

HISTORIC DESIGNATION STUDY REPORT

ALL SAINTS' EPISCOPAL CATHEDRAL HISTORIC DISTRICT

I. Name

Historic: All Saints' Episcopal Cathedral Historic District

Common: Same

II. Location

The All Saints' Episcopal Cathedral Historic District is located on Milwaukee's lower eastside in an old upper-class residential area formerly known as Yankee Hill. The district includes the Cathedral, the Guild Hall-Cathedral Institute, the former Bishop's House and the surrounding gardens and grounds.

III. Classification

District

IV. Owner of Property

Name: All Saints' Cathedral Corporation

Street: 818 East Juneau Avenue

City: Milwaukee

State: Wisconsin

V. Description

A. Boundaries

The All Saints Episcopal Cathedral Historic District is bounded on the north by the property line between the Cathedral and 1231 North Marshall Street and the Bishop's House and 1222 North Cass Street; on the east by North Marshall Street; on the south by East Juneau Avenue and on the west by North Cass Street.

B. General Character

The All Saints' Episcopal Cathedral Historic District is a U-shaped complex of three stylistically related buildings that surround a garden courtyard open to East Juneau Avenue on the south. The district includes the Cathedral, the Guild Hall-Cathedral Institute and the former Bishop's House, all of which are constructed of cream brick. The Cathedral was designed by Edward Townsend Mix and erected in 1868-69 for the Olivet Congregational Church. Architecturally, it is an excellent example of the Gothic Revival style. The Guild Hall-Cathedral Institute

was erected 1891 and designed by Milwaukee architect, William D. Kimball. It is a two-story, Victorian Gothic structure adjoining the Cathedral on the east. The third building in the district is the former Bishop's House constructed in 1902-03. Milwaukee architects Charles Kirchoff and Thomas L. Rose designed it in the Jacobean Revival style. (A detailed inventory of each building is at the end of this report).

The district lies within the former Yankee Hill neighborhood. This area developed in the mid-nineteenth century as Milwaukee's first prestige residential area for the wealthy and socially elite. Originally the streets were lined with dignified Italianate style mansions and rowhouses. Beginning about the time of World War I, many were replaced with hotels and apartment buildings, a trend that has continued to the present. The neighborhood is still a desirable residential area.

C. Legal Description

Certified Survey Map No 3844 Etc, IN SW ¼ Sec 21-7-22 Parcel 2
Tax key No 360-0932

VI. Statement of Significance

Date Built: 1868-1903

National Register of Historic Places, 1974

Milwaukee Landmark, 1974

Historic American Buildings Survey

All Saints' Episcopal Cathedral Historic District is significant for its outstanding contribution to Milwaukee's ecclesiastical architecture. These three buildings represent the work of four Milwaukee architects - the prolific Edward Townsend Mix, William D. Kimball and the firm of Charles Kirchoff and Thomas L. Rose. Historically, All Saints' has the distinction of being the first Episcopal Church in the United States to be organized as a Cathedral. The significance of the district has previously been recognized by the National Register of Historic Places, the Milwaukee Landmarks Commission and the Historic American Buildings Survey.

VII. History

All Saints' Cathedral traces its origins to a mission established in Milwaukee in 1857 under the auspices of Bishop Jackson Kemper. In 1867 the parish was transferred to Assistant Bishop William E. Armitage who reorganized the congregation as All Saints' Church. In 1869 the congregation purchased property on the northwest corner of Juneau and Prospect Avenues. In that same year a cornerstone was laid for a chapel on All Saints' Day. In 1871 the congregation sold these lots and purchased the Townsend residence on Juneau and Cass Streets. They moved their chapel and school to the new site and used the Townsend house itself as the bishop's residence. After remodeling, the chapel officially reopened on September 3, 1871. The All Saints' property abutted Olivet Congregational Church at the northwest corner of Juneau and Marshall streets. This edifice had been erected in 1868 from the designs of Milwaukee

Architect, Edward Townsend Mix. In 1873 the Olivet congregation sold their church to All Saints'. In this same year, under the influence of Bishop Armitage, the diocesan council passed a resolution designating All Saints' as a Cathedral, though it was not until 1878 that a provisional canon was passed and several years after that the Cathedral as a diocesan rather than parochial organization came into being as it is organized today. All Saints' is widely regarded as the first Episcopal Cathedral in the United States.

