



MEMORANDUM

LEGISLATIVE REFERENCE BUREAU

WWW.MILWAUKEE.GOV/LRB

To: Sharon Robinson, Director of the Department of Administration
From: Dana J. Zelazny, Legislative Reference Bureau
Date: March 16, 2018
Subject: PEER CITY COMPARISON OF EQUAL RIGHTS COMMISSIONS

This memo is in response to your request of May 12, 2017, regarding budget, caseload and staffing data for municipal equal rights agencies in peer cities. The following cities were selected by the Legislative Reference Bureau Library as Milwaukee “peers” on the basis of comparable total population, population density, age of housing stock, poverty rate and percent of population that is non-white:

Boston	Columbus	Detroit	Indianapolis	Kansas City
Minneapolis	Omaha	Pittsburgh	St. Louis	St. Paul

This report also includes an analysis of Madison, WI; while not a peer city to Milwaukee strictly in relation to the demographics discussed above, Madison shares geography and other commonalities with Milwaukee.

Boston, MA

Activities

Boston's Human Rights Commission (HRC) has been inactive for several years. There are no current appointed commissioners, no staff and no operational budget for the HRC. Boston's mayor is working to reactivate the HRC, but there is no time frame for re-instatement.

Under Boston's HRC ordinance, the HRC attempts to conciliate discrimination complaints, and if conciliation fails, presents a report to the mayor for further action. In the absence of an active HRC, complaints received by the city's Fair Housing and Equity Department (FHED) are referred elsewhere as appropriate. According to the FHED's director, there are several city departments and outside agencies in the Boston area that cover some of the protections laid out in Boston's HRC ordinance. The FHED refers human rights complaints to an outside agency if the agency has overlapping jurisdiction, but can provide for a stronger remedy.

Administration

When active, the HRC is administered by the FHED, which also encompasses Boston's Fair Housing Commission. In the absence of an active HRC, the FHED's activities and budget appropriations center on housing issues, including increasing access to housing in Boston through investigation and enforcement, affirmative marketing and interagency cooperation, as well as maintaining a list of available housing opportunities. The Fair Housing Commission is fully operational and has a HUD contract to investigate housing discrimination. Boston's FHED does not have an EEOC contract.

Budget – Fair Housing and Equity Department (2017)

Human Rights Commission Budget (FHED Director's salary)	\$96,871
Fair Housing Commission Budget	185,959
External Funds Budget (Housing programs)	638,160
Total	\$920,990

Staffing – Fair Housing and Equity Department (FTE)

Executive Director, support staff and investigators	9
Human Rights Commissioners (unpaid, unfilled)	7
Fair Housing Commissioners (receive a per diem)	5

Caseload - Fair Housing and Equity Department (2016)

Housing discrimination inquiries/informational requests	542
Individuals educated on fair housing related topics	7,535
Clients assisted with housing search	3,684
Affirmative marketing plans for city-assisted housing developments	24

Columbus, OH

Activities

Until 2016, the Columbus Community Relations Commission (CRC) reviewed, investigated, mediated, held hearings and, if necessary, sought prosecution of complaints of discrimination under the City’s civil rights ordinance. In an effort to avoid bias, the CRC no longer reviews or mediates an open case before the complaint is referred to the CRC for a formal hearing. Investigation and informal mediation prior to a formal hearing is now carried out by a third-party provider or by administrative staff. The CRC continues to mediate issues of tension between community groups and provide support and sponsorship of local civil rights tours, educational programs and neighborhood “best practices” conferences.

Administration

In July 2016, the CRC, previously an independent office under the mayor, was merged with the newly-created Department of Neighborhoods (DON). The DON also implements a “New Americans” initiative for integrating immigrant families, operates the city’s 311 complaint line and supports the City’s My Brother’s Keeper program, Martin Luther King Jr. Day and Black History Month.

Budget and Staffing

Prior to the merger, the CRC had a 2016 budget appropriation of \$933,619 and a staff of 8 FTEs. The budget and staffing for the newly-formed DON is as follows:

Program	Budget	FTE
Administration	\$2,008,213	12
MLK Programming	60,000	0
New American Initiative	315,217	2
Community Relations Office	109,000	0
311 Call Center	1,453,934	21
Neighborhood Pride	651,192	5
Neighborhood and Agency Services	356,339	3
Total	\$4,953,895	43

CRC Commissioners (unpaid) 23

Currently, 4 staffers within the Department of Neighborhoods support the CRC, including an investigator.

A non-profit “Friends of CRC” organization raises funds to support the CRC’s tours, educational outreach and other ancillary activities.

