



Living with History

MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

**Tuesday, January 20, 2009, 3:00 PM

Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Pat Balon, Chair

Matt Jarosz, Vice Chair

Sandy Ackerman, Ald. Robert Bauman,

Randy Bryant, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Pat Balon called the meeting to order at 3:02 P.M.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Randy Bryant, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners Excused: Sandra McSweeney

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster

Pat Balon welcomed new commissioner Randy Bryant.

2. MINUTES

Approval of the December 15, 2008 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the December 15, 2008 meeting. The motion carried.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. Property Owner wants to address the commission regarding the November 10, 2008 denial of the Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum trim installed without a COA at 3123-25 N. Sherman Boulevard. (Note: this is not an appeal of the decision)

The owner was not present to address the commission. Ald. Bauman questioned whether or not the time had passed for an appeal and staff Carlen Hatala replied that the time for an appeal had expired. Ald. Bauman was concerned that the commission would be setting a precedent. Ms. Hatala added that the matter would be discussed with Vanessa Koster. The commission took no action on this item.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Review of replacement of front door and sidelights at 135 W. Reservoir Ave. installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. (Brewers Hill Historic District) (6th Ald. District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich reviewed the project. In a past COA it was specifically called out that the front door and sidelights were not to be removed. They were character-defining elements of this Civil War era house. The owner had not applied for a COA to make the change. A neighbor reported the change to the Department of Neighborhood Services.

The owner was not present.

Matt Jarosz asked whether or not this was the only inconsistency and the only violation on the property. Mr. Jakubovich replied that the front porch roof was rebuilt differently from the original. Randy Bryant asked when the violation occurred. Mr. Jakubovich replied it had been recent.

THE MOTION: Matt Jarosz made a motion to deny the inappropriate replacement front door and install a door and sidelights appropriate to the age of the house. Sandy Ackerman seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Election of Vice-Chair to Chair and Election of new Vice-Chair for 2009

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Randy Bryant seconded a motion to have vice chair Matt Jarosz move into the position of chair for 2009. The motion carried unanimously.

Pat Balon asked if there were any nominations for vice chair.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved to nominate Ald. Bauman as vice chair. There was no second to the motion. The motion failed.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved to nominate Sandra McSweeney as vice chair. Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Reappointment of Matt Jarosz to the Historic Third Ward Architectural Review Board.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Randy Bryant seconded a motion to reappoint Matt Jarosz as the HPC representative to the Historic Third Ward Architectural Review Board. The motion carried unanimously.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Update on Sydney Hih Interim Designation Petition (the applicant has withdrawn his petition for Interim Designation)

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the nominator had withdrawn his petition for interim designation. Ald. Bauman asked if that were still possible given the fact that the HPC

had opened a public hearing on the matter. Staff Carlen Hatala said the department could check on that process. Ald. Bauman indicated that since the development for that property fell through, now was the time to protect the Sydney Hih/Senn Building. Pat Balon added that all the work had been done researching the building already. Ms. Hatala indicated that a public hearing could not be held at this meeting because of the requirement for 25 days notice. To meet the notification deadline for the next HPC meeting of February 16, 2009, a new petition would have to be submitted this week.

B. Staff updates on preservation projects.

Staff Paul Jakubovich showed before and after images of projects at 928 E. Brady Street, 1934 N. 2nd Street, 1948 N. 2nd Street, 221 S. 2nd Street, and 934 N. 34th Street. These might be considered for a Cream of the Cream City/Mayor's Urban Design award. Pat Balon requested that the addresses be forwarded to the commission members.

C. Wadsworth House Update

Ald. Bauman asked staff to report on the status of this property. Staff Paul Jakubovich indicated that the HPC had denied a COA for demolition and that the owner had appealed. ZND upheld the denial. Pat Balon, Matt Jarosz and neighbors turned out to support the building's preservation. Randy Bryant asked whether or not Neighborhood House would want to sell the building.

D. Gipfel Brewery Update

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that there had been a person who expressed interest in the Gipfel to the Department of City Development but nothing definite had happened yet. Randy Bryant asked whether or not there were any state guidelines about how long the building could sit on the flatbed. Mr. Jakubovich replied that the Department of Neighborhood Services had issues since bricks are falling. They are hoping to have the corners shored up.

E. Recap of City Hall Rededication

Pat Balon reported that the posters and visuals were good and that the salvaged artifacts might be loaned to the Milwaukee County Historical Society to be on display. Ald. Bauman indicated that the city wants to control the artifacts so he'd prefer the artifacts to be shown at Central Library. Vanessa Koster said she would check with the Department of Public Works about lending artifacts to Milwaukee Public Library.

F. Cream of the Cream City, nominee ideas and volunteers to review submissions

Pat Balon expressed her concern that the preservation awards not get lost within the Mayor's Design Awards since the commission awards projects that go beyond simple rehab to exhibit finesse and follow appropriate restoration/rehabilitation practices.

Vanessa Koster said that the old criteria will still apply.

Sandy Ackerman, Randy Bryant and Pat Balon volunteered to screen the submissions.

8. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Ald. Bauman moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 3:42 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, February 16, 2009, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Matt Jarosz, Chair
Sandra McSweeney, Vice-Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

ROLL CALL

Chair Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 3:04 P.M.
Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown
Commissioners Excused: Randy Bryant, Sandra McSweeney
Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster

MINUTES

Approval of the January 20, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the January 20, 2009 HPC minutes. The motion carried unanimously

Chair Matt Jarosz asked commissioners if there was any objection to hearing Item 6A before the other business on the agenda. There were no objections.

NEW BUSINESS

3123-3125 N. Sherman Boulevard. Install Aluminum trim over wood trim. Applicant: Carol Rubitsky (7th Ald. District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the project. The aluminum trim was installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness and a complaint was made by a neighbor. The Department of Neighborhood Services forwarded the complaint to Historic Preservation. The preservation guidelines for the Sherman Blvd. Historic District state that aluminum trim is not allowed. Staff recommended denial. The matter had come before the HPC before but there were errors made in the decision letter that led to confusion about the applicant's time for appeal. Vanessa Koster indicated that the applicant had re-applied for a COA so that she could appeal.

Staff Carlen Hatala explained that the ordinance required a public hearing before the commission if the COA were denied but that staff had made an error and the public hearing did not get scheduled.

Ald. Bauman questioned why the commission had to hear the matter again. Staff went into more detail on the above.

The applicant, Carol Rubitsky, was recognized.

Pat Balon asked Ms. Rubitsky whether or not she had taken the opportunity to speak with her neighbors since the last time the matter had been reviewed by the commission. She

also asked if the applicant had spoken with staff on how to resolve the matter. Ms. Rubitsky replied that she had not spoken yet with the neighbors or staff and had not resolved how to correct the violation affordably.

Pat Balon asked who the contractor was and how they proceeded without a permit. Ms. Rubitsky replied that she had been the contractor and had thought no permit was needed and that the guidelines referred to aluminum siding and not just trim. Staff Paul Jakubovich added that he had spoken with three plan examiners and they all responded that a permit was required for aluminum trim.

Pat Balon indicated that she understood Ms. Rubitsky's frustration but that going to the Historic Preservation staff first would have given her options that would have been economical.

Ms. Rubitsky indicated that with the tough economic times she is struggling right now. The aluminum could be removed but the wood underneath needs work. She added that she had been under the impression that the historic district designation for Sherman Boulevard would be temporary, only until the National Register district was created. She wanted the commission to give her suggestions about contractors and how to proceed.

Ald. Bauman asked staff if a property owner's ignorance of needing a Certificate of Appropriateness is a criterion for allowing work done without one.

Staff Paul Jakubovich answered that all exterior work requires a Certificate of Appropriateness except painting.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of aluminum trim. The motion carried unanimously.

PUBLIC HEARING

A. Public hearing on the application for Historic Designation of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih) (6th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a brief overview of how the original petition for interim designation had been withdrawn and that a new nomination was submitted as a result of Ald. Bauman's suggestion at the last meeting that the time to preserve the building was now. She outlined three possible criteria for recommending designation, e-1, e-3 and e-9.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried unanimously.

Staff Carlen Hatala swore in those who wanted to testify.

Gail Fitch was recognized. She had submitted the new nomination for the building. She stated that the building possessed a lot of history from the being the site of medical breakthroughs to being an icon of the counter culture. There was not a lot left from that

part of Juneau Avenue so the building should be preserved. The staff report spoke for itself.

Paul Demcak was recognized. He stated that the research and report spoke for itself and that the building has cultural and historic significance. He referred to the letter of support submitted by the Milwaukee Preservation Alliance. Mr. Demcak added that former Mayor Norquist referred to all these buildings as being important. If the Senn Building were to be demolished the new development along Juneau Avenue would look like just an office park. He said he appreciated Mr. Ruvin's first development concept which saved the building and incorporated it into the new construction on the site. He showed a sketch of the Senn Building he had made while he was a student. It showed the Senn Building with new construction behind. Mr. Demcak urged the commission to consider or ask themselves how important this building was to Milwaukee.

Dawn McCarthy registered her support of the designation but did not wish to speak.

The chair Matt Jarosz indicated that he was entering the letter of support from the Milwaukee Preservation Alliance into the record.

David Florsheim was recognized. He indicated that he was one of the owners. He added that the original concept was to preserve the building but as the plans finalized, the development became more feasible without it. He said the building is falling apart. Mr. Florsheim stated that they want to work out a concept that would preserve the Senn Building. He did not know the condition of the building or all the options yet. He wanted the commission to hold off until they could evaluate their prospects and incorporate the building into another plan. The building was under no threat of demolition.

Rob Ruvin was recognized. He stated that he had purchased the building in 2005 with the intention of saving it. He asked for time to work out plans.

Pat Balon asked if they had established what it would cost to demolish the building. David Florsheim answered that they had not done so because they don't anticipate taking it down.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.
--

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to recommend historic designation based on criteria e-1, e-3 and e-9.
--

There was further discussion.