Acquisition of Olivet Church gave All Saints' title to all the property along the north side of Juneau Avenue between Marshall and Cass Streets. In 1873 the cathedral complex on Juneau included the newly acquired Olivet Church, the chapel and school of 1869-70, and the frame Townsend house on the northeast corner of Juneau and Cass, which served as the rectory and bishop's residence. The chapel and school were subsequently razed to allow construction of the present Guild Hall, in 1896. The cornerstone from the old chapel was incorporated into this new fabric. This structure was originally intended for use as the Cathedral Institute, a parochial school. It was later remodeled for use as the Guild Hall and now contains the sacristy, offices, the library, an apartment, Sunday school, choir, meeting and storage rooms, and kitchens. Interestingly, there is a window attributed to Tiffany's firm in the former auditorium-gymnasium room on the second story. In 1902, the old Townsend house at Juneau and Cass was removed to a site just behind the cathedral on North Marshall Street and was given a brick veneer and generally refurbished. Named Armitage House, this structure survived until the late 1960's, when it was razed to provide parking space. The present Bishop's House, now known as Nicholson House, designed by Kirchoff and Rose, was erected on the original Townsend house site in 1902-03. Today this building services as the diocesan offices.

Inventory

Name: All Saints' Episcopal Cathedral

Address: 828 East Juneau Avenue

Date Built: 1868-69

Architect: Edward Townsend Mix

Mason John Bentley

Builder: Jacob Blum

Current Use: Church

Description:

The Cathedral is a rectangular structure that measures 80 feet wide by 124 feet in length. It is Gothic Revival in design and basilican in plan with no apse end. At the southeast corner is a massive square tower and belfry with corner buttresses and broached spire that rises almost 190 feet from the base to the top of the cross. Over the nave and chancel is a steeply pitched gabled roof with limestone copings and over the side aisles are pent roofs. At the cornice line is heavy brick corbelling. All roof surfaces and the spire are covered with slate shingles. The wall construction is of traditional

Milwaukee cream brick that has been weathered and soiled to a dull gray color. Limestone is used extensively as trim throughout as copings, buttress caps, sills and belt courses. The edifice is otherwise devoid of ornamentation or embellishment as typical of the early Gothic Revival.

The design of the Cathedral is derived from Medieval English parish churches of the 15th century. The decoration as found in the window tracery and carved oak entry doors is from the Perpendicular period of English Gothic architecture. Indicative of the parish church is the massive corner, square tower and broadened spire. This element distinguishes the principal elevations of All Saints' and can be seen in two other Milwaukee churches; St. James Episcopal Church at 833 West Wisconsin Avenue and St. Patrick's Roman Catholic at 1105 South Seventh Street.

The main entries are deeply recessed, Gothic arched openings - one at the base of the tower on Marshall Street and the other at the center of the main block on Juneau Avenue. The latter is formed by an extended porch with a steeply gabled roof and limestone coping and a pilgrim's cross at the apex. Above this is a circular stained glass window inset in a pointed arch with a curved sill molding and above this a smaller circular stained glass window also inset in a pointed arch. Along the clerestory and side aisles are paired, Gothic-arched stained glass windows with brick hood molds and limestone sills.

Alterations

The exterior of All Saints' has remained virtually unchanged except for minor repairs and maintenance. In 1908 the chancel was extended 14 feet to the north, adding a full bay to the church length. With the use of similar materials and replicating the original design, and the weathering of the materials, the addition is not clearly distinguishable.

Inventory

Name: All Saints' Guild Hall – Cathedral Institute

Address: 814-818 East Juneau Avenue

Date Built: 1891

Architect: William D. Kimball

Builder: Patrick Dunn

Current Use: Auxiliary Church Building

Description

The Guild Hall – Cathedral Institute is a two-story rectangular structure that is adjoined to the Cathedral at the northwest corner. Designed in the more flamboyant manner of the Victorian Gothic, the Guild Hall is characterized by a symmetrically composed facade with a steeply pitched hipped roof that intersects with end pavilions also with hipped roofs. Though it contrasts in design to the Cathedral, the use of similar materials –

cream brick and limestone – that have also weathered, subdues its impact and blends well with the Cathedral's severity.

The windows are largely, single-light double-hung sash. On the ground floor they are grouped in pairs with fixed transoms and square-corned limestone drip molds. On the second floor they are grouped in threes with stone sills and lintels. The pavilions, which extend from the main block, are framed at the corners and divided in the middle with buttresses. At the second level is a tri-parti window arrangement with a center Gothic arched opening with limestone drip mold and flanked by double-hung sash. Above this is a steeply pitched gable that rises above the roof line and trimmed with limestone coping, crockets, and a finial.