Caseload

No information as to annual caseload for the CRC is available.

Detroit, MI

Activities

Detroit's Human Rights Commission (HRC) establishes policies governing the city's Department of Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity (CRIO) and consents to rules and procedures adopted by CRIO. Each year, the HRC typically focuses on one or two human rights issues of city-wide importance and works with city departments and community stakeholders to resolve problems or improve conditions. In a recent example, the HRC worked with local business owners to bring city gas stations into compliance with ADA standards. The HRC also requests reports from CRIO and other city agencies to monitor compliance with local-hire programs and other City initiatives.

Administration

Detroit's Human Rights Commission is administered and staffed by the city's CRIO department. CRIO investigates complaints of discrimination, sexual harassment and workplace violence, maintains Detroit's Limited English Proficiency plan, enforces the ADA, certifies local, small, women-owned and minority-owned businesses and monitors Detroit's residents preference and skilled trades employment programs.

Budget – Department of Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity (2017)

Personnel	\$711,441
Other expenditures	588,189
Charges for services	(400,000)
Total	\$899,630

Staffing – Department of Civil Rights, Inclusion and Opportunity (FTE)

Director, support staff, contract compliance officers, analysts	7
HRC Commissioners (compensation data unavailable)	11

According to a 2016 employee directory, CRIO appears to have a staff of three, rather than the seven positions funded in the 2017 Budget.

Caseload

No information as to annual caseload is available.

Indianapolis, IN

Activities

The Indianapolis Equal Opportunity Advisory Board (EOAB) investigates claims of discrimination within Indianapolis and surrounding Marion County, and carries out public policy as stated in the Indiana Civil Rights Law and the Indiana Fair Housing Law. Three-member panels determine whether reasonable cause exists to believe that discrimination violation has occurred. If conciliation cannot resolve the issue, three-member adjudication committees hold hearings and issue findings of fact and conclusions and, if necessary, issue orders to end discriminatory practices and restore a complainant's losses.

Administration

The EOAB oversees the Office of Equal Opportunity within the Office of Corporation Counsel (office of the city/county attorney) and the Office of Minority and Women Business Development.

Budget

Indianapolis functions in a unified government arrangement with surrounding Marion County. Annual budget data is published for the City-County Office of Corporation Counsel as a whole, but there is no break-down indicating the resources specifically appropriated for supporting the EOAB or for investigating discrimination complaints.

Staffing

A review of EOAB meeting videos indicates that a part-time staff attorney is responsible for investigating complaints and preparing reports. This position appears to be the only Office of Corporation Counsel personnel assigned to the EOAB.

EOAB members (compensation data unavailable) 14

Caseload (2016)

Education cases filed	3
Employment cases filed	32
Housing cases filed	9
Public accommodation cases filed	9

As of February 16, 2017, there were 23 open cases before the EOAB arising from complaints reported between 2015 and 2017.

Kansas City, MO

Activities

The Human Rights Commission (HRC) hears complaints about violations of the City's anti-discrimination ordinances in relation to employment, housing and public accommodations. The HRC has created task force sub-committees on business/labor, gay and lesbian issues, law enforcement, communications and media relations, religion and youth/education, and prepares an annual report on the conditions of minority groups in the City.

Administration

The Human Relations Department (HRD) provides service, compliance and enforcement in the areas of affirmative action, civil rights, contract compliance, construction workforce, minority, women or disadvantaged business enterprises, small local business enterprise, and housing. The HRD Civil Rights Division staffs the HRC, enforces the City's anti-discrimination ordinance and carries out all investigations. The Civil Rights Division refers cases to the Human Rights Commission for administrative hearings only after determining that there is probable cause to believe discrimination occurred and a failure to facilitate an agreement between the parties.

Budget – Human Relations Department (2017)

Personnel	\$960,294
Other Expenses	466,945
Total	\$1,427,239

The HRC receives free parking and a budget of \$20,000 - \$30,000 annually to attend public outreach events, distribute outreach materials and cater meetings.

Staffing – Human Relations Department (FTE)

Civil Rights Division employment investigators (EEOC contract)	3
Civil Rights Division housing investigators (HUD contract)	3
Civil Rights Division intake specialist	1
Other Human Relations Department staff	4
Total	11
HRC Commissioners (unpaid)	7

Caseload

Employment investigators carry an inventory of 30-40 monthly and close 70-100 cases per year. Housing investigators carry an inventory of 5-10 cases monthly and close 20-30 cases per year. No information is available as to public accommodation complaints or the number of cases that are reviewed by the HRC.

