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the demolition of the requested buildings except for Building #11. The motion carried

6. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Overview of the orientation for New Dollars/New Partners training by the Partners for Sacred Places. (Matt Jarosz and Carlen Hatala)

Carlen Hatala reported that the orientation on October 9th went well and that a few more churches were needed for the training to be scheduled. The commissioners were informed that they were free to share the Sacred Places materials (included in their agenda packets) with any church of their choosing.

B. Report on City Hall as presented to the Public Works Committee meeting October 4, 2006

Matt Jarosz summarized his testimony before the Public Works Committee. Other commissioners present included Tim Stemper, Sandy Ackerman and Pat Balon as well as Ald. Bauman who chairs the committee. There will be quarterly reports from now on to help keep the work up to preservation standards.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Certificates of appropriateness approved by staff (see Addendum)
- B. Update on Pabst Metropolitan Hall

Paul Jakubovich reported that the hall has had a fire and the owner is unable to repair the building and is considering selling the property. It is locally designated but just outside the boundaries of the city's Bronzeville District so getting funds directed to the historic building has been difficult. Pat Balon mentioned a national organization that promotes historic jazz venues and that we should inform them about this building.

- C. The special meeting for the interim designation public hearing for 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Blvd. will take place on Wednesday, October 25, 2005 at 3 P. M.
- D. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, November 13, 2006 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.
- E. Donna Schleiman was recognized. She expressed concerns about the Humboldt Avenue Ward Yard site. Blacktop paving was being installed instead of a traditional concrete sidewalk. Staff Paul Jakubovich said he would look into the matter.

8. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting adjourned at 4:12 P. M.



MINUTES AS CORRECTED

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

SPECIAL MEETING HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Wednesday, October 25, 2006, 3:00 PM

First Floor Board Room, 809 Building, 809 N. Broadway

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:06 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz,

Sandra McSweeney, Tim Stemper

Commissioners Absent: Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES

A. None at this meeting

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. OLD BUSINESS

None

5. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Public Hearing on a petition for Interim Historic Designation for the Louis Auer & Son Houses at 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard

Staff Carlen Hatala gave the staff report and swore in those wishing to testify.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to open the public hearing.

Chair Ald. Bauman recognized those who were in favor of the interim designation.

Robin Van Harpen read a prepared statement. She nominated the buildings and has been in the neighborhood eight years. She stated that it was a mistake to demolish good, affordable houses that have been mostly owner occupied over their 90-year history. The two corner buildings are stable and intact. She encouraged the commissioners to get a flavor of the block by walking around the neighborhood. She stated that a realtor friend has been in all six houses and thinks they are more attractive on the interior than exterior and show excellent craftsmanship. The houses epitomized the American dream at the time they were built. Owners have made investments in the properties, like garages, over the years. The houses at 2005 and 2009 are not derelict and they deserve to be preserved. They are part of a vibrant neighborhood where people can walk to work. There are other locations for the proposed new building. If the houses come down for a multi-level, institutional building, the block cannot come back, the damage is irreversible.

HPC Minutes October 25, 2006 Page 2

Ald. D'Amato was recognized. He stated that Hillel has been a good neighbor, he lives on the same block, and it deserves a new building but it is a huge mistake to locate it here. Ald. D'Amato urged the commission to grant interim designation today on the basis of criteria e-5 and e-8 and feels that the two houses work together with the other four on the block. He suggested that the rest of the block be nominated as well. He stated that he had met with Hillel and told them he would not support the new building on Kenwood Boulevard. The worst possible solution is tearing down numbers 2005 and 2009. Perhaps they can combine the houses with an addition and not demolish them. Interim designation provides the time to study the matter further.

<u>Karen Svehla</u>, resident of 3058 N. Murray was recognized. She indicated that she lives immediately south of the nominated properties. She urged interim designation so that these houses, in good condition and with lots of architectural detail, are not lost to the community. She does not want to have development chip away at pockets of the neighborhood.

<u>David Lieske</u>, owner of 2019 E. Kenwood Boulevard, said the architectural character of the two houses adds value to the city.

<u>Bill Felsing</u> of 2015 E. Kenwood Boulevard lives immediately east of the nominated properties. His two children attend UWM and he has spent money rejuvenating his home. He urged designation.

<u>Thomas Paschke</u>, of 532 Crescent Court, is a former owner of 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard. He lived in the house for seven years and on the East Side for twenty years. He took special care to give the house the right colors and wallpaper. He thought it would be a travesty to lose the house. He presented the HPC with interior views of the house.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and <u>Sandra McSweeney</u> seconded the motion to accept the interior views into the record. The motion carried.