Flanking the pavilions are identical entries that are recessed behind porches with Gothic arched openings. Each opening is panned by a stone lintel inscribed with raised letters: "Guild Hall" at the east end and "Cathedral Institute" at the west end. These entry porches are also framed with buttressing and topped with crenellated parapets. At the center of the main facades is a stepped chimney stack decorated by the brickwork. It is flanked by lancet windows and rises above a steeply pitched gable similar to those found at the pavilions. There are additional chimneys of the same design at the intersection of the main block and end pavilions.

Alterations

There appears to have been no major alterations or changes to the principal elevations of this building.

Inventory

Name: Bishop's House

Address: 804 East Juneau Avenue

Date Built: 1902-03

Architects: Charles Kirchoff and Thomas L. Rose

Current Use: Diocesan Offices

Description:

The former Bishop's House was designed in the Jacobean style. It is 2-1/2 stories high with a central hipped block that is intersected by steeply pitched gables. All roof surfaces are covered with composition shingles. The walls are veneered with pressed cream colored brick and trimmed extensively with limestone. Though a much later derivation stylistically of the Gothic mode, the Bishop's House harmonizes well with the Guild Hall and Cathedral. End pavilions whose wall planes rise above the roofline as steeply pitched gables trimmed with limestone copings flank the main facade. The entry is recessed behind a Tudor-arched porch that is trimmed with stone set flush with the brick courses. At the center of the porch is a carved stone panel. Above the entry is a tri-parti bay of wood construction with decorated parapet. On the west facade is an oriel

of similar design and construction as the bay. The windows are largely double-hung, wooden sash with stone sills, concrete lintels and overhead transoms.

Alterations:

There have been no major changes or alterations to the exterior of the Bishop's House.

VIII. Preservation Guidelines

The following preservation guidelines represent the principle concerns of the Historic Preservation Commission regarding this historic designation. However, the Commission reserves the right to make final decisions based upon particular design submissions. These guidelines shall be applicable only to the All Saints' Episcopal Cathedral Historic District. Nothing in these guidelines shall be construed to prevent ordinary maintenance or restoration and/or replacement of documented original elements.

A. Guidelines for Rehabilitation

The All Saint's Episcopal Cathedral Historic District is an important contribution to Milwaukee's ecclesiastical architecture. The buildings in the district are definitive examples of the architectural periods represented yet a continuity of design has been maintained over the nearly 40 years of construction. Throughout the district's history, the church has maintained the integrity of each building and their setting. This has resulted in an intact, defined grouping of religious buildings with little or no change to their original appearance.

The rehabilitation guidelines contained in this section are based upon those in Section 2-335(10) of the historic preservation ordinance. These guidelines are not intended to restrict the owners' use of their property, but to serve as a guide for making changes that will be sensitive to the architectural integrity of the structure and appropriate to the overall character of the district.

1. Roofs

- a. Retain the original roof shape. Dormers, skylights and solar collector panels may be added to roof surfaces if they do not visually intrude upon those elevations visible from the public right-of-way. Avoid making changes to the roof shape that would alter the building height, roofline, pitch or gable orientation.
- b. Retain the original roofing materials where ever possible. Avoid using new roofing materials that are inappropriate to the style and period of the building and neighborhood.
- c. Replace deteriorated roof coverings with new materials that match and old in size, shape, color and texture. Avoid replacing deteriorated roof covering with new materials that differ to such an extent from the old in size, shape, color and texture so that the appearance of the building is altered.

2. Exterior Finishes

- a. Masonry
 - (i) Unpainted brick or stone should not be painted or covered. Avoid painting or covering natural stone and unpainted brick. This is likely to be historically incorrect and could

cause irreversible damage if it was decided to remove the paint at a later date.

- (ii) Repoint defective mortar by duplicating the original in color, style, texture and strength. Avoid using mortar colors and pointing styles that were unavailable or not used when the building was constructed.
- (iii) Clean masonry only when necessary to halt deterioration and with the gentlest method possible. Sandblasting brick or stone surfaces is prohibited. This method of cleaning erodes the surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Avoid the indiscriminate use of chemical products that could have an adverse reaction with the masonry materials, such as the use of acid on limestone or marble.
- (iv) Repair or replace deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the old as closely as possible. Avoid using new material that is inappropriate or was unavailable when the building was constructed, such as artificial cast stone or fake brick veneer.

b. Stucco

Repair stucco with stucco mixture duplicating the original as closely as possible in appearance and texture.

c. Wood

- (i) Retain original material, whenever possible. Avoid removing architectural features that are in most cases an essential part of a building's character and appearance that should be retained.
- (ii) Repair or replace deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Avoid covering architectural features with new materials that are inappropriate or were unavailable when the building was constructed such as artificial stone, brick veneer, asbestos or asphalt shingles, vinyl or aluminum siding.