Madison, WI

Activities

The Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC) studies the existence, character, causes and extent of the denial of equal opportunity in violation of City ordinances and formulates policy regarding processing of complaints of discrimination in employment, housing, public accommodations, city facilities and credit. The EOC also reviews cases on appeal from decisions issued by the EOC Hearing Examiner and appeals of administrative dismissals issued by the Equal Opportunities Division Manager on complaints filed under the City's Equal Opportunities Ordinance.

Administration

Madison's Department of Civil Rights manages and coordinates the City's responsibilities on affirmative action, disability rights and equal opportunity, and provides staff and support for the City's Equal Opportunities Commission, Affirmative Action Commission and Commission on People with Disabilities. The Department of Civil Rights has three divisions: Affirmative Action, Equal Opportunities, and the Disability Rights and Services Program. The Equal Opportunities Division is responsible for investigating discrimination complaints and making jurisdictional determinations, deciding appeals on findings of no probable cause, holding hearings on claims of discrimination following findings of probable cause, and rendering preliminary decisions after a hearing.

Budget – Department of Civil Rights (2017)

Personnel Budget	\$1,456,354
Other	16,301
Purchased Services	88,503
Total	\$1,561,158

Staffing – Department of Civil Rights (FTE)

Director	1
Equal Opportunities Division (manager, investigator/conciliators, hearing examiner)	7
Affirmative Action Division (manager, contract compliance specialists, admin)	6
Disability Rights and Services Program	1
Total	16
EOC Commissioners (unpaid)	13

Caseload

No information as to annual caseload is available.

Minneapolis, MN

Activities

The Commission on Civil Rights (CCR) implements the City's civil rights policies through public information, education, mediation, conciliation and enforcement. Administrative hearing panels decide discrimination cases investigated by the Department of Civil Rights Complaint Investigations Division. A panel of three commissioners hears each case as an administrative trial, makes written findings, and has the ability to award damages, punitive damages, attorney fees and other relief. The CCR has standing committees for public relations/education, standards/procedures and contract compliance.

Administration

The Minneapolis Department of Civil Rights investigates and resolves discrimination complaints, monitors compliance with the City's local, women and minority workforce and enterprise requirements, processes police conduct complaints, improves the City's equitable service delivery and organizational culture through the use of an equity lens, and oversees compliance with the City's new Sick and Safe Time ordinance.

Budget – Department of Civil Rights(2017)

Complaint Investigations	\$721,186
Equity Division	594,281
Contract Compliance	1,981,496
Office of Police Conduct Review	728,317
Labor Standards Enforcement	198,450
Total	\$4,223,729

Staffing – Department of Civil Rights (FTE)

Complaint Investigations	6.5
Equity Division	3.2
Contract Compliance	10.7
Office of Police Conduct Review	6.5
Labor Standards Enforcement	2
Total	29
CCR Commissioners (compensated \$35 per monthly meeting)	21

Caseload (2015)

Cases filed	104
Alternative dispute resolution mediations	20
Police conduct complaints filed	340
Sick and Safe Time inquiries	30

Omaha, NE

Activities

The Omaha Civil Rights Hearing (CRH) Board receives, initiates, investigates, determines the merits of, attempts to settle, settles, dismisses and petitions for hearing charges alleging unlawful practices under the City’s civil rights ordinance. The Omaha Human Rights and Relations (HRR) Board investigates and studies complaints and situations arising between groups of individuals which result or may result in tensions, unlawful discrimination or prejudice. The HRR Board also works to promote understanding and respect between racial, religious and nationality groups, and make recommendations to the City for the development of policies that will aid in eliminating unlawful discrimination.

Prior to 2016, both the CRH Board and the HRR Board had lapsed into inactivity. Led by Omaha’s mayor, new board members were appointed in 2016.

Administration

The Omaha Human Rights and Relations Department oversees the HRR Board, the CRH Board and the Economic Inclusion Council. The Human Rights and Relations Department is also responsible for contract compliance and economic inclusion administration, civil rights investigations and enforcement support services, and promoting human rights and community relations.

Budget – Human Rights and Relations Department (2017)

Human Relations/Economic Inclusion	\$177,247
Civil Rights Investigations and Enforcement Support Services	395,777
Community Relations and Contract Compliance	322,358
Total	\$895,382

Staffing - Human Rights and Relations Department (FTE)

Director and human resources representatives	9
Human Rights and Relations Board members (unpaid)	9
Civil Rights Hearing Board members (compensation data unavailable)	11

Caseload - Human Rights and Relations Department (2016)

Cases resolved	70
Charges taken	150
Intake contacts	500
Outreach initiatives	80
Small businesses certified	75

Pittsburgh, PA

Activities

The Commission on Human Relations (CHR) studies and investigates complaints of alleged discrimination in employment, housing, public accommodations, and civil rights practices involving City employees as well as any conditions having adverse effects on intergroup relations in the City. The Commission on Human Relations has three program areas: Unlawful Practices Administration and Enforcement, Inter-Group/Police Community Relations and Education and Outreach. In addition to reviewing the findings of staff, the CCR may hold public hearings, make findings of fact and issue orders.