<u>Dr. Charles Van Norman</u>, 3041 N. Murray Avenue, indicated that the houses at 2005 and 2009 are in good, move-in condition and have cultural significance to the neighborhood. He asked the HPC to not let someone who does not care for the neighborhood destroy what the neighborhood has.

Kay Baldwin testified that she is a thirty-five year resident of the neighborhood and lives at 1811 E. Kenwood Boulevard. She stated that she is a past president of the Murray Hill Neighborhood Association, which is a confederation of five associations around UWM. For the past 5 to 6 years the association has been trying to preserve the historic housing stock in the neighborhood in order to retain the neighborhood's unique and historic character. She indicated that the neighborhood worked with UWM in 2003 to come up with a plan for the area. The plan was approved by the City Plan Commission. One of the strategies was to get historic district or conservation district status and preserve the historic nature of the East Side. She asked the HPC to help them preserve the neighborhood.

<u>Joan Van Norman</u>, 3041 N. Murray Avenue, moved to the neighborhood ten years ago because of the rich architecture. She can see the nominated properties from her front porch. She said you might not absorb the importance the first walk by but there is a lot of design and craftsmanship in the houses. She asked the HPC to preserve the houses so that her grandchildren would know them. Junk is everywhere. Don't lose these houses.

HPC Minutes October 25, 2006 Page 3

<u>Else Ankel</u>, 3368 N. Bartlett Avenue, indicated she is opposed to the demolition of 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard. She moved to the East Side forty years ago because it was interesting with bus transportation, the river, and the lake. The variety is important to the neighborhood. The five neighborhood associations in the area support preserving these houses. It is not just one block but all blocks together that are important.

Brian McGinley, 2029 E. Kenwood Boulevard, indicated he and his wife have lived on the 2000 block for two years. He has been inside five of the six houses on the block and they have the same detail. He urged finding a different site with buildings that are not this beautiful and in such good condition.

<u>Laverne Lund</u>, 3051 N. Murray Avenue, testified that she has lived in the neighborhood thirty-three years. She said this block is unique; all the houses are different but have significance as a grouping. She urged the HPC to protect this block.

<u>Pamela Frautschi</u>, 2430 E. Newberry Boulevard, has lived forty-one years at her address and is the immediate past secretary of the Murray Hill Association. She supports the research done on the two nominated properties. She indicated that the neighborhood has been under siege for the last five years because of UWM and all the tax-exempt properties. She urged the owners of 2005 and 2009 to reconsider their plans and find another location.

Chair Ald. Bauman read the names of those registered in support of interim historic designation but who did not wish to speak:

<u>Richard Ippolito</u> (2430 E. Newberry Boulevard); <u>Jean Casper</u> (2711 N. Hackett Avenue); <u>Cynthia Sommer</u> (3137 N. Cramer Street); <u>Erik Nilsson</u> (3379 N. Cramer Street); <u>Andrew Melzer</u> (3063 N. Murray Avenue); <u>Jayne Pelton</u> (3054 N. Oakland Avenue); <u>Christina Rigby-McCotter</u> (3024 N. Murray Avenue).

Ald. D'Amato indicated that Craig Kammholz would be coming from his job at the comptroller's office to testify but had not arrived yet.

Chair Ald. Bauman recognized those opposed to the nomination.

<u>Stephen Chernoff</u>, attorney for the Milwaukee Jewish Federation, requested an adjournment of the hearing so that there would be time to go over the Interim Designation Study Report and prepare proper rebuttal. They had just received the study report yesterday and some information appeared to be incorrect. He assured the commissioners that there would be no demolition while this matter was pending.

In response to a question by Chair Ald. Bauman, staff Carlen Hatala indicated that the report had been completed yesterday, due to the tight time restraints imposed by the preservation ordinance.

<u>Craig Kammholz</u>, 3034 N. Murray, was recognized. He and his family came here from Washington, D.C. and lived near large universities there. There the residential areas were not broken up by development and the same should apply here. On some streets south of Newberry Boulevard large apartment blocks were allowed to be built which disrupted the character of the neighborhood. He urged the commissioners to look at the neighborhood as a whole and help preserve the good balance there is today. The neighborhood is at a tipping point and more inappropriate development would discourage owner occupancy. His

HPC Minutes October 25, 2006 Page 4

request for a curb cut and parking with his house was denied as damaging to the neighborhood. The Hillel proposal is as well. The new building would contribute to an

already difficult parking situation. He requested notice of any proposed demolition of the houses on Kenwood Boulevard. His wife, Rebecca Cook, also supports historic designation.

Ald. Bauman indicated that if he were to adjourn the public hearing and reconvene at the next HPC meeting on November 13th, then he would only take testimony from Mr. Chernoff in rebuttal to the testimony taken today.

Mr. Chernoff indicated that in addition to him, they might have experts to testify as well.