3. Windows

- a. Retain existing window and door openings that are visible from the public right-of-way. Retain the original configurations of panes, sash, lintels, keystones, sills, architraves, pediments, hoods, doors, shutters and hardware. Avoid making additional openings or changes in the principal elevations by enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit new stock window sash or new stock door panes or sash. Avoid discarding original doors and door hardware when they can be repaired or reused.

- b. Respect the stylistic period or periods a building represents. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design of the original window sash or door. Avoid using inappropriate sash and door replacements such as unpainted galvanized aluminum storm and screen window combinations. Avoid the filling in or covering of openings with materials like glass-block or the installation of plastic or metal strip awnings or fake shutters that are not in proportion to the openings or that are historically out of the character with the building. Avoid using modern style window units such as horizontal sliding sash in place of double-hung sash or the substitution of units with glazing configurations not appropriate to the style of the building.

4. Porches, Trim and Ornamentation

- a. Retain porches and steps visible from the public right-of-way that are historically and architecturally appropriate to the building. Avoid altering porches and steps by enclosing open porches or replacing wooden steps with cast concrete steps or by removing original architectural features appropriate to the building
- b. Retain trim and decorative ornamentation including copper downspouts and guttering, copings, cornices, cresting, finials, railings, balconies, oriels, pilasters, columns, chimneys, bargeboards or decorative panels. Avoid the removal of trim and decorative ornamentation that is essential to the maintenance of the buildings historic character and appearance.
- c. Repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the old as closely as possible. Avoid using replacement materials that do not accurately reproduce the appearance of the original material.

5. Additions

Make additions that harmonize with the existing building architecturally and are located so as not visible from the public right-of-way, if at all possible. Avoid making additions that are unsympathetic to the original structure and visually intrude upon the principal elevations.

B Guidelines for Streetscapes

The principal streetscape of All Saints' is along East Juneau Avenue. The visual character of the district is maintained by the siting of each building to form a U-shaped courtyard that is open to Juneau Avenue and serves as a semi-public neighborhood park. Secondary, streetscapes are North Cass and North Marshall Streets. They contributed to the visual character of the district with appropriate easements and unobstructed views of each building. The traditional landscape treatment of the district contributes to the maintenance of its historic character.

1. Maintain the height, scale, mass and materials established by the buildings in the district and the traditional setback and density of the block faces. Avoid introducing elements that are incompatible in terms of siting, materials, height or scale.
2. Use traditional landscaping, fencing, signage and street lighting that is compatible with the character and period of the district. Avoid introducing landscape features, fencing, street lighting or signage that are inappropriate to the character of the district.

A. Guidelines for New Construction

It is important that additional new construction be designed so as to harmonize with the character of the district.

1. Siting

New construction must reflect the traditional siting of buildings in All Saints'. This includes setback, spacing between buildings, the orientation of openings to the street and neighboring structures, and the relationship between the main building and accessory buildings.

2. Scale

Overall building height and bulk; the expression of major building divisions including foundation, body and roof; and, individual building components such as porches, overhangs and fenestration must be compatible with the surrounding structures.

3. Form

The massing of new construction must be compatible with the surrounding buildings. The profiles of roofs and building elements that project and recede from the main block must express the same continuity established by the historic structures.

4. Materials

The building materials that are visible from the public right-of-way should be consistent with the colors, textures, proportions, and combinations of cladding materials traditionally used in All Saints'. The physical composition of the materials may be different from that of the historic materials, but the same appearance should be maintained.

B. Guidelines for Demolition

Although demolition is not encouraged and is generally not permissible, there may be instances when demolition may be acceptable, if approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. The Commission shall take the following guidelines, with that found in subsection 9(h) of the ordinance, into consideration when reviewing demolition requests.

1. Condition

Demolition requests may be granted when it can be clearly demonstrated that the condition of a building or a portion thereof is such that it constitutes an immediate threat to health and safety.

2. Importance

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is of historical or architectural significance or displays a quality of material and craftsmanship that does not exist in other structures in the area.

3. Location

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building contributes to the neighborhood and the general street appearance and has a positive affect on other buildings in the area.

4. Potential for Restoration

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is beyond economically feasible repair.

5. Additions

Consideration will be given to whether or not the proposed demolition is a later addition that is not in keeping with the original design of the structure or does not contribute to its character.

6. Replacement

Consideration will be given to whether or not the building is to be replaced by a compatible building of similar age, architectural style and scale or by a new building that would fulfill the same aesthetic function in the area as did the old structure (see New Construction Guidelines).