Ald. Bauman said the commission has been rolling the designation over for 6 months and now these [local] men were solely back in charge. He asked what impediments the designation would put on the developer. He asked what argument would be used to hold over the designation for more months. He was concerned that all of a sudden there could be a new owner/buyer and a demolition permit is taken out. He thought that it made no difference if the designation were acted upon now or later since the owners now want to save the building.

David Florsheim emphasized that their saving the building would not mean returning it to its historic appearance. If it received historic designation then they would have to return it to its historic appearance.

Matt Jarosz stated that the commission understood the circumstances and that they were proceeding with caution. The longer the building sat, however, the more precarious it became. He wanted to see adaptive use of the entire block.

In answer to Mr. Florsheim's question about why the building was being considered for designation now, Matt Jarosz replied a nomination was submitted now. The commission has no control over that.

Mr. Ruvin asked for time to show the commission tentative plans.

Ald. Bauman indicated that if the vote were today he'd he would vote no for the designation because he did not want to go through the Goll Mansion scenario again. He said the first nomination for the Senn Building was the result of a labor dispute so there were ulterior motives. He did not want to prematurely put a straight jacket on the design for a new development. He would be happy to hold the designation.

Staff Carlen Hatala explained that the design guidelines in the study report stated that the designation applied only to the building and not adjacent property.

Matt Jarosz asked the commissioners if there were any drawbacks to holding over the nomination. Ald. Bauman answered no.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman made a motion to hold the nomination for one month. Sandy Ackerman seconded the motion. NOTE: This motion took precedence over the earlier motion to recommend designation. The motion carried unanimously and the designation will be brought back next month.

OTHER BUSINESS

A. Staff updates on preservation projects.

Staff Paul Jakubovich showed before and after images of restoration projects or new construction projects in historic districts. The properties that were shown included 1918 N. 2nd Street (new carriage barn); storefronts at 225 E. Wisconsin Avenue; 1949 N. Palmer Street; the Mayer-Durner Buildings at 2002 N. King Drive; sign at 1218 E. Brady Street. These may be nominated by the commissioners for a design award. Matt Jarosz thanked staff for the updates and said it was a morale booster.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, March 16, 2009 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells

ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 4:05 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

Monday, March 16, 2009, 3:00 PM

Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Matt Jarosz, Chair

Sandra McSweeney Vice Chair

Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,

Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Randy Bryant, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners Excused: Ald. Bob Bauman, Sandra McSweeney

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

Approval of the February 16, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the February 16, 2009 commission meeting. The motion carried with Randy Bryant abstaining as he had not been in attendance.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

Reconvene Public Hearing on the Interim Historic Designation Application of the Nicholas Senn Building, 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih) (6th Ald. District)

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that Ald. Bauman had to be out of town for this meeting and requested that the commission hold over the item for another cycle.

The chair Matt Jarosz asked the owners if they were fine with postponing the hearing for another cycle and they responded that they were.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to hold over the item until the next meeting cycle. The motion carried unanimously.

5. OLD BUSINESS

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness for restoration of the all-masonry, Lake Park Road Bridge located at the north end of Lake Park next to Lincoln Memorial Drive. (North Point North Historic District) (3rd Aldermanic District) PTS#56977

Staff Paul Jakubovich gave an overview of the proposed restoration of the Lake Park Road Bridge in Lake Park. The bridge is a rare survivor, made entirely of masonry instead of iron and steel. The work will entail repairing the balustrade in concrete (the original terra cotta was replaced c. 1980s with concrete); replacing damaged voussoirs with concrete ones; and repairing the crack in the vault of the arch.

Kevin Haley, Milwaukee County Parks Landscape architect, was recognized. Al Lindner, from the Graef engineering firm was also recognized. Mr. Haley provided more details about the renovations and how the county intends to repair the arch. State and federal funding will be used. He added that the balustrade was replaced with concrete after an auto smashed into it and blew out the original terra cotta. He stated that they intend to do repairs with concrete since it is stronger than terra cotta. In response to concerns by the preservation commissioners that the renovations be more than a band aid approach to the bridge, Mr. Haley assured everyone that they had studied and determined where the water was infiltrating and are replacing the entire road deck, curb and sides to make sure no more water penetrates to the arch of the bridge. The deterioration appears to be a matter of maintenance rather than design flaws and the damage from water seeping into the arch from the curbs has accelerated in recent years.

There was further discussion about using tie rods to secure the arch, how the crack in the arch will be handled and the matter of crash barriers now required by the Department of Transportation. There was also discussion about whether or not terra cotta should be required in the replacement work instead of cast concrete since there is a now a precedent set with the City Hall project. Commissioners advocated the less intrusive approach of patching damaged terra cotta rather than complete removal unless the piece was beyond repair. Commissioners recommended getting an estimate for new balustrades made of terra cotta so that the county could compare that to the cost of cast concrete balustrades.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the project per the staff recommendation, to support the county's attempt to get an exemption from the state on the crash barrier, to have the entire balustrade with railing replaced to match the originals and to use the less invasive method of patching damaged terra cotta and aging it to match the existing conditions. The motion carried.

Kevin Haley then gave the commissioners an update on the work being done to the Lion Bridges in Lake Park.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Certified Local Government review of the removal of the Old Coast Guard Station from the National Register of Historic Places (due to its demolition)

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the State Historic Preservation Office was updating its files and preparing the paperwork to have the Old Coast Guard Station removed from the National Register. All of the research will remain on the nomination so it will not be lost. As a Certified Local Government, the Milwaukee Historic Preservation has the right to comment on this matter.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to support the delisting of the Old Coast Guard Station. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Staff updates on preservation projects.

Staff Paul Jakobovich showed an image of Pabst Building #10 and indicated that it is the first to be completed and occupied in the Pabst Complex. Charlie Trainer is one of the owners.

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Staff Carlen Hatala reported on the free training being made available to members of Wisconsin Historic Preservation Commissions on May 29, 30, 2009. The training is sponsored by the State Historic Preservation Office. Each member of the HPC received application forms. Carpooling to the program was mentioned.

B. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, April 20, 2009 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells

9. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried and the meeting was adjourned at 4:04 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

Monday, April 20, 2009, 3:00 PM

Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Matt Jarosz, Chair

Sandra McSweeney, Vice Chair

Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,

Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Randy Bryant, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Sandra McSweeney

Commissioners Excused: Sandy Ackerman

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Martha Brown

Chair Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 3:02 PM.

2. MINUTES

Approval of the March 16, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the March 16, 2009 commission meeting. The motion carried with Sandra McSweeney abstaining as she had not been at the March 16th meeting.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Reconvene Public Hearing on the Interim Historic Designation Application of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih) (6th Ald. District, Ald. Milele Coggs)

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to reconvene the public hearing. The motion carried.

Ald. Bauman reported that the owners have now come up with a development plan to include both the Senn Building and the Gipfel Brewery Building on their site.

Matt Jarosz asked staff to swear in any persons wanting to testify and Carlen Hatala did so.

David Florsheim, one of the developers of the Sydney Hih property, was recognized. He testified that they are working on a mixed use plan that would include retail and apartments and that the Gipfel Building and Sydney HIH would be incorporated into the project and the Gipfel would be placed at the west end of the collection of buildings, much as in the original scheme. They were studying the economics of the project. It has not been shown to the public yet.

Matt Jarosz asked whether or not the floor heights would remain as they are at present. Mr. Florsheim replied that they would.

In answer to Sandra McSweeney's question about their time frame, Mr. Florsheim indicated that they had the option on the property with Milwaukee County through the end of the year.

Pat Balon said this project could be a catalyst for other development in the Park East.

Sandra McSweeney asked Mr. Florsheim what effect historic designation would have on his plans. He replied that it might benefit the project but they wanted to look at financing to see whether designation would help or hurt. He was opposed to the designation because of its potential impact on development.

Matt Jarosz asked Mr. Florsheim to keep the commission informed of their progress.

Gail Fitch was recognized. She reminded the commissioners that the need for designation was just as valid today as it was when she nominated the building. Each month she was hoping for some resolution.

Commissioners agreed that the item should come back next month. They did not want to see the building get demolished.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to adjourn the public hearing. The motion carried.

B. Public hearing on proposed boundary changes to the Concordia Historic District. (4th Ald. District, Ald. Robert Bauman)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a report on the proposed boundary change. She summarized the buildings to be added and indicated that they were of the same architectural quality and historic significance as those already in the district. They appeared to meet criteria e-3, e-5, e-6 and e-9 of the preservation ordinance.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Randy Bryant seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

There was no one to testify on the matter although there were several persons from the neighborhood in the audience.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Randy Bryant seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

Ald. Bauman stated that the Concordia Historic District is in his aldermanic district and that he lives at 29th Street and Kilbourn Avenue. He and Randy Bryant questioned why these buildings were left out of the Concordia Historic District to begin with. Staff Carlen Hatala replied that she did not know. It might have been a matter of architectural integrity. Ald. Bauman added that the Harry Rogers House at 839 N. 29th Street was 100% original on the interior and that the current owner has occupied the house since the 1950s. The house at 832 N. 29th has been a rental for a long time and the owners have

removed two chimneys. The house at 826 N. 29th was remarkable as an example of a late 19th century starter home. Its exterior has been restored.

There was a discussion about including 826 N. 28th Street into the district as well. The owner had expressed interest in being included. Staff reported that the city attorney had reviewed this request and that the house could not be added at this public hearing because it had not been properly noticed. A new public hearing would have to be scheduled with notices to all of the district owners.

Ald. Bauman brought up additional properties on 31st Street, houses between Wells Street and Wisconsin Avenue. Staff Carlen Hatala responded that these properties could be grouped as a separate, new, historic district.