Commissioner Balon indicated that the criteria under consideration remain the same whether or not the hearing was recessed.

Chair Ald. Bauman acknowledged the overwhelming support of the designation from the neighborhood. He said the staff report carried great weight and it was appropriate to let the opposition have adequate time to study it and prepare a rebuttal.

Robin Van Harpen said that the neighbors had only had a short time to prepare as well.

Commissioner McSweeney asked if Hillel was on the tax rolls. Ald. D'Amato responded that the matter of whether or not they are a religious institution was being studied but that Hillel had a special use zoning which ended in 1985. They are not taxed at the present

Chair Ald. Bauman reminded everyone that only the architectural and historic significance could be reviewed and not zoning matters. Commissioner Balon concurred and said that no testimony would be taken on the proposed use of the site on Kenwood Boulevard.

Stephen Chernoff agreed, and indicated that religious status was not at issue, only the propriety of the interim designation.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved to recess the public hearing until the November 13th commission meeting. Sandra McSweeney seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Ald. Bauman indicated that there would not be new testimony taken from those who testified today when the hearing reconvened in November.

Commissioner McSweeney asked for verbal reassurance from Mr. Chernoff that the buildings would not come down in the meantime and he said that they do not have the permits to do so and that the buildings would remain.

Ald. Bauman called the meeting adjourned.



MINUTES CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

Monday, November 13, 2006, 3:00 PM

City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-A

1. **ROLL CALL**

Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:02 P. M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra MsSweeney, Tim Stemper

Commissioners Absent: Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

2. **MINUTES of the October 16, 2006 Meeting**

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Tim Stemper seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the October 16, 2006 meeting. The motion carried

3. **CONSENT AGENDA**

None

4. **OLD BUSINESS**

Chair Ald. Bauman explained that the public hearing for the interim designation of 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard would be continued at the December 11, 2006 meeting of the HPC rather than the November meeting. This was done at the request of the David Halbrooks, the attorney representing the neighborhood. Both sides will be properly represented at the December meeting.

A. Demolition of Pabst building #11

Chair Ald. Bauman explained that the State Historical Society's preservation office had concerns about the demolition of Pabst Brewery Building # 11. The owner, through Dan McCarthy, requested this item be adjourned until the December 11, 2006 HPC meeting in order to be better prepared. Mr. McCarthy was not present at today's meeting.

5. **NEW BUSINESS**

A. New storefronts at 604-608 W. Mitchell Street (Mitchell Street Historic District)

Paul Jakubovich gave the staff report. The building at # 604 was most likely a house with a storefront and side addition added later. The smaller building at #608 had a boomtown gable. The renovations would return the facades closer to a late 19th century appearance. Paul Jakubovich and Erin Lanham worked on the façade design. A façade grant might be given to the owner if the HPC approved the drawings presented at today's meeting.

Sandra McSweeney suggested substituting three double-hung sash on the second story of #604, to save money, and dividing the large storefront window, to the right of the door, into two windows.

The owner, Demetra Copoulos, was recognized. She indicated that with all that was happening on Mitchell Street, her buildings looked shabby and needed new facades if she could afford it. She liked the design provided by staff. The owner was non-committal about the windows and indicated that with all the street noise, the upper windows were not opened much anyway. In answer to a question by Pat Balon, Ms. Copoulos indicated that the second floor was residential.

HPC Minutes November 13, 2006 Page 2

In response to a question by Chair Ald. Bauman, Ms. Copoulos indicated that she wanted to get COA approval before pricing out the work.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the design of the new storefronts as presented by staff. The motion carried.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

None

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Certificates of appropriateness approved by staff (see Addendum)
- B. Update on Pabst Metropolitan Hall, 537-541 W. Clarke Street

Staff passed around a historic view of the building as well as current slides of its fire-damaged state. Paul Jakubovich indicated that although there is a party willing to market the historic property, the owner, L. C. Whitehead, has decided to build a nursing home on the site. The building may be condemned or else the owner will be applying for a COA to demolish the building. The HPC might be reviewing a demolition request on the building.

(Matt Jarosz joined the meeting at 3:25 and asked about the Pabst Building #11. He was informed it was adjourned until the December meeting)

- C. Cream of the Cream City Awards Application forms. A subcommittee of the HPC will be needed to work on the nominations as they come in. Commissioners were asked to nominate projects they thought were worthwhile and to think about serving on the subcommittee to review the nominations.
- D. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, December 11, 2006 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells Street.

8. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting adjourned at 3:30 P. M.



MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING Monday, December 11, 2006, 3:00 PM City Hall - 200 East Wells Street, Room 301-A

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting to order at 3:10 P. M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Tim Stemper

Commissioners Absent: Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich

2. MINUTES

A. Approval of the November 13, 2006 HPC meeting minutes. Approval of the minutes was moved to the end of the agenda per consensus of the commissioners.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

Chair Ald. Bauman outlined the order of business for the two public hearings.

Item 4A, the petition for Interim Historic Designation of 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard, had been adjourned at the special meeting held October 25, 2006 and had been scheduled to reconvene at the November 13, 2006 HPC meeting. At the request of David Halbrooks, counsel for the neighborhood, the adjournment was continued and the public hearing on this matter will be heard today, December 11, 2006. The testimony will continue with those opposed to the designation. Those who testified before in favor of the designation will not be allowed to speak again.

Item 4B, the Interim Historic Designation of the properties addressed at 2005, 2009, 2015, 2019, 2025 and 2029, was discussed. At question was whether or not an interim petition could be filed for a district and whether or not the public hearing for Item 4B could be heard at this meeting. The city attorney's office, after reviewing the HPC ordinance, determined that the ordinance did not address districts. Attorney David Halbrooks stated that the petition was for six individual buildings and not a district. HPC staff said that they clarified the mistake on the original agenda and issued a corrected agenda within the time guidelines required for hearing notices. HPC staff also indicated that a district was typically described by boundaries and not individual addresses. City Attorney Linda Burke reviewed the original application form and concurred that it listed individual properties and not a district. There was further discussion about merging the two files since 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard were also included in Item 4B. Both attorneys, David Halbrooks and Stephen Chernof, wanted the items kept as separate files.

Chair Ald. Bauman reminded those who were to testify that their comments were to be confined to the criteria in the preservation ordinance and not zoning, parking, congestion or other issues.

A. Reconvened Public Hearing on a petition for Interim Historic Designation for the Louis Auer & Son Houses at 2005 and 2009, E. Kenwood Boulevard

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to reopen the public hearing on the proposed Interim Historic Designation of 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard. The motion carried.

Staff Carlen Hatala swore in those who were to testify for both items on the agenda.

Chair Ald. Bauman recognized Stephen Chernof. Mr. Chernof introduced those present from the Milwaukee Jewish Federation and Milwaukee Hillel and those who were to testify against the designation. The chair allowed Mr. Chernof a little leeway, over the objections of attorney David Halbrooks, to express dismay at what he considered malicious blogs and e-mails directed against the Milwaukee Jewish Federation's proposal to demolish the E. Kenwood Boulevard houses.

Commissioner Balon interjected that blogs and e-mails were irrelevant and that the testimony heard at the HPC was what counted. She was insulted that someone could think that the commissioners would be swayed by outside information.

Stephen Chernof summarized efforts to find a new site for the Hillel Center. He stated that they believed the Kenwood Boulevard houses were not historic, questioned that their classification as bungalows, questioned the importance of the Louis Auer & Sons firm, did not think that Hugo Miller was an important architect, and indicated that the houses did not appear in the Heritage Guidebook and were not mentioned in John Gurda's book The Making of Milwaukee. He questioned the scholarship of the study report.

<u>James Dallman</u>, architect, was recognized. He spoke as an expert witness on behalf of the Milwaukee Jewish Federation but his comments on the context of the proposed new development for Kenwood Boulevard were interrupted by the chair as irrelevant to the hearing.

Grace La, architect, professor of architecture at UWM and partner with James Dallman, was recognized. She spoke as an expert witness on behalf of the Milwaukee Jewish Federation. Her testimony included statements that Kenwood Boulevard was a transition zone between the neighborhood and the university; it was a traffic arterial and not domestic in scale. The neighborhood was a mix of buildings and not just single-family residences. She continued that bungalows were all over the city and not an important building type and there were better examples than the ones under consideration in this hearing, and that bungalows of the Arts and Crafts style were better than ones that had "derivative" "potluck" historic styling. She indicated that historic districts had to include both sides of a street, not just one. She said the architectural features on the houses are ones found anywhere and were not special, and she thought that the fact they were built by a developer and not custom designed made them repetitive, and that the garages disfigured the lots. Ms. La concluded that she did not consider Louis Auer & Son important and that the attribution to architect

Hugo Miller was speculative. Even if he were the architect, Hugo Miller designed better houses, like on Bartlett Avenue.