Administration

The CHR is an independently-run and budgeted City department. While the Mayor appoints the commissioners, the commissioners are responsible for selecting and hiring a director and staff, including an attorney. The CHR is divided into two sections – the Compliance Review Section and the Public Hearing Section. The Compliance Review Section reviews case determinations by the CHR staff with regard to whether probable cause exists for unlawful discriminatory practice complaints and approves or disapproves findings by majority vote. The Public Hearing Section conducts public hearings upon a majority vote of the Compliance Review Section and renders the Commission’s final decisions regarding cases.

Budget – Commission on Human Relations (2017)

Personnel	\$417,662
Other	52,278
Total	\$469,940

Staffing – Commission on Human Relations (FTE)

Director	1
Commission representatives, administrators	5.1
Total	6.1
CHR Commissioners (unpaid)	15

Caseload – Commission on Human Relations (2016)

Employment adjudications	31
Housing adjudications	14
Public accommodations adjudications	10

St. Louis, MO

Activities

The St. Louis Civil Rights Enforcement Commission (CREC) advises the City of problems affecting human and inter-group relations, makes studies and provide data for community development, and recommends measures to further amicable relations among the various segments of the population. The CREC also reviews the record of contested discrimination cases and accepts or amends the recommended findings of fact and conclusions of law.

Administration

The CREC is staffed and administered by the St. Louis Civil Rights Enforcement Agency (CREA). CREA investigates violations of discrimination laws and works to eliminate discrimination in housing, employment, education, services, public accommodations, real estate transactions and uses. CREA receives contract and grant funding from the EEOC and HUD to support its mission.

Budget – Civil Rights Enforcement Agency (2017)

Personnel services - general	\$335,146
Personnel services – EEOC contract	30,776
Personnel services – HUD contract	67,099
Personnel services – Housing program	36,234
Other	113,850
Total	\$583,105

Staffing – Civil Rights Enforcement Agency (FTE)

Director, deputy, HR specialist, assistant	4
EEOC Contract (HR specialist)	0.5
HUD Contract (HR specialist)	1.5
Housing Program (receptionist)	1
Total	7

CREC Commissioners (unpaid)	7
-----------------------------	---

Caseload – Civil Rights Enforcement Agency (2016)

Employment cases opened	100
Employment cases closed	79
Housing cases opened	90
Housing cases closed	80

St. Paul, MN

Activities

St. Paul's Human Rights and Equal Economic Opportunity (HREEO) Commission serves in an advisory capacity to the Director of the HREEO Department and reviews the performance of the HREEO Department. The HREEO Commission also hears and determines discrimination complaints under the St. Paul Human Rights ordinance following investigation by the HREEO Department.

Administration

The HREEO Department administers the HREEO Commission and investigates discrimination complaints. The HREEO Department also provides procurement contract and analysis services, contract compliance and business development services, human rights and racial equity services, and implements the City's new Earned Sick and Safe Time program. Responsibility for the Police Civilian Internal Affairs Review Commission recently shifted from the police department to the HREEO Department. The HREEO Department also runs a print/design/copy enterprise that provides services to the region.

Budget – Human Rights and Equal Economic Opportunity Department (2017)

HREEO Administration	\$124,502
Human Rights	633,000
HREEO Special Projects	50,000
Contract Compliance and Business Development	514,045
Procurement Contract and Analysis Services	1,002,358
General Government Special Projects	1,197,593
Equal Employment Opportunity	33,748
River Print (print/design/copy enterprise)	1,182,108
Total	\$4,737,354

Staffing – Human Rights and Equal Economic Opportunity Department (FTE)

Human Rights (Director, investigators)	8
Contract Compliance	9
Contract Analysis Services	9
River Print (print/design/copy enterprise)	3.5
Total	29.5

HREEO Commissioners (compensated \$25 per meeting)	21
--	----

Caseload – Human Rights (2016)

New cases opened (73% employment discrimination cases)	67
Cases closed	67
Funds collected in probable cause settlements	\$49,250

If you have any other question related to this matter, please let me know.

LRB 168509