There was no further comment from the commissioners. They were of the opinion that the boundary change was appropriate.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to recommend the changes to the boundary of the Concordia Historic District as the added properties appear to meet criteria e-3, e-5, e-6 and e-9 of the ordinance. The motion carried.

C. Public Hearing on the petition for interim historic designation for the Samuel Weinstock House at 3402 W. St. Paul Avenue (4th Ald. District, Ald. Robert Bauman)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a summary of the staff report and that the Weinstock House appeared to meet e-5 and e-9 of the ordinance. She also reported that notices sent to two addresses for the owner came back. She even made a site visit to the Milwaukee address, the official address of record with the city, and found that the owner of the Weinstock House did not have a business at that address. The current occupant had no knowledge of the owner or the owner's LLC. Staff used the address provided by the owner to the city through the Assessor's office.

Ald. Bauman questioned whether the commissioners were comfortable that staff had properly noticed the owner.

Ron Roberts, Department of Neighborhood Service, was recognized. He said the owner, Andy Meetz, was deliberately masking his location. DNS has issued condemnation orders against the property but would reverse that if the house received historic designation. They had reached the owner through a long history of issues with his buildings and would check their files to see what address they had. DNS preferred to see the Weinstock House locally designated and the features of the building preserved.

Commissioners discussed whether or not harm could come to the building if interim designation were postponed at this meeting. Randy Bryant indicated that the city was obliged to go by the official address. Ron Roberts suggested the hearing be postponed until the owner received notification.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved to adjourn this item until the next HPC meeting. There was no second to his motion.

Juan Balderas spoke up from the audience stating he was representing the owner. In light of that comment, the commissioners agreed to proceed with the public hearing.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

Staff Carlen Hatala swore in those interested in speaking.

Juan Balderas was recognized. He stated he was an agent of the owner. He was or had been living in the Weinstock House and inspector Krause had called to let him know about the public hearing today. Mr. Balderas stated that the owner Andy Meetz was aware of the hearing also. Mr. Meetz's brother wanted Mr. Balderas to attend the hearing to find out what was going on because he did not want the house to get knocked down. Mr. Balderas had worked on the Weinstock House last year and was paid for his work by Andy Meetz. Mr. Balderas said he wanted to purchase the house, he was a licensed contractor, and that he had the manpower to do the work needed on the house. He said about 90% of the interior was intact. Mr. Balderas said there would be problems getting a mortgage for the property but that he was intending to purchase the LLC from the Meetz's so that he could have the house.

Commissioners discussed the amount of investment needed to fix the masonry porch because they wanted Mr. Balderas to know what he was getting into. They suggested calling around for estimates and getting a contractor knowledgeable about historic buildings. Mr. Balderas said he knew it would be expensive. Commissioners also asked about other repairs that were needed.

DNS Commissioner Art Dahlberg and Ron Roberts then explained an unfunded program that would allow DNS to make repairs to historic buildings. It had been used on Sherman Boulevard and the Peck Rowhouse. It is intended to stabilize structures in danger of collapse.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

Juan Balderas assured the commission that he wanted to move back into the house and continue repairs. The commissioners were in agreement that the house merited historic designation.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to give interim historic designation to the Weinstock House based on criteria e-5 and e-9 of the historic preservation ordinance. The motion carried.

The commissioners digressed from the agenda at this point to ask about the status of the repairs at 2121 E. Lafayette Place. There was also discussion about adjourning public hearings, as in the case of the Senn Building. Adjourning a hearing would keep the designation open, as what happened with the houses on Kenwood Boulevard. A no decision by the commission would mean that no new designation could be submitted for two years. A yes decision could impact the owner's planning and complicate their financing. The owner could appeal and have the interim designation overturned. There was also discussion about the city's internal process of notification when an owner applies for a demolition permit. Commissioners agreed that they need to stay on top of

the Senn Building and the Gipfel Building to prevent demolition by neglect. Windows need to be boarded up and the Gipfel cannot sit on the flatbed indefinitely. The corners need bracing as brick are falling out. It also needs to be tarped. Matt Jarosz suggested the Gipfel be set down and stabilized until restoration is possible. The commissioners wanted the matter on next month's agenda.

Commissioner Ann Pieper Eisenbrown left the meeting at 5:16 PM.

5. NEW BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness for new storefront at 1108 W. Mitchell St. (Mitchell Street Historic District) Applicant: Patrick McGlin (12th Aldermanic District, Ald. James Witkowiak)

Staff Paul Jakubovich reviewed the project which consisted of two parts. There was work done without a COA. Brick was spalling and the owner took it upon himself to apply a Portland cement stucco coating over the brick. He then scored the stucco to resemble brick. This cement could not now be removed due to its application directly over the brick. The second part of the project was a new storefront.

Martha Brown left at 5:25 for another meeting.

Commissioners agreed with staff that a marble cladding over the exterior would not be appropriate. The emphasis will be on the new storefront.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to follow staff's report and continue the stucco procedure above the storefront, install the new storefront and cap off the front with some form of coping subject to staff approval. The motion carried.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

Vote on preservation candidates for the Mayor's Urban Design Awards.

Staff Carlen Hatala passed out the ballots and showed images of the nominees. Matt Jarosz instructed the commissioners not to dilute the awards and make sure the recipients have firm credibility. He stated that since there were three coach houses on the nominee list, perhaps only one should receive an award and that the others can be looked at next year. The votes would be tallied after the meeting.

7. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Pat Balon moved and Randy Bryant seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 5:50 PM.



Living with History

MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

Monday, May 18, 2009, 3:00 PM

Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Matt Jarosz, Chair

Sandra McSweeney, Vice Chair

Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,

Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Matt Jarosz,

Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners Unexcused: Randy Bryant

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Paul Jakubovich, Vanessa Koster

Chair Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 3:10 P.M.

2. MINUTES

Approval of the April 20, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the April 20, 2009 commission meeting. The motion carried with Sandy Ackerman abstaining as she had not been at the April 20th meeting.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

Reconvene Public Hearing on the Interim Historic Designation Application of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih) (6th Ald. District Milele Coggs)

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to reopen the public hearing. The motion carried.

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported on new developments at the building. He stated that he had spoken to the owners right before the commission meeting. They have removed boards from some of the windows and are working on the building. There is some interest in using the building for offices and a restaurant.

Ald. Bauman asked the owners to present an update. Matt Jarosz and staff reminded all that they were still under oath. Developer David Florsheim was recognized. He reported that they are looking at the different components of the complex and want to retain the corner, the Senn Building and are looking into costs for keeping all four buildings. They have had a party interested in leasing the building for offices and a restaurant. Mr. Florsheim added that they are fixing the façade and removing boards. He said the Senn Building was in no danger of demolition.

The commissioners then questioned Mr. Florsheim about the condition and status of the Gipfel Building since windows are out and the building is deteriorating. He replied that the Department of Neighborhood Services has expressed concern as well and wants a stabilization plan. He said they are still looking at removing the westernmost (fourth building) building of the Sydney Hih complex and moving the Gipfel there as originally planned but that they are working on the costs. Another site could also be possible. He added that if Sydney Hih were given historic designation then removal of the fourth building for the Gipfel might not be possible.

Gail Fitch was recognized. She stated that she had nominated the building and wanted to remind everyone that only the Senn Building and not the entire complex was nominated. She urged everyone to make a commitment for the Senn Building.

Ron Roberts from the Department of Neighborhood Services (DNS) was recognized. He reported that the owner, Rob Ruvlin has been in communication with the Commissioner of DNS and there had been a walk-through of Sydney Hih to allow permit for the owner to bring investors through the building. He wanted to add that DNS is not encouraging the demolition of the Gipfel Building. They want the owner to make a plan and communicate that plan to DNS. The mover wants his bond. Mr. Roberts hoped that a suitable location is found, even if temporary. None of the options had been adequately pursued.

David Florsheim clarified that the walk-through at Sydney Hih was not for investors but in preparation for an art show to take place outside the building. Sydney Hih will be used as a museum during the art show. He wanted the commissioners to know that they are exploring every option at the present time.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to adjourn the public hearing. The motion carried.

Matt Jarosz asked the commissioners how they wanted to proceed and what they wanted from the developer. Options could include actual plans showing some alternative schemes or continued monthly oral updates.

Ald. Bauman indicated that designation could have an impact on their budget and that the developers would need to know where they stand.

Matt Jarosz stated that if the Senn Building were designated, they could use the Historic Building Code and possibly lower their costs. For example, at Pabst Boiler House Building #10, the Historic Building Code allowed the developer to retain the original staircase.

Staff Carlen Hatala and Sandra McSweeney indicated that there was no point in retaining the building if more historic features were to be removed. Designation will ensure the exterior will be preserved.

Pat Balon reminded commissioners that there was significant history associated with the building aside from its architectural character. Removal of the building would erase its history.

Matt Jarosz added that the Senn Building clearly hits three to four of the preservation criteria solidly. It occupies a corner but there is a lot missing around it so it is not in the way of development.

Pat Balon stated that the Senn Building could become an icon of a new development project if done well. It is also not cheap to demolish a building.

Matt Jarosz concluded that the commission should terminate their deliberation in one month. The matter could not be left open indefinitely. The developer needs to know in order to formulate their plans and budget. He urged Rob Ruvin to work with someone who is familiar with the Historic Building Code.

5. OLD BUSINESS

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for new 2-car frame garage at 2018 N. 2nd St. (Brewers Hill Historic District) Applicant Chris Rasch and Theresa Mambu PTS#58608 (6th Ald. District Ald. Milele Coggs)

Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the project. A new 2-car garage will be built behind a new in-fill house in Brewers Hill. It will be clad in cement board siding and have cement board shingles and a carriage barn-style door.

In answer to questions by Sandra McSweeney Paul Jakubovich indicated that tapered frieze boards were typical of Milwaukee and that of the three corner board options shown, he thought Option B was better.