<u>George Mayer</u>, Kahler Slater Architects, was recognized. He stated that he agreed with the comments of Grace La and James Dallman and that there were better examples of bungalows elsewhere in the city.

lan Martin, Godfrey & Kahn, was recognized. He passed out copies of a large report to the commissioners. It summarized the PowerPoint presented by Grace La and James Dallman and had additional information. Mr. Martin added that the UWM plan cited in the study report covered more items in addition to the section on neighborhood preservation. He said the UWM report was consistent with what Hillel wants to do. Mr. Martin concluded with comments about the lack of importance of architect Hugo Miller and Louis Auer & Son. He questioned why the neighborhood had waited to designate the buildings until today and commented that inappropriate alterations had been made to the buildings. Commissioner McSweeney indicated that the report could not be immediately reviewed by the HPC at the meeting because of its length and Mr. Martin agreed.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to include the report as part of the record. The motion carried.

Martin Katz, 7718 N. Beach Drive, was recognized. He stated that there were better bungalows than those proposed for historic designation today.

<u>Joanne Ladenson</u>, 3133 N. Marietta Avenue Unit 10, was recognized. She stated that she was a native Chicagoan, familiar with Hyde Park and familiar with historic designations. She thought the houses on Kenwood Boulevard between Downer Avenue and Oakland Avenue were uniquely non-descript. She did not support designation.

<u>Jerry Benjamin</u>, 2825 E. Newberry Boulevard, said this was a straw dog issue and the commission should smell the wind around the issue. He said to treat historic structures as they were meant to be treated.

Nathan Bernstein, 1661 N. Water Street #509/8340 N. Santa Monica Boulevard, said that his parents lived in the 2700 block of Maryland Avenue. He praised the historic renovations going on in the Third Ward. He said the Kenwood Boulevard houses could not be tied to an architect so the case goes out the window.

<u>Eliot Bernstein</u>, 2773 N. Maryland Avenue, indicated that he has lived in the neighborhood for 40 years. He supported bringing in a religious institution because the Federation wants to conform to the ambiance of the neighborhood. It was better than modifications for student housing.

<u>Avraham Pittleman</u>, 2424 East Webster Place #103, tried to explain how Hillel was important to his life but Chair Ald. Bauman interrupted his comments as not being relevant to the criteria.

Heidi Rattner, Executive Director Milwaukee Hillel, explained that she has been director

for two and a half years. She indicated that they work to be good neighbors and HPC maintain their properties. Hillel students make good neighbors. Chair Ald. Bauman interrupted her comments as not being relevant to the criteria.

Other individuals opposed to the historic designation but who did not wish to speak included: Yonatan Zvi (310 E. Juniper Lane, Mequon); Jake Velleman (2443 N. Cramer #21); Michael Maislelman (3127 W. Wisconsin Avenue); Heather Zucker (2536 N. Cramer Street); Tony Rodriguez (did not provide address); S. Lieberman (5067 N. Cumberland, Whitefish Bay); Lorraine Hoffman (3021 N. Lake Drive); Jerome T. Safer (829 E. Glen, Whitefish Bay); Benji Berlow (1551 N. Warren Avenue), Betty Lieberman (1360 N. Prospect Avenue); Allen Kwass (PO Box 511384 Milwaukee); Fred Croen (6934 N. Spencer Avenue, Glendale); Richard Meyer (1360 N. Prospect Avenue); and Nancy Einhorn (8205 N. River Road River Hills).

Attorney David Halbrooks and Robin Van Harpen requested that their expert witness be allowed to testify. Attorney Stephen Chernof questioned this matter. Ald. D'Amato indicated it was his understanding that new people and experts who had not testified before could be heard. Commissioner McSweeney added that there were inaccuracies in Ms. La's comments and she wanted to hear from staff as well.

<u>Gary Tipler</u>, historic preservation consultant from Madison and National Register preparer with experience in Madison and Milwaukee, was recognized as an expert witness in support of the designation. He indicated that context involved more that what was on both sides of the street. He thought the Kenwood bungalows represented a "transitional period" in design just prior to the popularity of the Colonial and English Revival period in the 1920s. The houses were modern for their day but used traditional detail. He thought that the study report was competently prepared, and that Louis Auer & Son hired qualified designers. He thought the proposed buildings met criteria e-5 of the ordinance.

Mr. Chernof questioned Mr. Tipler and asked about whether the houses were unique and why they did not represent one style and then questioned his expertise on single-family homes. Mr. Tipler replied that architectural design evolves and that buildings considered transitional are eligible for the National Register just because of that fact. He has studied architectural history for a long time.

Chair Ald. Bauman then recognized those in favor of the nomination.

Ald. D'Amato said he knew who spoke last time and that they would not testify again. He thanked all who appeared. He emphasized that there was no difference of opinion about Hillel. The community supports their work; they run a great operation and keep a well-maintained property. He lives on the same block. He said the opposition centered on their expansion the expense of the two houses on Kenwood Boulevard. He said it is conceivable that the houses meet the criteria for designation. Mr. Martin made the comment that no one had designated these properties before, and it is true that people don't know the gems until they are threatened. That is what this whole process is about. He urged the HPC to vote yes for interim designation. Ald. D'Amato then reminded the HPC of the house on Layton Boulevard threatened by Ascension Lutheran Church. It is now rehabbed and an asset to the community. The houses on

Kenwood Boulevard are important and this is not the only site near UWM to put in a new Hillel center. If the HPC were to vote NO, then it shows that the houses have no value.

Gerard Capell, 2959 N. Frederick, President of the Murray Hill Neighborhood Association, stated that he is a practicing architect who has worked in California and Florence, Italy. The two houses compliment the entire block and they are important to the scale and urban fabric of the neighborhood. The neighborhood is under threat by all sorts of forces and it is important to preserve it. He agreed with Mr. Tipler and felt that "transitional" styles helped to define periods and were worthy of preservation.

<u>Dan McCotter</u>, 3024 N. Murray Avenue, presented the HPC with a letter of support from John Luke, editor of American Bungalow magazine. Mr. McCotter had e-mailed Mr. Luke a copy of the study report with images. He had asked for an opinion about the significance of the Kenwood bungalows and got the support letter in response from Mr. Luke. Chair Ald. Bauman was reluctant to accept the letter into the record but Mr. Halbrooks indicated that Mr. Martin's report was accepted. City Attorney Linda Burke reminded everyone that this proceeding was not adversarial. The letter was accepted into the record. Mr. McCotter continued that he was drawn to the neighborhood because of the historic houses. He felt that the houses were important even if the bungalows did not conform to a specific "type". They were built for the working middle class and that should not be a reason to denigrate them.

<u>Julie Felsing</u>, 2015 E. Kenwood Boulevard, testified that she bought her house two years ago and lives right next door to the two nominated properties. Every single contractor they had work on the house were impressed and commented that no one sees this kind of craftsmanship any more. She added that 3001 N. Bartlett looked like it had the same footprint,

<u>Jeff Grzeca</u>, 3476 N. Shepard Avenue, indicated that Ald. D'Amato gave a good summary. He is the President-elect of the Water Tower Landmark Trust and indicated that their group supports the designation of 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard as well as the rest of the houses on the block.

<u>Paul Stafford</u>, 1819 E. Kenwood Boulevard, testified that he had lived in a Hugo Miller-designed house. He said that "transitional" was not a derogatory term. In paleontology "transitional" is important because it shows the evolution from one form into another and creating a new paradigm. He said that people were missing the forest for the trees. He urged designation for the two houses and all six houses.

<u>Richard Ippolito</u>, 2430 E. Newberry Boulevard, testified that until four years ago, architect Russell Barr Williamson was unknown to the general public. Williamson's son wrote about him and now his houses are desirable. The same applies to architect Hugo Miller and developer Louis Auer & Son. He thought that the north side of Kenwood Boulevard might have been residential before developed by the university.

<u>Jean Casper</u>, 2711 N. Hackett Avenue, testified that she had studied Louis Auer & Son in a seminar conducted by art historian Damie Stillman on Milwaukee architecture. So the firm is significant.

<u>Shale Horowitz</u>, 3057 N. Murray Avenue, stated it was risky NOT to investigate the historic importance of these houses. You can't rule out importance just by looking at one side or gingerbready detail. The houses are distinctive in the neighborhood.

<u>Peter McMullen</u>, 3038 N. Murray Avenue, President of the Cambridge Woods Neighborhood Association, testified that his association supports the designation. The grouping of houses is uninterrupted by alleys or multi-family dwellings and works together as an ensemble.

<u>Andrew Melzer</u>, 3063 N. Murray Avenue, urged the HPC to investigate the designation thoroughly. The next meeting would address permanent designation.

<u>Jayne Pelton</u>, 3054 N. Oakland Avenue, testified that the book, <u>The Making of Milwaukee</u>, touts preservation because once a building is gone, it's gone. She urged the HPC to give this block a chance.

Chair Ald. Bauman read into the record those who supported interim designation but chose not to speak: <u>Janice Bratel</u> (2627 N. Stowell Avenue); <u>Julie Capell</u> (2954 N. Frederick Avenue); <u>Gail Fitch</u> (1733 N. Cambridge Avenue #109); <u>Mary Johnson</u> (2912 N. Murray Avenue); <u>Sally Kasik</u> (3041 N. Stowell Avenue); <u>Karen Mierow</u> (1111 N. Astor Street); <u>Richard Ohly</u> (3019 N. Cramer Street); <u>Glenn Pelton</u> (3054 N. Oakland Avenue); and <u>Donna Schlieman</u> (1300 N. Prospect Avenue).