Owner Chris Rasch was recognized. He wanted to thank Paul for providing the design and indicated that his garage door would actually be somewhat different from the one drawn. He indicated that he would paint the garage and trim to match the house. The dimensions of the garage will be 24 by 20, slightly smaller than drawn.

THE MOTION: Sandra McSweeney moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the proposed garage with staff having the authority to approve the final details. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Certificate of appropriateness for window alterations on rear elevation at 3410 N. Lake Drive (North Lake Drives Estates Historic District) Applicant: Andy Hurley PTS#58607 (3rd Ald. District Ald. Nik Kovac)

Staff Paul Jakubovich summarized the project. The prairie style house at 3410 N. Lake drive was one of three new houses approved by the commission for the 3400 block of N. Lake Drive. The current owner proposed to remove a porch roof and change out windows for better views. The rear or lake-facing façade is not visible from the street.

Commissioners commented on the difficulty in assessing the project from the drawings provided. There was a brief discussion about whether the changes would be in keeping with the style of the house. Commissioners felt that since this was new construction and at the rear of the house, the changes were appropriate.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the alterations. The motion carried unanimously.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Mayor's Design Awards update

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that there will be 10 recipients for the preservation category. Planning Director Vanessa Koster added that there were about 15 to 20 other recipients for the Mayor's Design Awards. In answer to a question by Pat Balon, staff indicated that cream bricks will be given to the preservation award recipients.

B. HPC Training May 29 and May 30, 2009 in Madison

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that registration was closed for the training but that commissioners could call Madison if they were still interested in attending.

C. Staff updates on preservation projects.

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the Weinstock house would be on next month's agenda for consideration of permanent designation. A new interim petition for the Hide House will be on the agenda as well. A new hotel proposal for Downer Avenue might be scheduled and there might be a streetscape plan for Downer Avenue as well.

Staff Paul Jakubovich reported that the Lion Bridge restoration in Lake Park was on track for completion in early fall. The County is working on funding for the north Lion Bridge. The County might be bringing in an application for a dog exercise area at Lake Park south of the water purification works. They have indicated their interest in a chain link fence which is not appropriate. It would be the only dog exercise area in a county park within the city limits.

Pat Balon asked whether or not the gardens being planted in Kilbourn Reservoir Park were under the purview of the commission. Mr. Jakubovich replied that they would be and that he would check into this.

Matt Jarosz expressed concern over the documentation of four buildings by the Historic American Building Survey at the VA grounds. He hoped it was not mitigation for upcoming demolition. Staff did not have any information on this matter.

9. ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Pat Balon announced that the annual Reclaiming Our Heritage would be taking place on the VA grounds on May 30th and 31st. She will be a docent at the Ward Theater.

B. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, June 15, 2009, at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells

10. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned.



Living with History

MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

Monday, July 20, 2009, 3:00 PM

Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Matt Jarosz, Chair

Sandra McSweeney, Vice Chair

Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,

Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 3:08 PM.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Matt Jarosz, Sandra McSweeney, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners Excused: Randy Bryant

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

Approval of the June 15, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the June 15, 2009 minutes. Sandra McSweeney made a friendly amendment to add in the discussion of paving the east-west sections in the Downer Avenue paving summary. The motion carried unanimously.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Reconvene Public Hearing on the Interim Historic Designation Application of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih) (6th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a brief review of the criteria for interim designation and swore in those who intended to testify.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to reconvene the public hearing. The motion carried unanimously.

Matt Jarosz recognized David Florsheim. Mr. Florsheim did not have any plans or drawings as requested by the commissioners at the last meeting.

Mr. Florsheim summarized the nomination process and that there was no intent to preserve the building at first. There had been other issues that resulted in the earlier petition for interim designation. The dispute was settled and that request for designation had been withdrawn. He felt that designation right now could hamper or impact their working on a development plan. There was a questions of paying for more renderings and having extra reviews. Right now they want to fully develop the building.

Pat Balon asked if the Gipfel Brewery Building was still part of the development plan. Mr. Florsheim replied that it was going to be part of the first development plan they had. Then there was a new plan that removed all of the old buildings. That plan fell through. He did not know if the timing would line up to incorporate the Gipfel into the development. They were looking for a location for the Gipfel, both private and public land, and not having a lot of luck. There was no anchor tenant. Some people have expressed interest but others have not.

There were no other persons interested in testifying.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

Matt Jarosz asked staff if the developer had submitted any drawings/proposals for the Senn Building. Staff replied that nothing had been submitted.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to grant interim designation to the Senn Building. Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Sandra McSweeney and Ald. Bauman voted in favor. Pat Balon and Sandy Ackerman were opposed. The motion carried.

B. Public Hearing on the petition for Interim Historic Designation for the St. Marcus Rectory/Mathis House, 212 East North Avenue (6th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala presented the staff report and said the building appeared to meet criteria e-5, e-6 and e-9 of the ordinance.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried unanimously.

Staff Carlen Hatala swore in those wishing to testify.

The nominator LuAnn Paul was recognized. She testified that she had noticed a raze order on the house about five weeks earlier and had called the alderman's office and checked with the Historic Preservation section. The raze order is now on hold. About two weeks ago the boards were off the house and someone who identified themselves as a trustee was on the premises. Ms. Paul talked to this person who said it was the first time in seven years that they had been in the house. Ms. Paul was able to view the entry hall which had leaded glass, beautiful woodwork, ornamental plasterwork and a tile floor. The entry door itself is round and has sidelights. There are also four arched windows at the front. Windows throughout the house are leaded glass.

There was no other person wanting to testify.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

Commissioners thought the house merited designation.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to grant interim designation based on the criteria in the staff report. The motion carried unanimously.

Ron Robert from the department of Neighborhood Services stated that he hoped this interim designation would give impetus to the family to probate the estate and do something with the house.

5. OLD BUSINESS

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of Buildings 5, 6, 7, 8, and 11 at the Hide House, 2625 S. Greeley Street. (14th Ald. District)

Chair Matt Jarosz asked staff about procedure. Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the interim designation granted at the last HPC meeting was being appealed by the owner/developer. The appeal was scheduled before the Zoning, Neighborhoods and Development Committee of the

Common Council on July 23, 2009. Matt Jarosz stated that the interim designation could be voided out so the review of the request for demolition seemed out of place.

Ald. Bauman recommended adjourning the owner/developer's request until after the Common Council made their determination on the appeal.

Pat Balon concurred stating that there had not been a situation like this before in her 15 years on the commission. She thought it could set a bad precedent.

The other commissioners concurred that adjourning would be the best course of action.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Ald Bauman seconded a motion to adjourn the request for demolition until the Common Council resolved the appeal. The motion carried unanimously.

Planning manager Vanessa Koster asked the commissioner to hear the applicant's opinion.

City Attorney Gregg Hagopian addressed the commission. He said the HPC was working under the premise that the Common Council could reverse the interim designation and that taking up the demolition request at HPC today was a waste of time. He stated that the Common Council might not reverse the interim. He said the HPC should err on the side of caution. Ald. Bauman asked if the HPC could legally be prohibited from adjourning the item today. Mr. Hagopian said the HPC could do as it sees fit but that actions have consequences. Ald. Bauman stated it was inconsistent to be appealing the interim designation while at the same time applying for permission to demolish. That implied the interim was valid.

Bruce Block, attorney for the owner/developer was recognized. He objected to Ald. Bauman's comments and said it was appropriate for the HPC to review the demolition request since there were time constraints on the project.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for the partial demolition of Building 7 and the demolition of the loading dock on the east side of Building 11 at the Hide House, 2625 S. Greeley Street. (14th Ald. District)

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and pat Balon seconded a motion to adjourn this item until the Common Council makes their ruling on the appeal. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a green roof and installation of a photovoltaic system on the rear rooftop of the Milwaukee Central Library, 814 W. Wisconsin Avenue. (4th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave an overview of the proposal to install a green roof with pathways and a photovoltaic system on the rear rooftop of Milwaukee Central Library.

Heather Cook Elliott from HGA was recognized. She explained that the photovoltaic arrays stood about 18 inches above the parapet but they were 7 feet in from the parapet so would not be visible. She had handouts for the commission (on file).

In response to a question from Pat Balon, Ms. Elliott indicated that the rooftop would be closed to the general public but that school children will be taken up with supervision.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the project. The motion carried unanimously.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT

Bruce Block, attorney with Reinhart Boerner, was recognized. He wanted to formally object to the commission's decision to adjourn the request for demolition of portions of the Hide House. He said there is no mention of sequential order in the ordinance and that they were respectful of procedures by applying for the COA to demolish. The project has been in the works for two years and this is creating a hardship for the client. The portions that are proposed for demolition are in very bad shape. The loading dock is an attractive nuisance. This is not subjective analysis. They have experts to testify.

Ald. Zielinski was recognized. He stated that that his constituents understand the time sensitivity of the matter. He did not want to have the matter gone over again today only to find out the council will overturn the designation.

Chair Matt Jarosz indicated that the owner's appeal in essence froze the designation. Had they not appealed, the HPC would be considering their request for a COA. In the past the HPC has called special meetings to accommodate time sensitive and big projects. The commissioners were all in agreement for calling a special meeting. The HPC did not intend to hinder or obstruct the process.

HP staff was asked to set a date for the special HPC meeting as soon after the Common Council meeting as possible. Should the Common Council reverse the interim, then the developer can proceed and the special meeting will be cancelled.

8. OTHER BUSINESS

Report on HPC training by Pat Balon and Randy Bryant

Pat Balon reported that the trainers were from out of state and had good insight on how commissions functioned. One of the workshops was on legal issues. Randy Bryant could address the commission more on that at the next meeting. It was valuable hearing from other commissions who have to function without staff support.

Carlen Hatala indicated that a binder was presented as part of the training and that commissioners can come and look through it when they wanted. There was a lot of helpful information.