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a slide presentation that rebutted some of the statements in Ms. La's testimony. The Upper East Side has not been intensively inventoried like the older neighborhoods that were more vulnerable to redevelopment. As part of the North East side planning process, just beginning, historic buildings will be identified. The bungalow is a form and not a style. Slides showing the evolution of the bungalow were shown with comments that the majority were built in the 1920s when period revival cladding was popular on the exterior. Bungalows are an important building type and one grouping, on N. 47th Street, has become a local historic district. Louis Auer & Son hired at least three well-known architects to do their design work. Hugo Miller was one of them. The scrapbooks on his work were not kept from Mr. Martin. They are in the collection of Mr. Miller's grandson who lives in a different state. Staff has only seen copies of images and articles from one of the scrapbooks. Historic districts do not have to have buildings on both sides of the street. There are examples in Milwaukee of both local and National Register districts that are located along one side of a street.

<u>David Halbrooks</u> stated that the two bungalows at 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard appear to meet criteria e-5 and e-8 of the ordinance. They are part of a cohesive group, whether or not this group is referred to as a district. The use of the term "derivative" is not a negative; this points to where change occurred.

<u>Stephen Chernof</u> thought that there should be images of bungalows that have been designated.

Robin Van Harpen urged the HPC support designation or else the houses would be torn down tomorrow. This portion of Kenwood Boulevard is unique because of the absence of institutional buildings. Architectural experts need to be looked at.

There being no further testimony the chair asked for a motion to close the public

hearing.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

Chair Ald. Bauman asked for a motion on the designation.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved that the properties at 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard be given interim historic designation on the basis of criteria cited by staff, criteria e-5 and e-8. Sandy Ackerman seconded the motion.

City attorney Linda Burke indicated that the HPC had 5 days from the hearing in which to make a decision on this matter. The decision would then be issued in the form of a letter prepared by staff. If the decision is NO, then the neighbors could post bond and file an appeal that would be reviewed by the Common Council. If the decision is yes, the property owners can file an appeal. The Common Council would then have to review the matter within 45 days. A hearing for permanent designation will be scheduled within 90 days of a decision approving interim designation. During this time period the owners could apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the buildings. She added that she could advise the HPC on Federal Law regarding religious properties as well if the HPC wanted.

There followed a discussion of whether or not to delay the decision and have staff prepare a document with findings and recommendations. How the HPC members would accomplish voting within 5 days after this hearing was not clear in the ordinance and members discussed the inconvenience of having to schedule a public meeting to accomplish this or else have only 2 to 3 members sign off on the decision. The findings could either be exhaustive or cursory and given the fact that there would be a later hearing for permanent designation, it was decided that a more cursory decision was better. Matt Jarosz indicated that there would be additional research done on the buildings.

REVISED MOTION BASED ON WORDING RECOMMENDED BY CITY ATTORNEY LINDA BURKE: Sandy Ackerman moved to recommend interim historic designation based on the finding of probable success of permanent designation based on criteria e-5 and e-8 of the ordinance. The motion was seconded. The roll call vote was unanimous: Sandra McSweeney (yes), Sandy Ackerman (yes), Tim Stemper (yes), Pat Balon (yes), Matt Jarosz (yes).

B. Public Hearing on a petition for Interim Historic Designation for the Louis Auer & Son houses (2005, 2009, 2015, 2019, 2025 and 2029 E. Kenwood Boulevard)

There was a brief discussion between Chair Ald. Bauman, David Halbrooks and Stephen Chernof about whether or not to concede interim historic designation on the four properties that were not owned by the Milwaukee Jewish Federation. Both attorneys decided to proceed as scheduled on the agenda.

Staff Carlen Hatala presented the staff report with slides.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

Chair Ald. Bauman recognized those in support of the interim historic designation.

<u>David Halbrooks</u> introduced the petitioner, Robin Van Harpen and their expert witness Gary Tipler.

Robin Van Harpen said all six houses have unique characteristics and should be preserved.

<u>Gary Tipler</u> pointed out architectural details and how the ensemble worked together although each house was unique. The fact that this grouping was market driven by a developer, yet was of such high quality, was significant. A similar group of houses, designed by Frank Lloyd Wright, was built by a developer at Burnham Street. The houses reflected a change in lifestyle and society.

<u>Julie Felsing</u>, 2015 E. Kenwood Boulevard, supports designation for all the houses. Their quality is what led her and her husband to buy No. 2015.

<u>Kay Baldwin</u>, 1811 E. Kenwood Boulevard, indicated that one of the slides shown by staff featured her house. She added that these houses are jewels in the neighborhood and are a pleasure to walk by. She supported historic designation.

<u>Charles Van Norman</u>, 3041 N. Murray Avenue, said these bungalows represented affordable houses for their time. They were jewels in the neighborhood and should be preserved.

<u>Joan Van Norman</u>, 3041 N. Murray Avenue, testified that they moved here ten years ago. There is nothing like this in Madison. This is still an intact piece of the east side. Her grandmother attended Downer College. She wants to see these houses preserved as a legacy for her grandchildren.

<u>Deb Jacobson</u>, 3327 N. Oakland Avenue, urged designation for all six houses. She said they might not be perfect but are of value to the neighborhood. These houses are a good way to showcase wondrous houses to students.

<u>David Lieske</u>, 2019 E. Kenwood Boulevard, emphasized the unique character of the block. Visitors are always amazed at the feel of the neighborhood.

<u>Dan McCotter</u>, 3024 N. Murray Avenue, testified that the grouping of houses met his interpretation of the bungalow form. The group was produced by the same designer and has been intact 90 years. He urged the HPC to grant interim historic designation.

<u>Donna Schlieman</u>, 1300 N. Prospect Avenue, stated that she moved to the east side in 1960. Each of the houses is unique and different and has been interpreted by its owners in its own way. Having period revival details makes them distinctive. She urged interim historic designation.

<u>Pam Frautschi</u>, 2430 E. Newberry Boulevard, has lived for 40 years in the neighborhood and has a Russell Barr Williamson-designed house. She urged preservation of all six houses.

<u>Cynthia Sommers</u>, 3137 N. Cramer Street, stated that students don't often get to see houses of this quality. These houses are 100 times more visible on Kenwood Boulevard than on Bartlett Avenue.

<u>Richard Ippolito</u>, 2430 E. Newberry Boulevard, stated that he supported all six buildings as historic.

Chair Ald. Bauman read the names of those supporting designation but who did not wish to speak: <u>Julie Capell</u> (2954 N. Frederick Avenue), <u>Gail Fitch</u> (1733 N. Cambridge #109). <u>Craig Kammholz</u> (3034 N. Murray Avenue), <u>Laverne Lund</u> (3051 N. Murray Avenue), <u>Gloria McCoy</u> (no address given), <u>Erik Nilssen</u> (2523 N. Maryland Avenue), and <u>Richard Ohly</u> (3019 N. Cramer Street).

Sandra McSweeney asked whether all letters and e-mails of support were part of the record. Chair Ald. Bauman replied yes.

Ald. D'Amato stated that is was rare for owners to submit to historic designation. He urged designation for all six houses because splitting them would be a death warrant for the block. He said he's argued for redevelopment when a block has been broken up from its original condition so it is important to keep all six together. Designating all six is stronger than designating just 2005 and 2009 E. Kenwood Boulevard.

Chair Ald. Bauman recognized those opposed to the designation.

James Dallman and Grace La had no further information to present.

Stephen Chernof said that Robin Van Harpen and her husband David Lieske were gracious enough to invite him into their home but that it had been altered with skylights and modern windows and a deck at the rear so its historic character was in question. He did not think this was a proper hearing since the staff report referred to this grouping as a historic district. There was also not enough time to review the staff report. He continued that they were not prepared to deal with all six buildings at this time and since it seemed the inclination of the HPC to designate the buildings, there was nothing further to offer.

Chair Ald. Bauman asked if Mr. Chernof was requesting an adjournment of this item. Mr. Chernof replied no.

<u>Joanne Ladenson</u>, 3133 N. Marietta #10, said she was opposed to all six houses having historic designation.

Chair Ald. Bauman read the names of those opposed to the designation who did not wish to speak: <u>Laura Barnard</u> (5765 N. Shoreland Avenue), <u>John Mann</u> (2606 W. Lake Park Court, Mequon), and Yonatan Zvi (310 E. Juniper Lane, Mequon).

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved to approve interim historic designation
on the six houses based on the finding of probable success of permanent
historic designation, based on criteria e-5 and e-8 of the ordinance. The motion
was seconded by

Discussion followed about whether or not the ordinance allows for the same buildings to be considered under two different applications. This would lead to two separate designations. Further discussion centered on merging the two nominations but since there was different information in each nomination, it was decided to take the vote on the designation of all six houses, which included the two properties in agenda item 4A.

ROLL CALL VOTE: Sandra McSweeney (yes), Sandy Ackerman (yes), Tim Stemper (yes), Pat Balon (yes), Matt Jarosz (yes). The motion to designate carried unanimously.

Chair Ald. Bauman complimented all on their professional demeanor during this long hearing. He informed Mr. Chernof that they would have 5 days to appeal the decision, starting with today.

MINUTES

The HPC then returned to matter of approving minutes from the November meeting.

THE MOTION: Tim Stemper moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to accept the minutes of the November 13, 2006 meeting. The motion carried.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Ald. Bauman called the meeting adjourned at 6:56 PM.