Staff updates on preservation projects.

Carlen Hatala reported that staff Paul Jakubovich was out on medical leave. She asked commissioners to assist with reviews of the bigger projects during Paul's absence.

Matt Jarosz indicated that there would likely be a proposal coming to the commission for a stage in Lake Park. It is being paid for by a donation. There was a similar stage in the past.

Matt Jarosz announced that he would be leaving with students to go to Japan on August 4th and would not be here for the August HPC meeting. Sandra McSweeney will be acting chair.

Sandra Mcsweeney stated that DCD should be more sensitive to neighborhoods when reviewing new projects like the Hide House. She would not have picked that project. Vanessa Koster replied that the new development was permitted so the city had no purview.

Sandra McSweeney asked that item 7 PUBLIC COMMENT be clarified with a phrase "at the call of the chair." City Attorney Gregg Hagopian commented that the HPC has to be careful of open meetings law and deviating from the agenda.

9. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandy Ackerman moved and Sandra McSweeney seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 4: 35 PM.



Living with History

MINUTES

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING

Monday, August 17, 2009, 3:00 PM

Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Matt Jarosz, Chair
Sandra McSweeney, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

1. ROLL CALL

Vice Chair Sandra McSweeney called the meeting to order at 3:00 P.M.
Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown
Commissioners Excused: Matt Jarosz
Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

Approval of the July 20, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes from the July 20, 2009 meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness for the relocation of the masonry gatehouse/guardhouse that once stood at the top of the reservoir at Kilbourn/Reservoir Park, 626 E. North Avenue and 701 E. Garfield (Kilbourn/Reservoir Park Historic District) (6th and 3rd Ald. Districts)

Staff Carlen Hatala summarized the proposal for setting the building down on a concrete slab and cleaning the brick. The building is a contributing feature to the historic district.

Water Department commissioner Carrie Lewis and Ald. Nic Kovac were recognized. Ms. Lewis explained that they had been unable to come up with a new use for the gatehouse. There had been discussions with neighbors, surveys and other persons. The building was a target for graffiti when it stood at the top of the reservoir. Although officials were tempted to get rid of the building, the residents were evenly divided between keeping and getting rid of the building so it was decided to keep the building. Since the park has been redeveloped, there is a lot of activity and the neighborhood is keeping an eye on it.

In answer to questions by the commissioners Ms. Lewis indicated that the building has no lighting, the park closes at 10 PM and that lights along all the paths are turned off at that time. The baseball diamond needs refurbishing and maybe after that is done there will be landscaping at the gatehouse. A location closer to the street where the gatehouse would be more visible wasn't planned for as they had assumed the building would be demolished.

There are no security cameras on the building. Commissioners suggested that a motion detector light be installed and Carrie Lewis said they would consider it.

Resident Christine Prevetti was recognized. She had concerns that the building was a magnet for graffiti and drug dealing. She wanted better maintenance at the park. She suggested that the building could be a soccer warming house or have some use.

Ald. Bauman suggested moving the building to a DPW storage site until another location could be found or it could be sold to the public. Staff indicated that the building was a contributing feature of the historic district and should remain with the park. It was the original building associated with the reservoir.

Carrie Lewis said that given the wishes of the neighbors, they would see how things worked out and try this for two years. If there were continued problems, the Water Department would come back to the commission for permission to demolish the building.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as per staff report. The motion carried unanimously.

Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement windows at 2600-2602 E. Bradford Avenue (North Point North Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a summary of the project.

Commissioners concluded that one-over-one sash windows flanking the center picture window were more appropriate for the duplex and matched the rest of the windows on the house unlike the single paned casements the owner suggested.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve one-over-one sash windows flanking the center picture window, that they be all wood construction, and that the low-e glass be clear and non-tinted. The motion carried unanimously.

Modification to previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness for retaining wall at 1701 N. Humboldt Avenue. New materials proposed. (Coin Appliances) (Brady Street Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala summarized the project. The owner wanted to change the materials to Keystone block and lengthen the retaining wall.

Architect Russ LaFrambois and the owner Eric Levendusky were recognized. Mr. LaFrambois indicated that Paul Jakubovich had issued a staff COA for a new retaining wall to be constructed of poured concrete walls, stamped with a stone pattern, that would be topped by a wood fence. The owner and architect since found out from engineers (Giles) that this would require sheet pilings and a foundation. This could impact the garage at the adjacent property. It already has cracks in its wall. They had explored a number of pre-cast options and techniques. The Keystone product would not require a foundation, just a concrete pad. Geofabric would be laid down into the sloping earth and this would stabilize the earth. Mr. LaFrambois said this product had been used in other applications such as at

the lakefront with the Mandel Lake Bluff Apartments (now condos). He said the block wall there was nearly vertical.

Mr. Levendusky showed photos of a retaining wall around a parking pad at a building on the south side of Brady Street. It was built of interlocking blocks. Staff reported that the work had been done without a COA.

Commissioners discussed the ability of the Keystone product to stand up without a foundation. They suggested that the retaining wall could be moved in away from the slope a bit more in order to install the necessary pilings without damage to the neighbor's garage. Mr. LaFrambois said it would take space away from the parking lot. The commissioners also discussed the merits of its appearance, color and how appropriate it was for historic districts and how publically visible this site was. The commission had not approved this product before because of its uniform, manmade, suburban appearance and that they had to be consistent in their decisions.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to deny the request for a Certificate of appropriateness for the use of Keystone block for the retaining wall. The motion carried unanimously.

Commissioners urged the applicant to keep exploring other options. Ald. Bauman said they would have the right to appeal the denial and go to the Common Council to plead economic hardship grounds. Mr. LaFrambois asked if the owner could replace the existing timbers in the retaining wall with new timbers and the commissioners answered yes.

6. NEW BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness for removal and rebuilding of front terrace; repointing of brick and stone at house, garage and four chimneys and treatment of spalled stone at 2433 N. Wahl Avenue. (North Point North Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala reviewed the project. She indicated that before the meeting, the owner had contacted her to indicate that the work done might not be as extensive as first proposed.

Commissioners wanted drawings of the terrace before it was removed. They also wanted to make sure the mortar and details would be monitored by staff.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the project per staff report and add that landscaping should be returned to the front of the house and add that the slate cannot be removed from the house but be maintained. The motion carried unanimously.

Certificate of Appropriateness for repair and replacement of the cornice at 735 N. Water Street (First National/First Wisconsin National Bank Building) (4th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala summarized the project. The condition of the cornice and fear of its removal were the factors leading to the historic designation of the building.

Robert Forr from Spray-O-Bond was recognized. The company has worked on 466 jobs on historic buildings over the last 16 years. Terra cotta restoration was their specialty. Mr. Forr said he had been unaware of the COA process. He then presented detailed images of the cornice that documented its damage, removal and repair, including reproduction of some of the terra cotta elements.

In answer to questions by the commissioners, Mr. Forr indicated that the cause of the cornice failure was due to poor anchors, weak joints and flashings, inappropriate mortar, and inappropriate repairs. When asked about the difference between real terra cotta and substitutes like GFRC, a cement based material, he said he was finding a lot of failure around the country with the use of GFRC and when inserted between real terra cotta, it affects those pieces and is not compatible. It is cheaper but is a temporary fix for only 5 to 10 years.

Mr. Forr concluded by reporting that the nets were coming down and the project was near completion.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the cornice repair and replacement at 735 N. Water Street. The motion carried unanimously.

Certificate of Appropriateness for recladding frame building with fiber cement board at 912-914 N. 28th Street. (Concordia Historic District) (4th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that the work was in progress when it was called to the attention of historic preservation staff. The owner had not applied for a COA to change material on his building. The use of fiber cement material for cladding a historic building had not been allowed by the commission before and the commission had denied use of this product at the June meeting. The applicant had applied for a COA in 2000 for porch work and was aware he was in a historic district.

The owner was not present at the meeting. Ald. Bauman advocated for the applicant stating that this duplex was in a marginal location in the Concordia Historic District and adjacent to an alley in which there was a lot of crime. He said the building had been a mess when the owner purchased it and the owner was making improvements. He said the owner was doing the best he could and was working with DNS to correct citations and because of that had mistakenly thought that he did not need to contact historic preservation staff.

Commissioners agreed that the owner could not plead ignorance of the requirements. They also agreed that they could not make exceptions. They could not deny this product at one meeting and allow the next. Almost everyone coming before the commission pleads hardship. The commission cannot be arbitrary and capricious. They asked if there was a way to mitigate the hardship, for example, by using tax credits. Staff added that DNS orders typically have verbiage about seeing the historic preservation section if they are in a historic district before starting to correct violations.

Bruce Marn was recognized. He reported that he was an old friend of the owners and that his friend's heart was in the right place. The owner was doing all the work himself and had purchased enough material to complete the south and a part of the north elevations.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to deny the use of fiber cement material for the exterior cladding. The commission asked that DNS allow more time for the repairs to be completed. The motion carried with Ald. Bauman in opposition.

Ald. Bauman indicated that the applicant could appeal and the Common Council could consider hardship.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT

The public will be allowed to comment on any of the above-listed agenda items, as the items are discussed, at the call of the chair.

8. OTHER BUSINESS

A) Update on 2604 N. Lake Drive

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that there had been calls and e-mails to the office about the project. The COA was now posted on line. It is thought that the front will be repaired to original condition once the brick arrives at the job site.

B) Randy Bryant asked if staff knew about a raze order on a property on N. 13th Street. Staff was not aware. Gail Fitch, in the audience, had been following the status of the Italianate style house, but had no new information to share.

9. ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, September 21, 2009 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells

B. Statewide historic preservation conference, Wausau, Wisconsin October 9-10, 2009

10. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandy Ackerman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting concluded at 5:10 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES

**CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, September 21, 2009, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall**

**Matt Jarosz, Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown**

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 3 PM.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman, Randy Bryant, Matt Jarosz, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown,

Note: Sandra McSweeney's term expired September 15, 2009. She was not reappointed.

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala, Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

A. Approval of the August 17, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes from the August 17, 2009 meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Public Hearing for the permanent historic designation of the Nicholas Senn Building 300-318 W. Juneau Avenue (Commonly called Sydney Hih) (6th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala reviewed the possible criteria for permanent designation.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

Staff swore in those wanting to testify.

Dawn McCarthy was recognized. She spoke in favor of permanent designation on behalf of the Milwaukee Preservation Alliance. She referred to the letter submitted at the previous hearing.

Staff Carlen Hatala indicated that the nominator was out of town so was not present to testify.

There were no other persons who wanted to testify.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

The commissioners were in agreement on the criteria for designation.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to recommend permanent designation based on the three criteria in the staff report, e-1, e-3 and e-9. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Public hearing for the permanent historic designation of the St. Marcus Parsonage / Mathis House at 212 East North Avenue (6th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a brief overview of the potential criteria for designation.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

There was no one present to testify.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

The commissioners were in agreement on the criteria for designation.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to recommend permanent designation based on the three criteria in the study report, e-5, e-6 and e-9. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Public Hearing on the petition for Interim Historic Designation for the Schlitz Tavern/ Coventry Inn/Benjamin Briggs Tavern at 2501 W. Greenfield Avenue. (6th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a summary of the history of the building and the potential criteria for interim designation.

THE MOTION: Ann Pieper Eisenbrown moved and Randy Bryant seconded a motion to open the public hearing. The motion carried.

Staff Carlen Hatala swore in those wishing to testify.

Raul Varela, the new owner, was recognized. He stated he had purchased the building in early 2009 and that it had been empty for awhile. The former owner moved to a location downtown. The interior was very nice with leaded glass and wood floors. He was doing as much as he could to keep it original. He was honored to get designation.

Ald. Robert Donovan was recognized. He indicated that he was pleased to nominate the building through his staff assistant. He had spent a fair amount of time in the building and appreciated its beauty and history. He commended the new owner on taking care of the building. The alderman urged the commissioners to stop in. He said he hoped designation gave the owner an opportunity for financial assistance to help maintain the building.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to close the public hearing. The motion carried.

Staff was asked to explain the process for designation and eligibility for tax credits.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Ald. Bauman seconded a motion to grant interim designation based on criteria e-1 and e-5 of the ordinance. The motion carried unanimously.

Ann Pieper Eisenbrown asked whether the preservation guidelines applied to the original building or the building as it looked now. Staff answered that the guidelines apply to the current appearance of the building.

5. **OLD BUSINESS**

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for revision to previously approved parking lot for Glorioso's at 922-924 E. Brady Street (Brady Street Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff gave a brief explanation of the proposed changes to the parking lot.

The chair recognized owner Michael Glorioso and architect Jose Dominguez.

In answer to questions from the commissioners, Jose Dominguez indicated that the fencing will consist of aluminum pickets. The lot might be upgraded with masonry piers in the future but the owner did not know.

Staff referred the commissioners to a copy of a letter from the Brady Street BID that supported the changes.

There was discussion about whether or not the shrubs should be in front of or behind the fencing. BOZA had approved the shrubs being planted behind the fence; something the owner thought would lessen the vandalism to the plants. There is a lot of vandalism to the street planters at present. The commissioners wanted to see the plantings in front of the fence. It was suggested to use larger, mature plants or even use vines. Michael Glorioso was agreeable to the change.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the revisions to the original Certificate of Appropriateness with the shrubs to be located in front of the fencing. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for revision to previously approved streetscape improvements for the 2500 and 2600 Blocks N. Downer Avenue (Downer Avenue Commercial Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala reviewed the proposed changes to the Downer Avenue streetscaping.

Architect Grant Reginato was recognized. He reported that the substrate below the current paver areas varied in depth and the cost of making that substrate uniform would necessitate using half bricks since the bids had come in over budget. In a recent development, Mr. Reginato said that funding sources had been found to allow work on the substrate so that the paver bricks will be full size bricks as originally proposed. He showed the commissioners samples of the brick and the quarry tile for the entry areas. The number of trash receptacles was being reduced as well as the number of trees.

Ald. Bauman asked whether or not DPW had informed the architect about using salvaged city pavers. There were thousands of the granite pavers available. They might be cheaper than the brick proposed or even free. Mr. Reginato was unaware of the pavers. Ald. Bauman acknowledged that he did not want to hinder the project because a change of pavers could result in another long cycle of reviews. He would support the brick proposed.

THE MOTION: Alderman Bauman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the proposed changes. Should the architect and Brady Street merchants choose the granite pavers instead, this change would be handled through HPC staff and did not have to return to the commission. The motion carried

5. **NEW BUSINESS**

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for a front landscape retaining wall at 2037 N. 1st Street (Brewers Hill Historic District) (6th Ald. District)

Staff gave a brief overview of the project. Staff Paul Jakubovich, before he was ill, had informed the owner that the front retaining wall was not appropriate and he would not approve it. Staff Carlen Hatala also informed the owner of this and the owner has expressed his wish to go before the commission. Before the meeting, the owner went ahead and had the retaining wall installed.

Owner Randy Goll was recognized. When asked why he installed the wall before the commission reviewed his request for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the owner said there were "over 50" such walls in Brewers Hill. He wanted the commission to see his vision and the scheduling worked for his contractor. He said he was his own contractor and that Hickory Landscaping was the sub-contractor. He has 100 feet of frontage, three city lots. The wall is 22 inches high on the plans.

Chair Matt Jarosz said the owner's action put the commission in a bad position.

The commissioners indicated that the retaining wall was inappropriate for the urban setting, and it diminished the work he had done on the house.

Ald. Bauman indicated he did not like to see berms destroyed and that fine plantings in an urban neighborhood tend to accumulate trash and litter and commented that people get into the flowers. Grass is better; nothing can hurt it.

Matt Jarosz suggested two alternatives. One, deny the wall and the owner could appeal to the Common Council's ZND committee. Two, the owner could work with staff to modify the wall, remove its curvature. Randy Bryant said a third option was to not consider this a retaining wall but have more extensive landscaping to cover/screen it. The owner said he did not want to see the wall and it was the landscape designer who came up with the wall.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to deny the wall but approve the rest of the landscaping. The motion carried unanimously.

Matt Jarosz reminded the owner that he could appeal the denial or mitigate the wall. Randy Bryant added that the owner could continue with the other great work he was doing with the property.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for a handicap ramp at 3020 W. McKinley Boulevard (Cold Spring Park Historic District) (4th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala gave a summary of the project and how the decision was made to place the ramp at the east side of the house.

The owner Mattie Echols and the builder Jodell Meyer were recognized.

Chair Matt Jarosz said the project was reversible, the owner and builder had done a good job keeping the ramp from touching the wall of the house, and the design was simple but well done. The commissioners agreed.

THE MOTION: Ald. Bauman moved and Randy Bryant seconded a motion to approve the project. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of asphalt siding and wood siding and the installation of fiber cement siding at 713 E. Brady Street. (Brady Street Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala reviewed the proposal and recommended denial. The commission had been consistent in denying cement fiber cladding in the past.

Mary Colla, daughter of the owner, was recognized. She had hand-outs about Hardie Plank for each of the commissioners.

Matt Jarosz explained about the availability of tax credits. He also said that if the owner could not bring back the building, it could be left alone.

Pat Balon thanked Ms. Colla for the handout. She said that it showed that the fiber cement cladding was mostly used in new construction. She cautioned Ms. Colla that the manufacturer was trying to sell a product so promoted its benefits.

Ald. Bauman asked Ms. Colla how she knew she would have to replace all the siding on the house. The original siding could be fine. She could be spending more money than she had to.

Ms. Colla said that when she had the soffits power washed there was a lot to repair. Commissioners responded that power washing causes a lot of damage and would damage even good wood.

Matt Jarosz suggested the removal of only a little portion off the back where it wouldn't show to evaluate the condition of the wood under the asphalt siding. Alderman Bauman said real pine clapboards were better than Hardie Plank. The commissioners added that Hardie Plank cannot be installed over existing wood siding. The owner will have spent more money than they had to and the results would be disappointing. The contractor's quote of \$7,000 for the removal of the asphalt siding and the installation of fiber cement cladding was somewhat suspect.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to deny the installation of fiber cement cladding. The motion carried unanimously.

Commissioners encouraged the owner to work with staff to find better ways to enhance the property. It would be a great gift to her mother to return the house to original appearance. In the Concordia Historic District they have had siding removal parties to take off the substitute siding.

Ms. Colla asked if a letter of support from the Brady Street Association would mean anything. Matt Jarosz said it wouldn't apply in this situation because the material did not meet guidelines.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT

At the call of the chair, the public will be allowed to comment on any of the above-listed agenda items as they are being discussed.

8. OTHER BUSINESS

Matt Jarosz reported that Tom Hubka from UWM would like to do a presentation to the commission about Milwaukee's vernacular architecture that his students have been researching.

9. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, October 19, 2009 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells

9. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to adjourn. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 5 PM.



Living with History

**MINUTES SPECIAL MEETING
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Wednesday, October 7, 2009, 1:30 PM
MacLaren House/UWM Alumni House 3230 E. Kenwood Boulevard**

**Matt Jarosz Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown**

1. Roll call

Chair Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 1:42 P.M.

Commission members present: Sandy Ackerman, Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Matt Jarosz

Commissioners Absent: Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman

Staff Present: Carlen Hatala

Others Present: Dan Stephans, Vince Milewski, Matt Millen, John Millen, Dan Walker

2. Certificate of Appropriateness Application for the removal of the original slate roof and installation of a new slate roof at the MacLaren House (UWM Alumni House) at 3230 E. Kenwood Boulevard. (MacLaren House historic site) (3rd Ald. District)

Dan Stephans, Historic Preservation Officer for the State DOA, explained how the commission's directive to check out the condition of the slate and its origins led to extensive research and investigation of the original slate roof on the MacLaren House/UWM Alumni House

Matt Millen, slate roof specialist, explained that the roof consisted of self weathering slate from Vermont. He identified this as Vermont slate because of the gray/black lines at the back. Foreign slate is different. He pointed out different sections of the MacLaren roof where the color was different due to weathering, to coal and sulphur deposits and oxidation from sun exposure. The roof is failing because it used the more colorful slate at the top of the quarry when the house was built. This slate was promoted as giving buildings instant antiquity and was more costly at the time due to the hand work involved but it proved to be not as strong as slate from deeper in the quarry. Today's standards are better and quarrying is more mechanized. Vince Milewski added that he checked out slate at the various quarries in Scotland and England during a trip there. Their product did not match the MacLaren House slate.

When asked if slate could be salvaged from the roof in the installation of a new roof, Matt Millen said that a high percentage was delaminating and he demonstrated by hitting a slate with a roofing hammer. A new slate roof should last 200 years. The current slate will continue to deteriorate rapidly. None of it was recommended for use as roofing material.

When asked if the new slate will have brown and orange colors in it, Matt Millen pointed out some samples he brought. The green slates were already starting to turn color at the storage yard and he was confident the slate will start showing the browns and tans within five years. Not all slates will change at the same rate. The colors for the replacement roof will be sea greens, strata gray, black and Vermont gray. The self weathering slate will turn color over time. There are 30 sections to the roof and each had a different blend of slate and each section was laid differently. Millen will be identifying the lengths, thicknesses, colors and how the slate was laid for each of the 30 sections. This will be mapped so the new roof will look similar.

There was some concern about future deterioration of the new roof and a question was asked if any problems were found. Matt Millen and Vince Milewski answered that there will be a new underlayment (plywood decking on top of a bituminous membrane on top of the original concrete deck) and the built in gutters will be looked at. They are causing problems today. The current ASTM standards insure slates with higher strength so the replacement roof should last longer.

Commissioners thanked Millen for preparing a mock-up of the new roof materials and the detailed explanation about the condition and history of the slate.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to accept the findings as presented and allow Vermont slate to be installed for the new roof. The new slate will match the size, color, thickness, pattern and texture of the original. Any anomalies will be re-created. A copy of the specifications is to be sent to historic preservation staff before the work is sent out for bids. The motion carried unanimously.

3. Adjournment

THE MOTION: There being no further business, Sandy Ackerman moved and Randy Bryant seconded a motion to adjourn the special meeting. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 2:15 P.M.



Living with History

MINUTES AS CORRECTED
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, October 19, 2009, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Matt Jarosz, Chair

**Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman,
Randy Bryant, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown**

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 3:01 PM.

Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Matt Jarosz, Allyson Nemec, Ann Pieper Eisenbrown

Commissioners Excused: Randy Bryant

Commissioners Absent: Ald. Robert Bauman

Staff present: Carlen Hatala, Martha Brown

Introduction of new commissioner Allyson Nemec.

Matt Jarosz welcomed new commissioner Allyson Nemec to her first meeting.

2. MINUTES

Approval of the September 21, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the minutes of September 21, 2009. The motion carried with Allyson Nemec abstaining as she had not been present.

Approval of the October 7, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Special Meeting Minutes

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the minutes of the Special Meeting of October 7, 2009. The motion carried with Pat Balon and Allyson Nemec abstaining as they had not been present at the meeting.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

None

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a garage at 216 W. Reservoir Avenue (Brewers Hill Historic District) (6th Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala showed images of the garage and explained why the owner wanted to demolish the structure. A new garage will be built in the future.

There were no questions from the commissioners and Pat Balon said the matter was pretty straight forward.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Ann Pieper Eisenbrown seconded a motion to approve the request for demolition based on the criteria stated in the staff report. The motion carried.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness to remove side porch and rebuild smaller porch at 1208 E. Locust Street (Whitnall House historic site) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala showed images of the side porch which dated to the late 19th century per fire insurance maps and forensic evidence. The porch was in deteriorated condition and had been removed by the owner without a COA.

The owner was not present at the meeting.

Commissioners discussed the visibility of the porch from the street and the problems with ice dams. The owner had commented to staff that ice dams were a chronic problem. Matt Jarosz and Allyson Nemec said inside corners like this one need to be maintained and free from leaves and have the proper pitch on the gutters to avoid perpetual problems. Flat roofs presented more of a problem.

The commissioners also discussed the owner's request to build a smaller porch. They mentioned it would be hard to match the pitch of the front roof and clear the two windows as well as the door. A new smaller porch would also leave the old nailer strip exposed. Rebuilding the porch in its original size might be easier.

The commissioners left both options open for the owner but wanted to see measured architectural drawings.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to hold over the matter until next month's meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new building at 1239 E. Brady Street (Brady Street Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala presented a summary showing the original building on the site and the proposal submitted by the owner.

Matt Jarosz explained to the commission that there had been a meeting with the applicant, staff and himself to go over the plan. The earlier submittal was more extravagant and had a tower. This proposal was more in keeping with the character of Brady Street. It is an important and visible corner.

Contractor Deb Lindner and architect Rich Beisser were recognized.

Commissioners recommended some changes to improve the design. Since the building will be constructed at grade to meet ADA requirements, they will need to add a water table so that it has the appearance of a base. The east gable should have some detail, like a window, so that it is not blank and not look like a remodel. Other details, like the door designs, still have to be worked out. For handicap accessibility it might be better if the corner entrance is brought out rather than be recessed.

Ms. Lindner brought samples of the cedar shingles and fascia and clapboards.

THE MOTION: Allyson Nemece moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the new building contingent on having the details worked out with staff and a subcommittee of the commission. The motion carried unanimously.

Matt Jarosz and Allyson Nemece volunteered to serve as the sub committee.

D. Certificate of Appropriateness for a new garden shed at 2642 N. Summit Avenue (North Point North Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

Staff Carlen Hatala showed images of the project. She indicated that staff thought the building and location were appropriate but the cladding materials were not.

Neither the owner nor the contractor was present at the meeting.

Pat Balon thought that since the garden shed was so close to the adjacent property, it had a tremendous impact on the neighbor and the neighborhood as a whole. She wanted to see better drawings of the project.

Ann Pieper said she could not approve the project.

Matt Jarosz asked staff whether or not there was precedent for wood garden sheds and Ms. Hatala answered that garden sheds historically did not match the main house most of the time and many were built of wood.

Allyson Nemece said she was not opposed to real brick being used. She did not like the appearance of the fiber cement product.

Commissioners did not want to approve the fiber cement product as they have not done so before and this would set a precedent. The location of the garden shed was satisfactory as long as it met the setback requirements.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to deny the project and recommend that the owner work with staff for direction. The motion carried unanimously.

7. PUBLIC COMMENT

At the call of the chair, the public will be allowed to comment on any of the above-listed agenda items as they are being discussed.

8. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Election of Vice-Chair for remainder of year

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to elect Ann Pieper Eisenbrown as vice-chair to fill the position left vacant by Sandra McSweeney. The motion carried unanimously.

B. Thank Sandra McSweeney for her service to the commission from 1996 through 2009

Matt Jarosz thanked Sandra McSweeney for her thirteen years on the commission. She made an excellent contribution to the commission's discussion of projects and was attentive to all projects big and small. She was very committed to historic preservation.

Pat Balon added that Sandra McSweeney knew how to zero in on problematic issues.

Martha Brown suggested that staff draft a letter to Sandra on behalf of the commission.

C. Staff updates on preservation projects.

Staff Carlen Hatala reported that she had just attended the National Historic Preservation Conference, sponsored by the National Trust for Historic Preservation. It was very informative and she took many photos.

Matt Jarosz mentioned that H. Russell Zimmermann would be submitting sign designs for the Adler Mansion.

Matt Jarosz mentioned that his preservation studio students were working on an adaptive reuse project for the Schlitz Brewhouse. He said the copper kettles were now gone from the building.

Pat Balon reported that she had attended the state conference on local history and historic preservation and that it was very informative. The Pabst Theater was mentioned in a talk about opera houses by Jim Draeger. She encouraged commissioners to attend next year.

Martha Brown reported that the National Trust Council met in Milwaukee a few weeks ago and she spoke to the group on behalf of the Mayor.

9. ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, November 16, 2009 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells

10. ADJOURNMENT

THE MOTION: There being no further business Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously and the meeting adjourned at 4:20 PM.



Living with History

MINUTES DRAFT

CITY OF MILWAUKEE

HISTORIC PRESERVATION SUB-COMMITTEE MEETING

Wednesday, November 4, 2009 10:00AM

809 N. Broadway, Room 105, Historic Preservation Office

Matt Jarosz, Chair
Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman
Randy Bryant, Allyson Nemec

1. Call to Order
Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 10:05 AM.
Commissioners Present: Matt Jarosz, Allyson Nemec (the subcommittee)
Staff Present: Carlen Hatala
2. Review of construction details for the proposed new building at 1239 E. Brady Street (Brady Street Historic District). The Historic Preservation Commission approved the project in concept at its October 19, 2009 meeting and empowered the sub-committee (Matt Jarosz and Allyson Nemec) to review and approve details before a Certificate of Appropriateness is issued. (3rd Ald. District)

Deb Lindner was present representing the owner.

The rear of the building (south) has no openings at present but Ms. Lindner indicated that it is intended that a door and a deck are planned for the future.

The attic has trusses and no usable space.

The gable on the east elevation will need to have some kind of window or vent and have some decorative shingles as on the front gable.

The upper front recessed porch has a post lined up with the access door. The recommendation is to remove the post or move the door.

The transom over the second story access door at the front façade should only be as wide as the door and not as wide as the storefront transoms.

The storefront should be set back at least six inches from the framing. The glass and the glazing bars and framing are not to be all in the same plane. More detail is needed about the surfaces. The bulkhead panels will be recessed. The bottoms of the framing posts will be moved u to line up with the bulkheads. Commissioners thought a section drawing would be helpful.

Cedar shingles and clapboards will be painted with an opaque stain and not just a clear finish.

Window frames will be 4 inches wide. Corner boards will be 6 inches wide. The exposure for the clapboards will be 6 inches.

Storm doors will be chosen later. A selection of appropriate door styles was chosen from which the owner can pick.

Drawings submitted by the applicant were annotated with the above information.

Allyson Nemec had to leave for another meeting.

The applicant will either submit revised plans or have an addendum listing all of the changes that will be made.

3. Review of proposed changes to the façade at 840 W. Historic Mitchell Street (Mitchell Street Historic District) (12th Ald. District)

Judy Keller from the Mitchell Street association was present as well as the tenant for the building. The tile proposed for the entryways and base of the building was brought in by the applicant and found acceptable.

HPC staff Carlen Hatala showed drawings of the building from the City Records Center. There had been vertical, corrugated, aluminum panels on the building. The applicant was told that skimming the scar on the building with mortar, where the metal panels had been removed without a COA, was not appropriate and would not weather in this climate. The owner asked about installing tile at this location and was told that metal was preferable. Matt Jarosz said he would look into a source for this material.

There was a brief discussion about the awning but the applicant did not bring in drawings of the proposed awning.

The owner was told that HP staff would get back to him about what material should go in where the metal had been removed.

4. Review of proposed changes in materials for a new garden shed at 2642 N. Summit Avenue (North Point North Historic District) (3rd Ald. District)

The owner Sue Medford and her contractor Dave Behringer attended.

The owner was still committed to using fiber cement material because of cost. She rejected suggestions to use clapboards or shingles. The owner and contractor were instructed to get more bids for using real brick for the shed's cladding. Matt Jarosz explained that allowing a fiber cement product would open the doors to using the material on other projects and that it is not appropriate for use with historic buildings.

Matt Jarosz had to leave for another meeting.

Staff reviewed the importance of having wood windows, not vinyl, for the project. The contractor proposed flush doors for the building. Staff indicated that to save costs, good salvage doors and even windows could be found at a fraction of the price. If flush doors were used then moldings could be used to suggest the look of panels. The owner and contractor will obtain more bids for real masonry. They will be scheduled for the November 16th meeting. If they still do not want to pursue alternatives to fiber cement cladding, a decision will be issued that is appealable to the Common Council.

4. Adjourn

The meeting concluded informally as the subcommittee had left before all the items were discussed.



Living with History

AGENDA
CITY OF MILWAUKEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
Monday, November 16, 2009, 3:00 PM
Room 301A, Milwaukee City Hall

Matt Jarosz, Chair
Ann Pieper Eisenbrown, Vice Chair
Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Robert Bauman
Randy Bryant, Allyson Nemeć

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Matt Jarosz called the meeting to order at 3 PM.
Commissioners Present: Sandy Ackerman, Pat Balon, Ald. Bauman, Randy Bryant, Matt Jarosz, Allyson Nemeć
Commissioners Excused: Ann Pieper Eisenbrown
Staff Present: Vanessa Koster

2. MINUTES

A. Approval of the October 19, 2009 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes

Pat Balon pointed out a correction in the minutes, page 3, Other Business. In the motion to elect Ann Pieper Eisenbrown as Vice Chair, it was Sandy Ackerman who seconded the motion.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the October 19, 2009 Minutes with the above correction. The motion carried.

B. Approval of the November 4, 2009 Sub-Committee Meeting Minutes.

Matt Jarosz stated that he and Allyson Nemeć attended the sub-committee meeting. Since Allyson Nemeć was not yet at the meeting, he postponed the approval of the minutes to the end of the meeting.

3. CONSENT AGENDA

None

4. PUBLIC HEARING

None

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness for a new garden shed at 2642 N. Summit Avenue (North Point North Historic District) (3rd Ald. District) PTS # 61771

Vanessa Koster gave the staff report. The recommendation was to approve the project with the condition that the windows are wood and that another cladding material be used rather than the fiber cement product proposed.

Pat Balon added that there were concerns over the fiber cement material and concerns over setting precedent should the fiber cement material be approved.

Randy Bryant asked about the foundation, since the lack of a proper foundation would mean the building would move with the frost. Neither the applicant nor the contractor was present to elaborate.

Allyson Nemeć said the scoring on the fiber cement panels was visible. It was designed to imitate brick.

Matt Jarosz said they had recommended wood siding in the sub-committee meeting as a cost effective alternative to real brick.

Pat Balon said the commissioners did not know about materials; it was a supposition at this point. She also asked how far the shed would be from the lot line.

Randy Bryant asked about the dimensions.

Matt Jarosz indicated that the building was to go on the lot line. Vanessa Koster stated that it looked like the building was 12 feet by 11 feet.

THE MOTION: Sandy Ackerman moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the construction of the garden shed with the condition that it be built of real brick and use wood windows and that staff Carlen Hatala get information about the foundation and approve the materials before a Certificate of Appropriateness is issued. The motion carried.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. Certificate of Appropriateness to remove cream brick party wall on north elevation at the Grand Avenue Club, 210 E. Michigan Street (Bank of Milwaukee/State Bank of Wisconsin Building, East Side Commercial Historic District) (4th Ald. District) PTS # 62329

Vanessa Koster presented the staff report. The condition poses an immediate threat to the building as the wall and chimney may collapse. It meets the criteria for demolition.

The chair recognized Marco Lo Ricco from Graef. He is a structural engineer for the company. He stated that the old party wall was leaning out several inches and could collapse. The Cream City brick removed with the party wall will be used to repair the primary wall. Original windows will now be visible when the party wall and chimney are removed. More party wall remains and is visible from Water Street. They will work on that at a later time.

THE MOTION: Pat Balon moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the removal of the party wall and chimney as shown in the submission packet. The motion carried.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness for a parking pad and deck at 116 E. Vine Street. (Brewers Hill Historic District) (6th Ald. District) PTS# 62368

Vanessa Koster presented the staff report.

The chair recognized the owner Barbara Janczak and her contractor Tom Bialk. Ms. Janczak indicated that she had to park on Vine Street and walk through the icy alley to access her house. This proposal would give her needed parking adjacent to her house. Tom Bialk explained the proposal.

Commissioners asked how much of the modular block retaining wall would be visible and did the modular block hold up the deck above and would the balusters match the turned balusters of the porch.

Tom Bialk explained that not much of the block would be visible due to the skirting, that the deck was supported independently on posts with foundation pads and that there would be turned balusters.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the project. The motion carried.

C. Certificate of Appropriateness for a new garage at 2010 N. 2nd Street. (Brewers Hill Historic District) (6th Ald. District) PTS # 62363

Vanessa Koster gave the staff report.

The chair recognized Brian Hollenbeck, the contractor. There were questions from the commissioners about the style of the garage door, the materials and roof pitch.

Mr. Hollenbeck said he has built four garages in historic districts, including 2665 N. Lake Drive, and has worked closely with staff Paul Jakubovich. Mr. Hollenbeck in fact built the garage next door to 2010 N. 2nd Street and like that building the garage at 2010 N. 2nd Street would have fiber cement clapboards and the same service door and have a steel garage door. It was paneled because staff Carlen Hatala said this was an approximation of an early 20th century garage and would have had paneled doors. The roof pitch on the garage was 8/12 but the house was maybe 10/12 and the porch was between 10-12/12.

Matt Jarosz suggested that the frieze board be moved down and Mr. Hollenbeck agreed.

The commissioners accepted the roof pitch because the garage would have been built at a later time than the house and the porch roof did not match the pitch of the roof for the house. They commended the contractor for working with staff.

THE MOTION: Randy Bryant moved and Pat Balon seconded a motion to approve the project as per staff report with details to be executed in wood. The motion carried.

D. Certificate of Appropriateness after the fact for cladding dormer windows with vinyl siding at 1036 N. Van Buren Street. (Sixth Church of Christ Scientist/Metrobrook Church) (4th Ald. District) PTS # 62362

Vanessa Koster gave the staff report. The church had been working with staff Paul Jakubovich. They applied for some COAs in the past but in this instance had not.

There was no one to represent the church or the contractor.

Commissioners indicated that the vinyl siding really stood out and that it would have been easier to clad the dormers in wood.

THE MOTION: Allyson Nemecek moved and Sandy Ackerman seconded a motion to approve the new shingles for the roof but deny the vinyl cladding for the dormers. The motion carried.

2B. The chair Matt Jarosz returned to the matter of the sub-committee minutes.

THE MOTION: Allyson Nemecek moved and Matt Jarosz seconded a motion to approve the sub-committee minutes from November 4, 2009. The motion carried.

8. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Staff updates.

The staff updates were postponed until a future meeting due to the absence of staff Carlen Hatala

B. Gipfel Brewery

Matt Jarosz asked commissioners if they had comments about the building's demolition. Randy Bryant stated that this was a lesson for the commission, that no buildings be moved until the new site was established. He added that the shame was on the city. The owner was doing what he was told. The Department of Neighborhood Services was working with Historic Preservation on the matter and

it was an egregious misstep for them to issue demolition orders. They should not have done so. Pat Balon added that she had asked for orders to at least tarp the building but nothing was done. Matt Jarosz said since the building was cordoned off there was no urgency to the demolition at this time. He added that staff Carlen Hatala will now have to determine what is the oldest surviving brewery building in the city.

C. Tom Hubka gave his presentation on Milwaukee's vernacular house types identified by building form and floor plan.

9. ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, December 14, 2009 at 3:00 PM, Room 301-A of City Hall, 200 E. Wells

9. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned.